

Univerzita Karlova v Praze
Filozofická fakulta
Ústav anglického jazyka a didaktiky
Filologie – Anglický jazyk

DISERTAČNÍ PRÁCE

Orkida Backus Borshi

Formální vyjadřování kategorie určenosti v albánštině. Popis
na základě srovnání s angličtinou

Formal Expression of Definiteness in Albanian.
A Description Based on Comparison with English

Table of Contents

Introduction

1. Theoretical background – literature survey
 - 1.1 Definite descriptions – theory of reference – a philosophical insight
 - 1.2 The category of definiteness – a linguistic insight
 - 1.2.1 Definite articles
 - 1.2.2 Linguistic conceptualization of definiteness
 - 1.2.3 The grammaticalization of definite articles
 - 1.3 The expression of definiteness in Albanian
 - 1.3.1 The development of the category of definiteness in Albanian
 - 1.3.2 Remarks on articles in postposition in some of the Balkan languages
 - 1.3.3 Current accounts of the expression of definiteness in Albanian
 - 1.3.3.1 Albanian prepositive article/element
 - 1.3.3.2 Albanian definite postpositive article
 - 1.3.4 Reference grammar account of in/definiteness in noun uses in Albanian
 - 1.4 Reference grammar accounts of the expression of definiteness in English
 - 1.4.1 English Common Nouns and Definiteness
 - 1.4.2 The English definite article with generic reference
 - 1.4.3 Proper nouns and the idea of “properhood”
 - 1.4.4 English proper nouns and definiteness
 2. Research project - data sources, collection and analysis
 - 2.1 Introduction to the Albanian corpus
 - 2.1.1 The use of the corpus
 - 2.2. System-oriented investigation: uses of definite forms in Albanian
 - 2.2.1 Empirical analysis of definiteness in Albanian common nouns
 - 2.2.1.1 Albanian definite common nouns with non-generic reference
 - 2.2.1.2 Albanian common nouns with generic reference
 - 2.2.2 Albanian proper names and in/definiteness
 - 2.2.2.1 Definiteness with Albanian anthroponyms
 - 2.2.2.2 Definiteness with Albanian toponyms
 - 2.2.2.3 Definiteness with Albanian chrematonyms
 - 2.2.2.4 Concluding remarks on proper names in Albanian and English
 - 2.3 Text-oriented investigation
 - 2.3.1 Marcuse text: English-to-Albanian definite reference correlation in translation
 - 2.3.2 Marcuse text: Albanian-to-English definite reference correlation in translation
 - 2.3.3 Rowling text: English-to-Albanian/Albanian-to-English definite reference correlation
 - 2.3.4 Marcuse text: in/definiteness marker distribution in English and Albanian
 - 2.3.5 Rowling text: in/definiteness marker distribution in English and Albanian
 3. Conclusions
- Résumé
- References
- Appendix
- H. Marcuse text (English version) – definite occurrences
 - H. Marcuse text (Albanian version) – definite occurrences
 - J.K. Rowling text (English version) – definite occurrences
 - J.K. Rowling text (Albanian version) – definite occurrences

Introduction provides the historical background to the status of Albanian and English and explains the reasons for choosing English as a springboard for examining definiteness in Albanian.

1. Theoretical background – literature survey is divided into four parts. **1.1 Definite descriptions – theory of reference – a philosophical insight** presents some of the relevant philosophical issues since description of definiteness in language would be incomplete without reference to the philosophical and logical aspects of this topic. It is a much debated issue in the philosophy of language and in logic whether the reference of definite descriptions (*the Queen of England, the table*), and that of proper names (*London, Julia*), is one and the same thing and should be treated in the same manner or not. The survey starts with John Stuart Mill's (1843/1973) conception that has come to be known as the **direct reference** theory of names (cf. the referential theory of meaning below). In response to his position two competing approaches have been subsequently proposed. The first to appear actually includes two theories, **description theory of reference** (also called theory of descriptions), and its more sophisticated version, the **cluster theory of reference**. As a reaction to them, an alternative approach was suggested, the **causal theory of reference** (including a **rigid designators** claim).

1.2 The category of definiteness – a linguistic insight. After a brief overview of the means of expressing definiteness in languages (Dryer and Haspelmath (2005), the focus is on the theories of definiteness in English. The modern grammatical line of inquiry into the realization of definiteness includes the following names: Christophersen (1939), Jespersen (1949), Yotsukura (1970), Hewson (1972), Hawkins (1978, 1991), Chesterman (1991) and Lyons (2003), and we may also add Krámský (1972) and Kaluža (1981). Of great importance was Gustave Guillaume's (1919/1975) work for French, which influenced Christophersen, Hewson and Chesterman, who conceive of definiteness in terms of familiarity, redefined by Hawkins as the location theory. The variants of the pragmatic approach to definiteness, already present in Hawkins's work, are discussed by Lyons in connection with relevance theory (Sperber and Wilson, 1986) and discourse semantics (Irene Heim, 1988). Finally, Lyons's concept of definiteness is a specific extension of identifiability.

