

## **Protocol of the defense of the doctoral dissertation thesis**

Date: 15.9. 2017

Name: Elmira Lyapina

Title: Protection of Investments in Gas Sector: The Perspectives of Legal Relations between the European Union and the Russian Federation

Commission: Prof. JUDr. Mahulena Hofmannová, the Head of the Commission, Doc. JUDr. PhDr. Veronika Bílková, Ph.D., E.MA., the Member of the Commission, Doc. JUDr. Václav Stehlík, Ph.D., LL.M., Doc. JUDr. Vladimír Balaš, CSc., the opponents, Prof. JUDr. Pavel Šturma, DrSc., the supervisor

Prof. JUDr. Mahulena Hofmannová, the Head of the Commission, welcomed the present members of the commission and introduced the doctoral student. She informed that all the conditions for the holding of oral defense, including publishing of Elmira Lyapina's thesis, were satisfied. Then, the doctoral student gave the opening remarks and presented her work. PhD student described the content and concept of her thesis. In addition, she mentioned the goals and the significance of the study. She clarified theoretical and practical significance of the research, method and outline and literature review. She discussed a consensus of EU-RF gas relations (importance of the natural gas and EU-RF energy cooperation), investment relations between the EU and RF and perspectives of the EU-RF BIT .

The first opponent, doc. Stehlík, recommended the dissertation thesis for the defense. The thesis may be evaluated as complex and well argued. It shows a very good insight of the author in the topic and brings new research outcomes as is required by this type of qualification thesis. Opponent posed his questions for discussion during the defense of the thesis set forth in his report.

The second opponent, doc. Balaš, evaluated the manuscript positively. He supported the arguments presented by doc. Stehlík. In his opinion, the submitted thesis fully satisfied all the requirements as for the choice of the topic, logic structure, methodology and amount of the literature cited. He added that he would like to hear the answer to the first questions posed in his opponent opinion: What was the reason of Russia's withdrawal from ECT? What would be the main difference between the proposed RF/EU BIT and ECT?

Elmira Lyapina thanked for the questions and the remarks of both opponents and responded to their enquiries.

Prof. JUDr. Mahulena Hofmannová, the Head of the Commission, opened a general debate and gave the floor to prof. Šturma. He clarified the issue of this topic of international law. Then he mentioned the collaboration with PhD student. Dr. Beránek asked about the author's opinion on the developments of this area. Prof. Hofmannová focused on the discussion of Yukos case and the perception actual situation by the doctoral student. Doc. Bílková posed the question concerning the attitude of Elmira Lyapina to the International Law in relation of political perspectives of the EU-RF BIT. Then Elmira Lyapina answered the questions and presented her conclusions.

After termination of the general debate, the public was excluded and the secret voting concerning the awarding of the Ph.D. title took place. The result of the voting was 5 to 0 votes (5 votes were positive, 0 vote was negative).

Done in Prague on 15 September 2017

Alexandra Hochmanová