

# IMESS DISSERTATION



Note: Please email the completed mark sheet to Year 2 coordinator

(cc Julia Korosteleva [j.korosteleva@ucl.ac.uk](mailto:j.korosteleva@ucl.ac.uk) and Marta Kotwas [m.kotwas@ucl.ac.uk](mailto:m.kotwas@ucl.ac.uk))

Please note that IMESS students are not required to use a particular set of methods (e.g. qualitative, quantitative, or comparative) in their dissertation.

<b>Student:</b>	Roland Arbesleitner
<b>Dissertation title:</b>	On the Role of the Manufacturing Industries in Economic Resilience

	Excellent	Satisfactory	Poor
<b>Knowledge</b> <i>Knowledge of problems involved, e.g. historical and social context, specialist literature on the topic. Evidence of capacity to gather information through a wide and appropriate range of reading, and to digest and process knowledge.</i>	x		
<b>Analysis &amp; Interpretation</b> <i>Demonstrates a clear grasp of concepts. Application of appropriate methodology and understanding; willingness to apply an independent approach or interpretation recognition of alternative interpretations; Use of precise terminology and avoidance of ambiguity; avoidance of excessive generalisations or gross oversimplifications.</i>		x	
<b>Structure &amp; Argument</b> <i>Demonstrates ability to structure work with clarity, relevance and coherence. Ability to argue a case; clear evidence of analysis and logical thought; recognition of an arguments limitation or alternative views; Ability to use other evidence to support arguments and structure appropriately.</i>	x		
<b>Presentation &amp; Documentation</b> <i>Accurate and consistently presented footnotes and bibliographic references; accuracy of grammar and spelling; correct and clear presentation of charts/graphs/tables or other data. Appropriate and correct referencing throughout. Correct and contextually correct handling of quotations.</i>		x	

<b>ECTS Mark:</b>		<b>UCL Mark:</b>	70	<b>Marker:</b>	Dr Filipa Figueira
<i>Deducted for late submission:</i>				<b>Signed:</b>	Filipa Figueira
<i>Deducted for inadequate referencing:</i>				<b>Date:</b>	12 June 2017

## MARKING GUIDELINES

**A (UCL mark 70+):** Note: marks of over 80 are given rarely and only for truly exceptional pieces of work. **(Charles mark = 1)**

Distinctively sophisticated and focused analysis, critical use of sources and insightful interpretation. Comprehensive understanding of techniques applicable to the chosen field of research, showing an ability to engage in sustained independent research.

**B/C (UCL mark 60-69):**

A high level of analysis, critical use of sources and insightful interpretation. Good understanding of techniques applicable to the chosen field of research, showing an ability to engage in sustained independent research. 65 or over equates to a B grade. **(Charles mark = 2)**

**D/E (UCL mark 50-59):**

Demonstration of a critical use of sources and ability to engage in systematic inquiry. An ability to engage in sustained research work, demonstrating methodological awareness. 55 or over equates to a D grade. **(Charles mark = 3)**

**F (UCL mark less than 50):**

Demonstrates failure to use sources and an inadequate ability to engage in systematic inquiry. Inadequate evidence of ability to engage in sustained research work and poor understanding of appropriate research techniques.

CONTINUES OVERLEAF

**Comments, explaining strengths and weaknesses (at least 300 words):**

**Suggested mark: 70**

**Knowledge**

Excellent! The dissertation offers a very interesting study of whether the resilience of manufacturing, much touted by politicians, actually played a role during the financial crisis in Europe. The student shows an excellent understanding of the issue of economic resilience in relation to manufacturing, and of the relevant literature. In the case-studies, the student also shows a very good ability to apply this theoretical knowledge to real-world cases.

**Analysis & Interpretation**

Very good! Clear research question, explored systematically and coherently. The value added is also clear, as the dissertation offers the first comprehensive pan-European study of the role of reliance in manufacturing on the recovery from the financial crisis.

However, the methodology is a bit unclear – the dissertation claims to offer both qualitative and quantitative analysis, but only qualitative analysis is offered. While quantitative data from Eurostat is used, it is not analysed using a quantitative model. This is not in itself a problem, as indeed qualitative analysis is probably more useful to analyse this issue, but it would have been important to state it clearly in the introduction and methodology section. It would also have been good to state explicitly that the key methodology used is that of case-studies, and to expand more on the advantages and disadvantages of this methodology, linking this to the reliability of the results obtained.

**Structure & Argument**

Excellent! The dissertation is very clear and well structured. The different sections are structured with clarity, relevance and coherence. The argument is sound and logical throughout.

**Presentation & Documentation**

Very good. The dissertation is well presented, and the bibliography and referencing are correct. The tables are well presented. There were just a few occasional typos and English mistakes but clarity was not in any way undermined by them.

Overall, this is an excellent work!

**Specific questions you would like addressing at the oral defence (at least 2 questions):**

-What would you say is the value-added of your dissertation? (ie. how does it add something new, that was not yet provided by the existing literature?)

-Your dissertation successfully defends the usefulness of having a large share of manufacturing in the economy. However, are there also disadvantages to having a large share of manufacturing?

-The British economy is performing relatively well despite its small share of manufacturing. Would you nonetheless say that the UK should increase its share of manufacturing? Or is it not necessary, given that the British economy has found other ways of being resilient to crises?