1.3 The expression of definiteness in Albanian provides a brief history of the category of definiteness in Albanian (Demiraj, 1985) followed by remarks on articles in postposition in some of the Balkan languages. Moreover, it deals with current accounts of expression of definiteness in Albanian including a survey of the Albanian prepositive element/article and Albanian postpositive article as shown in Thomai (2006), Domi et al. (2002), Camaj (1984), Newmark et al. (1982). Of the two elements, the postposed article/form seems to be of crucial importance when it comes to the phenomenon of in/definiteness in the language. From the consulted sources, it also becomes clear that the postposed element in Albanian accumulates other grammatical categories, such as case, gender and number.

Finally the section concludes with a survey of reference grammar accounts (Newmark et al, 1982) of in/definiteness in nouns uses in Albanian.

1.4 Reference grammar accounts of the expression of definiteness in English. The description of the category of in/definiteness in English is based on a distinction between two basic kinds of reference, generic and non-generic (specific). Non-generic reference in its turn subsumes definite and indefinite reference. The uses of the (central) determiners (articles, definite, indefinite, zero/null, and some) are then related to each of these kinds of reference and the kind and form of nouns (un/countable, singular/plural, common/proper) with which the determiners are used. The survey of the usage is based especially on Dušková et al. (1988/2003) and Quirk et al. (1985), but also others, Description of cotext- or/and context-dependent follows esp. Quirk et al.'s (1985, 265) outline identifying these types of use resulting in definite reference: situational reference, direct anaphoric reference, associative (typically indirect anaphoric) reference, sporadic reference, logical use of *the*, modification-induced definite reference (cataphoric or anaphoric, due to post- and premodifier and apposition), body part reference and phraseology, all of which have in common the feature of uniqueness (and also inclusiveness in plural nouns). As the definite article is used even with generic reference, the description of this type of reference is also included. Finally, definiteness and English proper nouns is covered in some detail, using Quirk et al., Dušková et al, Huddleston and Pullum (2002) and Kažuža (1981), as the main sources. Before that, however, a brief introduction of the concept of “properhood” and an outline of onomastics are presented to put the description of proper nouns/names on a systematic basis.

2. Research project - data sources, collection and analysis. The empirical part of the study opens with **2.1 Introduction to the Albanian corpus** which describes in detail the texts and sources on which the study draws. The research is divided into two parts, each analysing definiteness in Albanian by comparison with English from a different aspect. The first part contrasts the systems of definiteness usage in the two languages, i.e. it focuses on different types of definite reference marked by the definite article in English and their correspondence with Albanian. The second part explores how the two systems operate in parallel texts, an English original and its Albanian translation, and examines the distribution of definite and then both definite and indefinite reference nouns in the samples of the two languages.

2.2. System-oriented investigation: uses of definite forms in Albanian basically uses a checklist approach. The procedure is to go through the list of the basic sub/types of definite reference resulting in the use of the definite article in English and look for their examples in the English original and check the Albanian equivalents to see how a given type of reference is expressed in Albanian. This approach does not work with consecutive texts and does not list all the instances of nouns with the

definite article but, using the texts as a data-base, it focuses on nouns selectively to illustrate the range of definite article uses that together make up the system of definite reference; in this sense it is a system-oriented investigation. The investigation first deals with common nouns. It presents a detailed analysis of English common nouns with the definite article occurring in the texts and their Albanian counterparts, primarily those denoting non-generic reference and their Albanian correlates, but also those expressing generic reference that in English are preceded by the definite article and examines how they are translated into Albanian. Secondly the analysis is dedicated to proper nouns; the starting point is again a checklist of English proper noun/name categories preceded by the definite article (based on Quirk et al and Gordon and Krilova, 1964). and their Albanian counterparts are considered. Since different phenomena are examined, different procedures had to be used: search on parallel source-translation texts, the monolingual Albanian corpus collected for the purposes of this work and the Internet data, and with nouns with generic reference, questionnaire-type elicitation of information from native speakers of Albanian.

