

Opponent's Report on Dissertation Thesis

Institute of Economic Studies, Faculty of Social Sciences, Charles University in Prague
Opletalova 26, 110 00 Praha 1, Czech Republic
Phone: +420 222 112 330, Fax: +420 222 112 304

Author:	Tomáš Havránek
Advisor:	doc. Roman Horváth Ph.D.
Title of the Thesis:	Meta-Analysis in International Economics
Type of Defense:	DEFENSE
Date of Pre-Defense:	April 18, 2013
Opponent:	PhDr. Pavel Vacek, Ph.D.

Address the following questions in your report, please:

- a) Can you recognize an original contribution of the author?
- b) Is the thesis based on relevant references?
- c) Is the thesis defensible at your home institution?
- d) Do the results of the thesis allow their publication in a respected economic journal?
- e) Are there any additional major comments on what should be improved?
- f) Were your comments raised at the pre-defense, addressed in the dissertation submitted to the regular defense? (The pre-defense report is enclosed below)
- g) What is your overall assessment of the thesis? (a) I recommend the thesis to be defended without major changes; (b) The thesis is not defensible.

(Note: The report should be at least 2 pages long.)

Content of the Report:

This is one of the best dissertations I have read at the IES FSV UK. At the very beginning I would like to say that I strongly recommend the thesis to be defended without major (actually any) changes.

This dissertation clearly contributes to the existing knowledge in many respects. I will highlight just a few points:

Chapter 2 - The Rose Effect and the Euro: Is the Magic Gone? – provides important policy relevant results on the effect of the euro currency union on international trade. It shows that the euro's trade-promoting effect is insignificant when the publication bias is filtered out.

Chapter 3 – Estimating Vertical Spillovers from FDI nicely systematizes the existing research on vertical spillovers. There are many studies on vertical spillovers leading to different results. Dissertation of Tomáš Havránek shows what explains differences between the spillover estimates.

Similarly, chapter 4 examines horizontal spillovers from FDI using meta-analysis, which allows Havránek explain why estimates of horizontal spillovers differ.

After publication of research of Tomáš I do not see much sense for researchers to continue producing new papers on vertical and horizontal spillovers.

The thesis by being a set of papers using a meta-analysis naturally builds on a huge amount of relevant papers for each topic examined. Tomáš did a great job and included an extremely comprehensive set of papers into his meta-analyses. The same is true regarding literature on technique of meta-analysis. Tomáš Havránek uses state of the art methodology and references it correctly.

As I said at the beginning, this is one of the best dissertations I have seen at the IES and therefore it is for sure defendable at the IES and I am sure it would be defendable at high-quality foreign economic departments.

All the chapters were already published in respected international journals.

I do not see any need in making changes in the dissertation.

Tomáš Havránek answered my comments during pre-defense and provided relevant references on papers where I can find detailed answers on questions raised.

To conclude, I recommend the thesis to be defended without major changes.

Date:	20.11.2013
Reviewer's Signature:	Pavel Vacek
Reviewer's Affiliation:	PhDr. Pavel Vacek, Ph.D. IES FSV UK