Tutors’ assessment of the diploma thesis of Ayaulym Sagynbayeva

The diploma thesis of Ayaulym Sagynbayeva „The role of migration in demographic development in the East Kazakhstan region” consists of 132 numerated pages including 20 pages of appendixes. The text is divided into twelve parts including the introduction, conclusions, references and appendixes. In addition there are also the lists of tables, figures and schemes incorporated to the other parts of the diploma thesis.

The goal of the diploma thesis has been the evaluation of migration role in population development of the East Kazakhstan Region (oblast’) and its subdivisions – rural and urban areas and the administrative districts (rayons).

The work has well bounded logical structure; the first third of the text is devoted to the initial questions, the remaining two thirds to the research topics. In the introductory part, A. Sagynbayeva is defining the problem she is going to study, presenting the goal of her work and structure the problem through the correct specification of her research objectives and questions. This part of the thesis contains also the outline of basic terminology and literature, relatively extensive conceptual frameworks, an attempt for a critical discussion of the used data related questions and a methodological part. The core of the thesis starts with a standard introductory characteristic of the region and is represented namely by the 8th and 9th chapters dealing with description of population size and sex and age structure developments in the region and its subdivisions and with evaluation of the migration role in these developments respectively. The results of A. Sagynbayeva diploma research are summarized in the Conclusions.

Ayaulym Sagynbayeva worked on the diploma thesis independently with the use of relevant and correctly quoted literature and official statistical data. In comparison with the first submitted text of the diploma thesis, the author and her thesis achieved substantial progress. The author has finally found the way to express her ideas and findings in English. The adopted terminology is used in principle correctly and the process of formulating ideas and findings improved in general. Some issues, mostly minor ones, however, remained unsolved and are listed below.

The major minus of the entire work I can be seen in low ability of the author herself to express in a balanced manner when each topic has reserved only as much space as it is necessary and text is word ballast free. In the case of the submitted text we can find quite frequently repeated information, too detailed descriptions or just statements containing obvious or notorious facts, for instance when writing on Population development theory in the sense of this process concept (Sub-chapter 4.1.). Situation in this respect is not much better also when methodological questions are discussed (Chapter 6) or when results presented in tables are again number by number repeated in the text. For example, why is presented the syntax for the SAS application (p. 35) when author is using for advanced calculation the SPSS software or why in demographic diploma thesis is incorporated detailed description of sex and age structure developments in the region and its subdivisions and with evaluation of the migration role in these developments respectively. The results of A. Sagynbayeva diploma research are summarized in the Conclusions.

Ayaulym Sagynbayeva worked on the diploma thesis independently with the use of relevant and correctly quoted literature and official statistical data. In comparison with the first submitted text of the diploma thesis, the author and her thesis achieved substantial progress. The author has finally found the way to express her ideas and findings in English. The adopted terminology is used in principle correctly and the process of formulating ideas and findings improved in general. Some issues, mostly minor ones, however, remained unsolved and are listed below.

The major minus of the entire work I can be seen in low ability of the author herself to express in a balanced manner when each topic has reserved only as much space as it is necessary and text is word ballast free. In the case of the submitted text we can find quite frequently repeated information, too detailed descriptions or just statements containing obvious or notorious facts, for instance when writing on Population development theory in the sense of this process concept (Sub-chapter 4.1.). Situation in this respect is not much better also when methodological questions are discussed (Chapter 6) or when results presented in tables are again number by number repeated in the text. For example, why is presented the syntax for the SAS application (p. 35) when author is using for advanced calculation the SPSS software or why in demographic diploma thesis is incorporated detailed description of sex and age (population) pyramid (p. 37)? It is in vain twice since writing that “… number or per cent of total population is used on the horizontal scale …” on the page 37, the author forgot this basic rule when drawing the pyramids on Fig. 7 and 8 (p. 52) and relating the number of persons in particular age groups to the total number of males or females.
Other weaker point of the thesis (and the author) is less developed sense for numbers in the context of reality and, moreover, insufficient attention paid to them during calculations, especially mostly omitted checking. In the table 2 and others the check calculations on total are missing. In the table 12 are presented time series of sex ration values with variability which is unrealistic. That there are principal errors in computation or in data the author should be able to distinguish on the basis of checking regional numbers against the set of district ones (extremely visible it is in the very last column). The analogous situation developed in the case of the lines describing net migration developments on the Fig. 12 and Fig. 13.

Exploitable reserves are still in ideas formulation (generalization) as well as in the quality of used English language. Two sentences from the page 67 should be a sufficient illustration: “We assume that changes in natural and migration change of population in 2008 were a start of a new trend in the population development or one-year fluctuation. This fluctuation could be a reason of economic crisis which began in 2008. “ ... and ... „If the level of natural change exceeds the level of net migration, then in the future the natural change will play a basic role in the population development in the region."

On the other side the formal presentation of thesis is on a good level, without substantial errors and mistakes. Used literature is properly quoted in the text and listed under the label References and internet sources. There are only minor errors when the name of co-author in the quotation Sagynbayeva (2006) on the page 13 is omitted, and when the year is missing by name Chernysh on pages 231 and 109. The work Alexeenko and Alexeenko, 1999 is incorrectly listed.

Referring to ascertained facts there is no more serious doubt on my side that the diploma thesis of Ayaulym Sagynbayeva „The role of migration in demographic development in the East Kazakhstan region“ in its present content and format can be successfully submitted for the defence in front of the Commission for state exams (MA). With the awareness of this fact, I propose to the Commission to accept the submitted diploma thesis of Ayaulym Sagynbayeva for the defence.

RNDr. Tomáš Kučera, CSc.
tutor

Prague, 17th June 2010