

**Charles University Prague**

Faculty of Social Sciences

Institute of Social Sciences

International Master in Economy, State and Society

with Reference to Eastern Europe and Russia

**Rahel Zibner**

**IRRREGULAR FEMALE MIGRATION FROM UKRAINE: LABOUR  
IN THE ELDERLY CARE SECTOR IN ITALY**

*Master Dissertation*

Prague 2010

**Author:** Rahel Zibner  
**Supervisor:** Karel Svoboda  
**First marker:**  
**Second marker:**  
**Date of Defence:** 23rd of June 2010

**Assessment:**

## **Bibliographic record**

Zibner, Rahel. Irregular Female Labour Migration from Ukraine for Labour to the Elderly Care Sector in Italy. Prague: Karlova Universita, Fakulta Sociálních Věd, 2010. 90 pp.  
Supervisor of the Dissertation: Karel Svoboda

## **Annotation**

This research deals with irregular female migration from Ukraine to Italy for employment as caregivers to the elderly. The main questions to be addressed are: ‘What are the reasons for Ukrainian women to migrate irregularly to such a large extent to Italy? Which important aspects are connected to their employment as a caregiver to the elderly from the individual point of view of Ukrainian women? In this thesis I want to explain the reasons for Ukrainian women to take up work as irregular caregivers in Italy, giving insight into the organization of daily life of irregular Ukrainian care givers. Practical examples will be given that examine the help women receive from Ukrainian professional and private networks. Despite information gaps, the combination of expert and migrant interviews in combination with the analysis of research studies and secondary sources produced important findings on this topic. Firstly, irregular female migration is economically motivated and women are driven to Italy through specific push and pull factors. Secondly, employment and daily life as a caregiver to the elderly in Italy entails economic advantages, but psychological disadvantages for Ukrainian women.

## **Keywords**

Irregular migration, female migration, Ukraine, caregivers, elderly, Italy

## **Statement:**

1. This statement is to confirm that this paper is a product of my own work and also to confirm that I used the listed sources in producing it.
2. I agree that the paper can be checked for research and studying purposes.

Prague, 04 June 2010

Rahel Zibner

# Table of contents

<b>I) Introduction</b> .....	7
<b>II) Research Framework</b> .....	8
<b>2. Methods</b> .....	8
<b>3. Migration Theories</b> .....	12
<b>3.1 Economic approaches to the question why do Ukrainian women migrate to Italy</b> .....	13
<b>3.2 Ukrainian women’s ‘Lebenswelten’ or life stories in Italy and Ukraine: The perspective of Transnationalism</b> .....	16
<b>3.3 Networks</b> .....	20
<b>4. Definitions</b> .....	24
<b>III) Empirical Research</b> .....	25
<b>5. The socio-economic background in Ukraine causing female labour migration</b>	25
<b>5.1 Economic push factors</b> .....	25
<b>5.1.1 Women in labour in Ukraine</b> .....	27
<b>5.1.2 Women’s economic motivation</b> .....	30
<b>5.2 Non- economic push factors</b> .....	32
<b>5.2.1 Legal situation</b> .....	32
<b>5.2.2 Female gender roles</b> .....	33
<b>6. The specific demand for female migrant labor in the elderly care sector in Italy</b>	39
<b>7. Migration numbers and demographical characteristics of Ukrainian women in Italy</b> .....	47
<b>7.1 The extent of irregular female migration from Ukraine to Italy</b> .....	47
<b>7.2 Demographical Structure Ukrainian female migrants in Italy</b> .....	51
<b>7.2.1 Age</b> .....	51
<b>7.2.2 Education</b> .....	52
<b>7.2.3 Martial status</b> .....	52
<b>7.2.4 Regional characteristics</b> .....	53

<b>7.3 Duration</b> .....	54
<b>8. Irregular female migration to Italy and the role of networks</b> .....	55
<b>9. Living and working conditions of irregular Ukrainian female carer givers in Italy</b> .....	59
<b>9.1.1 ‘Badanti’</b> .....	60
<b>9.1.2 Italian employers and the hiring process of Ukrainian ‘badanti’</b> .....	61
<b>9.2 Transnational daily life of irregular Ukrainian female labour migrants</b> ....	63
<b>9.3 Psychological and social consequences of irregular labour migration for Ukrainian women in Italy and their families in Ukraine</b> .....	66
<b>9.4 The consequences of irregularity in connection to the duration of stay</b> .....	68
<b>IV) Conclusion</b> .....	71
<b>V)Bibliography</b> .....	75
<b>Appendeces</b> .....	82

## I) Introduction

In the era of globalization and with the liberalization of markets, goods, services, and capital, migration is one of the biggest challenges of our time. Ukraine means 'borderland' and the country has always been involved in significant migration movements due to political and economic changes and shifting boundaries. Since the collapse of the Soviet Union, Ukraine's independence in 1991, and the Eastern Enlargements of the EU in 2004 and 2007, there have been stimulating impacts on migration flows. Ukraine has become a major sending country of migrant workers to the EU and therefore is of high importance within the European migration system. European migrations are no longer male dominated, as was the case during the 1960s and 70s. Migration now follows international tendencies, which includes the 'feminization' of migration flows. Half of migrants worldwide and in Europe are female today. Processes of importation of female labour for assistance and care have a planetary dimension as work in the domestic care sector is one of the most important forms of transnational survival.<sup>1</sup> Labour migration is the most important form of economically motivated migration and has developed into a major source of income and social importance for Ukrainians.<sup>2</sup> At least 70 percent of all Ukrainians migrants are labour migrants. Disparities in wages and employment possibilities between Ukraine and the neighbouring countries cause between 7-10 million to seek work abroad, foremost in the EU or in Russia.<sup>3</sup> As a result of restrictive labour and immigration regulations, work and residence in EU states is often not legal. In search for better living and working conditions, a major part of all female labour migration flows from Ukraine are directed to Italy. Due to demographic changes, Italy in particular has a high demand for labour and offers favourable conditions for irregular female migrant labour.

