Opponent’s assessment of a doctoral thesis

The tomb of vizier Akhethotep, situated at Saqqara, north of the Unis causeway and south of the enclosure wall of Djoser’s Step Pyramid, has been excavated by Selim Hassan in 1937-1938. In view of the somewhat summary manner of the original publication, many questions concerning this important source from the turn of the 5th and 6th dynasty of the Old Kingdom of ancient Egypt remained unanswered. The doctoral candidate has set forth to remedy this shortcoming, and in his work he provides an overall assessment of the Saqqara burial area, detailed description of the tomb itself, of its artistic character and of its inscriptions, ending with a general historical overview of the transition between the 5th and 6th Dynasty.

The text of the thesis supplies a detailed description of the architecture of the tomb. This is followed by no less detailed renderings of all the carvings and reliefs, and especially inscriptions situated within the tomb including their translations and, where commendable, commentaries. Wherever the author deems it necessary, he provides comparative tables showing the occurrences of a given iconographical motif throughout the period in question (5th to 6th Dynasty).

The historical chapter subsumes the data available on the reigns of Fifth-dynasty pharaohs Menkauhor, Djedkare and Unis, as well as on the Sixth-dynasty ones – Teti, Userkare, Pepy I, Merenre Antyemsatef, Pepy II, Merenre Antyemsatef II and Nitokris. Finally, the author closes with a biographical sketch of the vizier Akhethotep’s life and deeds, with presentation of the idea that Akhethotep might have lost his tomb as a consequence of royal punishment for some serious fault.

More recent literature has become available on some questions treated by the author. For Byblos, for instance, we now have the comprehensive treatment of its contexts and monuments by Muntaha Saghieh (Byblos in the Third Millennium B.C.: A Re-construction of the Stratigraphy and a Study of the Cultural Connections. Warminster: Aris and Phillips 1983). In citing bibliographical data of unpublished works (like the Afifi thesis on p. 204, footnote 601), all readers will definitely welcome more detailed entries including, for instance, the university in which this thesis was defended and the year of its defence.
It is nonetheless my firm belief and conviction that Abdou Mohamed Abdou Mohamed’s „The tomb of Akhethotep Hemi Re-used by Nebkauhor Idu“ fulfils all the conditions required by law from a treatise substantiating the conferment of a PhD. title. Therefore, I take the liberty of recommending that the above cited thesis be admitted for defence as a PhD. thesis, and I firmly hope that the candidate will be awarded the title.

....................................................
ptof. PhDr. Petr Charvát, DrSc.
Department of Near Eastern Studies
Philosophical Faculty
University of West Bohemia at Plzeň
Postal address:
Univerzitní 8
306 14 Plzeň