



### Master's Thesis Review

Student's name and surname: Stepanida Sashnikova

Title of the thesis: NEW PETROGRAD DISTRICT IN ST. PETERSBURG:

A SYMBOL OF MODERNITY, Prague 2016, 97 p., 10 p. of illustrations in the anex.

Reviewer's name and surname: Prof. PhDr. Lud'a Klusáková – Tutor

\_\_\_\_\_

## **1. Heuristic** (please, evaluate by grade 1, 2, 3, 4 - in case of grading 3 and 4 the reviewer is obliged formulate critical points)

1.1 Evaluation of the selection of literature and sources	1 (A)
1.2 Complexity of used sources from the perspective of the state of the art	1 (A)

#### Short evaluation:

The selection of literature for the theoretical framing, for the contextualisation is very careful and solid. The same goes for sources – variety is impressive. The complexity is difficult to achieve in such a short time. For the purpose – case study of one city district the embedding in the general research devoted do St. Petersburg is appropriate.

# **2. Research problem and its solution** (please, evaluate by grade 1, 2, 3, 4 – in case of grading 3 and 4 the reviewer is obliged formulate critical points)

2.1 Choice of the formulation of the research issue respects the task given	1 (A)
to the student	
2.2 The relevance of the goal from the perspective of research area	1 (A)
methodology	

### Short evaluation:

I have witnessed the development of the research question. There was the concern with modernisation since the beginning. Gradually the author narrowed on public places, their

nám. Jana Palacha 2, 116 38 Praha 1 IČ: 00216208 DIČ: CZ00216208 Tel.: (+420) 221 619 203 Fax: (+420) 221 619 385 usd@ff.cuni.cz http://usd.ff.cuni.cz





construction, functioning and usage along with the development of new type of tenement houses as phenomena which can be analysed from the perspective of modernisation. The questioning of its contents and perception by those who lived the process in the district came along with the analysis of expert discourse in periodical press. The concept of public space / public place is applied here with reference to Jürgen Habermas, M. Bassan, D. Canter, J. Montgomery (cultural district) and Peter Clark (linked with green space), leaving the methodological discussions aside, which is legitimate solution.

## **3. Thesis' structure evaluation** (please, evaluate by grade 1, 2, 3, 4 – in case of grading 3 and 4 the reviewer is obliged formulate critical points)

3.1 Is the structure of the thesis logical?	1 (A)
3.2 Does the thesis' structure work along the methodology and methods	1 (A)
declared in the introduction	

#### Short evaluation:

The author clearly formulates what she is going to do, and comments the procedure and gives results. The focus on the changes in amenities, on the effects of modernisation required comparison on chronological scale and comparison of different perspectives of experts and users. The contents analysis of ego documents gives the text flavour and liveliness.

## **4.** The quality of analysis and interpretation (please, evaluate by grade 1, 2, 3, 4 – in case of grading 3 and 4 the reviewer is obliged formulate critical points)

4.1 Analysis of sources and literature	1 (A)
4.2 Interpretation of sources and literature in their interaction	1 (A)

#### Short evaluation:

Analysis is systematic, as well as interpretation of sources and interaction with context. I appreciate the double perspective of memoirs and periodical press (commercial advertisement). Excellent for the master's level.





**5. Quality of the text** (please, evaluate by grade 1, 2, 3, 4 – in case of grading 3 and 4 the reviewer is obliged formulate critical points)

5.1 Style and grammar	1 (A)
5.2 Use of terminology	1 (A)

#### Short evaluation:

English is student's second language, she made visible progress in writing during her master's studies. The text reads very well, meticulous in referencing, footnoting. The text was carefully edited, sensitive to requirements of academic English.

#### 6. Synthetic evaluation (500 signs):

Stepanida Sashnikova has chosen a topic which is very much in the mainstream urban history research, plus she was since the beginning very enthusiastic about St. Petersburg in the period before the October Revolution 1917. The concept of modernisation is a very complex one, with its own history of methodological discussions. The author has avoided to get lost in it by focusing on demonstrations of modernity in urban plan, in organisation of public places and in the architecture of tenement houses. The master's thesis is fulfilling requirements. I am happy to recommend it for successful defense.





### 7. Questions and comments which should the candidate answer and discuss during the defense:

The story of the reconstruction of Petrogradskaya storona reads as a very successful one. Is it because of your empathy in the topic, or there were no failures in urban planning or in development?

Suggested grade: 1 (A) – in ECTS, 19/20 in French grading system

Date: 12.6.2016 Signature: