SVOBODA

imess

IMESS dissertation						
Name:	Rahel Zibner					
Dissertation title:	Irregular Female Migration from Ukraine: Labour in the Elderly Care Sector in Italy					
Scale: 5 - excellent, 4 - good, 3 - satisfactory, 2 - poor, 1 – very poor						
	5	**4**	**3**	**2**	**1**	
ARGUMENT:						
Clearly defined research question	X					No clearly defined research question
Answers research question	X					Does not answer research question
Well structured	X					Badly structured
Shows theoretical awareness	X					Shows no theoretical awareness
Conceptual clarity	X					Conceptual confusion
Empirically appropriate & robust	X					Full of empirical errors
Logical and coherent	X					Illogical and incoherent
Analytical	X					Descriptive
Critical	X					Uncritical
Shows independent thought	X					Does not show independent thought
SOURCES & USAGE:						
Evidence of reading/research	X					No evidence of reading/research
Effective use of sources/data	X					Ineffective use of sources/data
WRITING STYLE:						
Clear	X					Obscure
Good punctuation		X				Poor punctuation
Grammatically correct	X					Grammatically incorrect
PRESENTATION:						
Appropriate length	X					Too long/short
Good referencing		X				Poor/inconsistent referencing
Good spelling		X				Poor spelling
Good bibliography	X					Poor bibliography

Comments:

It is difficult to write anything else than "excellent". Rahel chose for her dissertation a really interesting, innovative and challenging topic of migration of Ukrainian women to Italy. She clearly explains the role of the push and pull factors-poverty in Ukraine and the demand for the caretakers in Italy. However, as Rahel points out, migration is by no means solely economically motivated and she reflects this fact in her work. As a result, she deals with the factors like the role of the women in the Ukrainian society, the social networks and adoption to the new culture.

The dissertation is well structured and written with sound argumentation. The only problem lies in the fact of switching between American and British spelling in some cases (labor-labour) and some misprints (publicily – p. 40, irrregular in the title of the dissertation).

To sum up, Rahel's work unquestionably deserves the highest evaluation for its innovative approach to the challenging and extremely difficult topic.

Specific Questions for oral defence:		
Deducted for late submission:	Deducted for faulty referencing:	**Mark***: výborně/A
Charles marker: Výborně	Signed:	Date: June 16 2010

***Mark: A = 70+; B = 65-69; C = 60-64; D = 55-59; E = 50-54; F = fail, less than 50, see Scheme of award –please, fill in this way: Charles/IMESS (e.g. Výborně/A)**