

Report on Bachelor / Master Thesis

Institute of Economic Studies, Faculty of Social Sciences, Charles University in Prague

Student:	Bc. Jana Marečková
Advisor:	PhDr. Jiří Skuhrovec
Title of the thesis:	Detection of Bid Rigging: theoretical and empirical analysis

The thesis focuses on public procurement in medical machinery. The author tries to answer several hypotheses, which can be summarized in a single and simple question: is there some evidence of big rigging in the medical machinery public procurement? The author uses a frequency analysis of bidding companies in this sector and concludes that there is a very suspicious behavior of several companies that might be considered a bid rigging.

The thesis is quite well written and deals with a very interesting and up-to-date topic. The thesis' structure is straightforward and a reader does not have a problem to follow the text. However, there are several issues that could improve the quality of the thesis. A more detailed overview of these issues is provided in following paragraphs.

First, the second chapter, where the author describes principles of public procurement and provides a literature overview, is very long and needlessly detailed and the author discusses quite straightforward things.

Second, it is not clear from the thesis why the author chose particularly the medical machinery sector. This is definitely a question that should be answered during the defense as there are much more interesting industry sectors for the analysis (e.g. construction).

Then, the author could, in my opinion, use some more exact statistical methods to confirm or reject her hypotheses. The frequency analysis reveals some trends but a more exact statistical test should be performed (e.g. whether there is a statistically significant dependency between the ownership structure of bidding companies and the bid price difference or other pattern).

Last, I really appreciate the author's effort, which was put into getting the dataset. The author did a very good job in this and her idea to analyze a very sensitive topic is the reason why I recommend the thesis for a defense with grading **excellent**.

SUMMARY OF POINTS AWARDED (for details, see below):

CATEGORY	POINTS
<i>Literature</i> (max. 20 points)	20
<i>Methods</i> (max. 30 points)	18
<i>Contribution</i> (max. 30 points)	25
<i>Manuscript Form</i> (max. 20 points)	20
TOTAL POINTS (max. 100 points)	83
GRADE (1 – 2 – 3 – 4)	1


Report on Bachelor / Master Thesis

Institute of Economic Studies, Faculty of Social Sciences, Charles University in Prague

Student:	Bc. Jana Marečková
Advisor:	PhDr. Jiří Skuhrovec
Title of the thesis:	Detection of Bid Rigging: theoretical and empirical analysis

NAME OF THE REFEREE: Petr Gapko

DATE OF EVALUATION: 17. 6. 2013



Referee Signature