2.3 Text-oriented investigation uses samples of parallel texts, original and translation, to see whether the correlations found in grammar examples in the system-oriented investigation also hold in consecutive texts. The disadvantage of this method is that the translator sometimes departs from the original. On the other hand, it makes it possible to reveal certain tendencies and patterns in actual text that will not be obvious from grammatical descriptions and isolated examples. In order to make full use of this method, the investigation proceeds in two directions, from English to Albanian and from Albanian to English. Two pairs of parallel texts are used, the Marcuse and Rowling texts, i.e. English originals and their Albanian translations. The original and translation are used both as a source and a target text and vice versa. This text-oriented research consists of two steps. In the first, it looks at all instances of nouns with the definite article in the English text and how they are translated into Albanian, and conversely, it investigates the English equivalents of all the Albanian definite form nouns in the same stretch of text. After a qualitative analysis (checking the type of definite reference in the original text), it was found more revealing to concentrate on the quantitative aspects. The aim is to find out to what extent there is an overlap between the Albanian and the English definiteness marking. The main results are summarized in Table 35 which shows a remarkable difference between the extent to which English definite reference nouns are matched by definite nouns in Albanian (84,7%) and the situation in the opposite direction, Albanian definite nouns matched by English definite nouns (51.1%):

Table 35: Comparison of English/Albanian definite noun equivalents in the Marcuse/Rowling texts

Definite noun equivalents	Eng → Alb	Alb → Eng
	∅	∅
definite	84,7%	51.1%
indefinite	7.9%	33,2%
0 equivalent	7.4%	15.7%
total	100.0%	100.0%

Given this discrepancy between English and Albanian, in the second step, the samples of text are examined in order to find out the total distribution of nouns with both definite and indefinite marking and compare the situation in English and Albanian. The results are even more tale-telling, as illustrated by the summary Table 37. They show that the proportion of nouns with definite reference is considerably higher in Albanian compared to English at the expense of the representation of nouns with indefinite reference in Albanian texts.

Table 37: The overall proportion of definite and indefinite reference nouns in both Marcuse and Rowling texts

Noun reference	definite ∅	indefinite ∅
English texts	53.2 %.	46.8 %
Albanian texts	73.4 %	26.6 %

3. Conclusions. The main finding concerning the use of common nouns with definite non-generic reference in Albanian is that the definite article/form appears with the same (sub)types of definite reference (i.e. anaphora, cataphora or uniqueness due to cotext, context, modification, apposition, etc.), which entail the use of the definite article in the English nouns, with some notable exceptions such as the indefinite form of Albanian nouns in the accusative preceded by the preposition *në/on* in positions where English would have the definite article. Next, Albanian and English nouns with generic reference agree in using the definite article/form with singular countable nouns. However, they differ in generic plural nouns and singular non-count nouns: while English uses the zero article with them, Albanian uses definite forms. The indefinite generic count noun in the singular, alternating with the definite count noun in English (wherever meaning allows it), only rarely occurs in Albanian. Finally, Albanian proper names show an overwhelming tendency to use them in definite form even where English uses the zero. Thus, while the names of streets, parks, squares, universities and airports tend to be used with the zero (null)

article in English, in Albanian they have definite forms. With other categories, such as the names of theatres, museums, picture galleries, concert halls and clubs, both English and Albanian use the definite article/form. Rather unexpectedly, however, the names of cinemas and some hotels have an indefinite form in Albanian.

As regards the distribution of definiteness in text, the results suggest that Albanian uses definite reference nouns, mainly nouns with definite forms, conspicuously more frequently than English, and conversely the indefinite forms of nouns in Albanian are used significantly less often than the indefinite article and zero in English. So, in spite Newmark et al.'s (1982, 154) claim that definiteness in Albanian corresponds roughly to the definite-indefinite distinction in English (although there are significant differences), there are hints that compared to English the Albanian category of definiteness exhibits idiosyncrasies which indicate its status to be different from that in English. The analysis of the parallel texts suggests that it is neither a merely formal morphological distinction as many Albanian grammars maintain, nor is it *primarily* based on semantic opposition entirely in keeping with the results of the comparison. In both English and Albanian in/definiteness is expressed obligatorily (which makes it a grammatical feature), but the semantic and co- and contextual factors are considerably stronger in English compared to Albanian, though they are not completely irrelevant in Albanian. Thus starting with working hypothesis of symmetry between the English and the Albanian system of definiteness, the study has revealed a startling asymmetry between the two languages in respect of the category of in/definiteness.

