



Diploma Thesis Evaluation Form

Author: Louis Benhamou

Title: Challenges to the Weberian State : Hybrid State and Non - State Actors in Iraq

Programme/year: MISS 2021

Author of Evaluation (supervisor): Tomáš Kučera

| Criteria | Definition | Maximm | Points |
|-----------------------|---|------------|--------|
| Major Criteria | | | |
| | Research question, definition of objectives | 10 | 10 |
| | Theoretical/conceptual framework | 30 | 25 |
| | Methodology, analysis, argument | 40 | 33 |
| <i>Total</i> | | 80 | 68 |
| Minor Criteria | | | |
| | Sources | 10 | 6 |
| | Style | 5 | 2 |
| | Formal requirements | 5 | 5 |
| <i>Total</i> | | 20 | 13 |
| TOTAL | | 100 | 81 |



Evaluation

Major criteria:

Among the most striking features of post-conflict Iraq is the role of popular militias under the umbrella of Popular Mobilisation Forces (PMF). While PMF were instrumental in stopping the IS expansion in Iraq, they continue to determine Iraq's socio-political order after the defeat of IS. This thesis examines the relationship between the PMF and the Iraqi state and promotes a non-Weberian conception of the state.

The overall argument is convincing. The concept of Weberian state restricts our understanding of statehood and prevents us from appreciating socio-political orders without the monopoly on the legitimate use of force. Louis employs the concept of hybridity and principle-agent to show the complex relationship between the PMF and the state.

While the argument is persuasive, its weakness is in the way it is substantiated. No effort is made to explain the methodology. There is only a limited variety of secondary sources, and those are extensively quoted. Although I very much appreciate the brevity of the thesis, its consequence is the limited depth of the empirical analysis.

Minor criteria:

The thesis excessively relies on direct quotations. It is hence emblematic for the thesis that its very last words are in quotation marks.

While the overall amount of sources is sufficient, a variety of sources lacks locally. Often, a page or two repeatedly reference one source.

The thesis is plagiarism-free.

Overall evaluation:

Readability and compelling argument are distinct strengths of this thesis. Its weakness is in the lack of rigorousness when it comes to sources and methodology.



FACULTY OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
Charles University in Prague

Suggested grade: B

Signature: