

## Opponent's report on

Doctoral thesis by Mgr. Murat Narkulov

### "Demographic Approach in Measuring Human Capital of Kazakhstan

The thesis submitted (Prague 2011, 251 pages including annexes) represents very solid piece of academic work. It thoroughly reviews different concepts of human capital found in various strands of literature, discusses various determinants and dimensions of human capital, and presents stylized methodological approaches. The section presenting own research contains thorough data description and results of extended computational work done by the author. The thesis is very carefully crafted and contains valuable scientific value added. Therefore, **the thesis submitted by Murat Narkulov deserves award of a PhD degree at the Charles University.**

I have several relatively minor comments which should be considered mainly as a guidance for the author when preparing excerpts of the thesis for the purpose of publication, either in a form of a journal article or a monograph.

1. It would be valuable to add richer international comparisons both in terms of underlying indicators and in terms of results.
2. Throughout the empirical part, possible biases due to imperfect information/data are properly noted. It would be useful to insert in addition short section or table at the end summarizing possible biases and noting their expected signs and possible size. It would provide reader better impression about possible impact of aggregated biases on final outcomes.
3. More detailed sensitivity analysis would be informative about robustness of findings.
4. It should be better explained what author means as *triviality* of potential biases due to heterogeneous probabilities of survival (page 168).
5. Single reference to shapes of life-cycle earning profiles in Norway is rather strange (page 153). I recommend to collect and present parametrical estimates of earning-experience/age profiles for larger set of countries as it can be found in empirical literature.

**I recommend / propose the commission to invite Mgr. Murat Narkulov to publicly defend his thesis.**

Daniel Münich

Prague, September 24, 2011