Selected references:

- Abbott, B. (2005): 'Definiteness and Indefiniteness'. In Horn, L.R. and Ward, G. (eds) *The Handbook of Pragmatics*, Blackwell Publishers, London.
- Abbott, B. (2010): *Reference*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Allen, S. W. (1959): *Living English Structure*. London: Longman.
- Biber, D. et al. (1991): *Longman Grammar of Spoken and Written English*. Harlow: Longman.
- Bokshi, B. (1980): *Rruga e formimit të fleksionit të sotëm nominal të shqipes*. Pristina: ASHAK.
- Bokshi, B. (1984): *Prapavendosja e nyjës në gjuhët ballkanike*. Prishtinë: Rilindja.
- Buchholz, O. and Fielder, W. (1987): *Albanische Grammatik*. Leipzig: Verlag Encklopädie.
- Camaj, M. (1984): *Albanian Grammar*. Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz.
- Chapman, S. (2000): *Philosophy of linguistics. An Introduction*. London: Routledge.
- Chesterman, A. (1991): *On Definiteness*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Christophersen, P. (1939) *The Articles: A Study of Their Theory and Use in English*. Einar Munksgaard: Copenhagen.
- Coates, R. (2006): 'Properhood'. *Language* 82, 356-382.
- Demiraj, Sh. (1964): *Morfologjia dhe sintaksa e gjuhës së sotme shqipe I, II*. Tirana: Universiteti shtetëror i Tiranës.
- Demiraj, Sh. (1972): *Çështje të sistemit emëror të gjuhës shqipe*. Tirana: Mihal Duri.
- Demiraj, Sh. (1985): *Gramatikë historike e gjuhës shqipe*. Tirana: Universiteti i Tiranës, Fakulteti i Historisë dhe i filologjisë.
- Domi, M. et al. (2002): *Gramatika e gjuhës shqipe – Vëllimi I. – Morfologjia*. Tirana: Shtypshkronja Maluka.
- Donnellan, K. (1966): 'Reference and Definite Descriptions'. *Philosophical Review* 75, 281-304.
- Dryer, M. S. (1989): 'Article–noun order'. *Chicago Linguistic Society* 25, 83–97.
- Dryer, M. S. and Haspelmath, M. (eds.) (2013): *The World Atlas of Language Structures Online*. Leipzig: Max Planck Institute for Evolutionary Anthropology. (Available online at <http://wals.info>, Accessed on 2014-10-27.).
- Dušková, L. (1999): *Studies in the English Language*. Part I, II. Praha: Karolinum.
- Dušková, L. et al. (1988, 2003): *Mluvnice současné angličtiny na pozadí češtiny*. Praha: Academia.
- Frege, G. (1892a): 'On Sense and Meaning'. In Geach, P. and Black, M. (eds), *Translations from the Philosophical Writings of Gottlob Frege*, 3rd edn, Oxford: Blackwell.
- Frege, G. (1892b): 'On Concept and Object'. In Geach, P. and Black, M. (eds), *Translations from the Philosophical Writings of Gottlob Frege*, 3rd edn, Oxford: Blackwell.

- Frege, G. (1952): 'On Sense and Reference'. In Geach, P. and Black, M. (eds. and trans.), *Translations from the philosophical writings of Gottlob Frege*. Oxford: Blackwell, 56–78. Translation of Frege 1892, *Über Sinn und Bedeutung*, *Zeitschrift für Philosophie und philosophische Kritik*, 100, 25–50.
- Gjinari, J. (1972): 'Mbi nyjën e prapme të shqipes në aspektin e lidhjes gjuhësore iliro-shqiptare'. *Studime filologjike* 4.
- Gordon, E. M. and Krilova, I. P. (1964): *The Use of Articles in Modern English*. Moscow.
- Guillaume, G. (1919/1975): *Le problème de l'article et sa solution dans la langue française*. Paris: Hachette.
- Hamp, E. P. (1972): 'Albanian'. In Sebeok, Thomas A. (ed.), *Current Trends in Linguistics*, Vol. 9 (1972), pp.1626–92, a review of work since 1918.
- Hawkins, J. A. (1978): *Definiteness and Indefiniteness*. London: Croom Helm.
- Hawkins, J. A. (1991): 'On (in)Definite Articles: Implicatures and (un)Grammaticality Prediction.' *Journal of Linguistics* 27, 405– 42.
- Heim, I. (1988): *The semantics of definite and indefinite noun phrases*. New York: Garland Pub.
- Hewson, J. (1972): *Article and Noun in English*. The Hague: Mouton.
- Huddleston, R. and Pullum, G. R. (2002): *The Cambridge Grammar of the English Language*. Cambridge: University Press Cambridge.
- Jespersen, O. (1924): *Philosophy of grammar*. London: Allen & Unwin.
- Jespersen, O. (1949): *A Modern English Grammar on Historical Principles*, Part VII: Syntax. London: Allen & Unwin.
- Kałuża, H. (1981): *The Use of Articles in Contemporary English*. Heidelberg: Groos.
- Krámský, J. (1972): *The article and the concept of definiteness in language*. The Hague: Mouton.
- Kripke, S. (1980): *Naming and necessity*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press. Previously published in D. Davidson and G. Harman (eds.), *Semantics of natural language*. Dordrecht: Reidel (1972), 253–355.
- Lycan, W. G. (2000): *Philosophy of Language. A Contemporary Introduction*. London: Routledge.
- Lyons, C. (1995): *Proper nouns, generics, and the count–mass distinction*. Paper presented at the ESRI Research Seminar, University of Salford.
- Lyons, C. (2003): *Definiteness*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Mann, S. E. (1932): *A Short Albanian Grammar*. London: David Nutt.
- Mann, S. E. (1977): *An Albanian Historical Grammar*. Hamburg: Helmut Buske Verlag.
- Meyer, G. (1892): *Albanesische Studien, III*. Wien: Gerold.
- Mill, J. S. (1843/1973): *A System of Logic*. London: Longman.
- Newmark, L. (1957): *Structural Grammar of Albanian*. Bloomington: Indiana University.

- Newmark, L., Hubbard, P. and Prifti, P. (1982): *Standard Albanian: A Reference Grammar for Students*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Newmark, L. (1999): *Oxford Albanian-English Dictionary*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Pedersen, H. (1900): 'Die gutturale im Albanesischen'. *Zeitschrift für vergleichende Sprachforschung* 36. 277-340.
- Popela, J. (1985): 'K otázce kombinace typologických vlastností v jazycích'. *Bulletin ruského jazyka a literatury* XXVI. 37-67.
- Quirk, R. et al. (1985): *A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language*. London: Longman.
- Riza, S. (1965): *Emrat në shqipen: sistemi i rasave dhe tipet e lakimit*. Tiranë.
- Russell, B. (1905): 'On denoting.' *Mind* 14, 479-493.
- Russell, B. (1910–11): 'Knowledge by acquaintance and knowledge by description'. *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* (8): 108-128.
- Russell, B. (1918): 'The Philosophy of Logical Atomism'. In Marsh, R. C (ed.) (1956). *Logic and Knowledge*. London: Allen & Unwin.
- Searle, J. R. (1958): 'Proper Names.' *Mind*, 67, 166-173.
- Sgall, P. (1986): 'Classical typology and modern linguistics'. *Folia Linguistica* 20(1-2). 15-28.
- Sgall, P. (1993): 'Typy jazyků a jejich základní vlastnosti'. *Slovo a slovesnost* 54. 271-277.
- Sgall, P. (1995): 'Prague School Typology'. In Masayoshi, S. and Bynon, T. (eds.). *Approaches to language typology*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. 49–84.
- Skalička, V. (2004): *Souborné dílo – II.díl*. Praha: Karolinum.
- Spencer, A. (2007): "The possessum-agreement construction or 'Does Albanian have a genitive case?'. In *The Minimalist Muse*: 223-250.
- Sperber, D. and Wilson, D. (1986): *Relevance: Communication and Cognition*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Strawson, P. F. (1950): 'On Referring'. *Mind* 59, 320-344.
- Sweet, H. (1892): *A New English Grammar. Logical and Historical*. London: The Clarendon Press.
- Šrámek, R. (1999): *Úvod do obecné onomastiky*. Brno: Masarykova univerzita.
- Thomai, J. (2006): *Leksikologjia e gjuhës shqipe*. Tirana: Botimet Toena.
- Yotsukura, S. (1970): *The Articles in English: A Structural Analysis of Usage*. The Hague: Mouton.
- Zymberi, I. (1991): *Colloquial Albanian*. London: Routledge.

Parallel texts:

Marcuse Herbert (1964, ed. used 2002): *The One-Dimensional Man*. London and New York: Routledge.

Marcuse, H. (2006): *Njeriu njëdimensional*. Tirana: Seria Filozofi/Sociologji/Shkenca Politike.

Translator: Gaqo Karashaki.

Rowling, J.K. (1998): *Harry Potter and the Sorcerer's Stone*. New York: Scholastic Press.

Rowling, J.K. (2002): *Harry Potter dhe guri filozofal*. Tirana: Dituria. Translator: Amik Kasoraho.

Steinbeck, J. (1993) *Of Mice and Men*. Penguin Books Ltd.

Steinbeck, J. (2003) *Njerëz dhe minj*. Tirana: Ideart. Translator: Fredi Proko