---

<sup>1</sup> Morokvasi, Mirjana, 'Crossing Borders and Shifting Boundaries of Belonging in Post- Wall Europe. A Gender Lens', in eds., Berthoin Antal & Quack, Grenzüberschreitung – Grenzziehung. Implikationen für Innovation und Identität, Berlin: Sigma 2006, k. pp. 8 -19.

<sup>2</sup> ILO: Ministry of Labour and Social Policy of Ukraine. International Labour Office 2005. P. 61.

<sup>3</sup> German television, ZDF Auslandsjournal. 'Geld oder Liebe. Kinder in der Ukraine wachsen ohne Eltern auf'. <<http://auslandsjournal.zdf.de/ZDFde/inhalt/5/0,1872,7124453,00.html>>[access: 03.03.2010].

Italian and European politics have turned a blind eye to this migration issue, which is very significant for Europe. Female migration from Ukraine only rarely gets public attention,<sup>4</sup> and is usually only connected to images of Ukrainian prostitutes and elicited workers in the media. But thousands of Ukrainian women work as elderly caregivers in Italian households for low wages. They are thus an indispensable pillar of the Italian elderly care sector.<sup>5</sup>

The aim of this thesis is to analyse the reasons for Ukrainian women's irregular migration to Italy and to give insight into women's work as caregivers, from the individual point of view of Ukrainian women. In the beginning I will discuss economic and social preconditions and subsequent migration motives of prospective Ukrainian female migrants. Besides economic factors, special attention is paid to female gender roles in Ukraine, to illustrate factors relevant to women's migration decisions. By examining the discourse on the elderly care sector I will provide information on the reasons for why Italy attracts so many Ukrainian women. In the next section, I will discuss the impact of migration networks and irregularity, as supporting and intervening factors of migration. The aspect of irregularity and networks are of major importance in respect to women's migration projects and affects their daily life, as well as their psychological conditions. Subsequently, I will highlight the daily lives of Ukrainian women and their occupation as caregivers to the elderly in Italy. The restrictions in daily life deriving from an irregular status and the psychological consequences will be mentioned in the last chapter among with other problems Ukrainian elderly caregivers encounter.

## **II) Research Framework**

### **2. Methods**

---

<sup>4</sup> Zimmer, Kerstin, *Die Ukraine als ein Aus-Ein- und Rückwanderungsland*, Marburg: Phillips-Universität 2007 < [www.staff.uni-marburg.de/~zimmerk/reisebericht\\_2seitig.pdf](http://www.staff.uni-marburg.de/~zimmerk/reisebericht_2seitig.pdf) > [accessed 03.02.2010] p 40. (repeated reference: Zimmer, *Die Ukraine*)

<sup>5</sup> Studi Emigrazione, *International Journal of Migration Studies*. Volume XLII, No. 159. Centro Studi Emigrazione. Rome, September 2005. p. 520. (repeated reference: *Studi Emigrazione*)

The research on labour migration from Ukraine to EU countries began with Ukraine's independence in 1991. Though a few research studies focus on labour migration from Ukraine to the European Union and the main target countries, including Italy; literary sources are still very limited on Ukrainian female labour migrants, employed as caregivers in Italy.

The literature review reveals that Ukraine-related migration issues are mostly examined together with other successor states of the Soviet Union, as there are many parallels, like the common experience of Soviet rule. The results of several studies on migrants from CIS countries in Italy can be partly applied to my thesis, but only a small number of studies refer explicitly to the causes for female labour migration to Italy and irregular female caregivers in Italy, which require independent examination. Western Ukraine is the most common region of analysis because it is particularly affected by labour migration and is also the origin of almost all Ukrainian caregivers in Italy.

The Internet is the best source for current information and research reports by international organizations. I have read many secondary sources and thanks to my sufficient language capacity, I have been able use sources in Russian, Ukrainian, German and Italian to complete this analysis.

One problem is the often-poor quality of data and statistics that can be found in most analyses on irregular migration from Ukraine. There are far too few reliable research studies and systematic investigations into the reasons for women to migrate to Italy. In Ukraine, various state agencies are employed in different areas of migration and data collection, such as the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs or the State Committee for Nationalities and Migration. To improve the quality of data collection, these organizations should be combined within a single authority.

The main element complicating the availability of reliable data is the form of irregular labour migration, which is beyond government control. Official government statistics only include legal, registered movements. Ukrainian women leaving the country to work in Italy irregularly are not included in the statistics. In conclusion, official government statistics in Ukraine and Italy tend to underestimate the true extent of labour migration from Ukraine to Italy. In my analysis, I have to rely upon estimates in large parts of my data. This same difficulty applies to studying Ukrainian women as caregivers

in Italy because comprehensive research results are few. Through extensive research of primary sources I hope to give an insight into the living and working conditions of Ukrainian caregivers in Italy.

Due to the lack of ‘hard’ data and systematic research, I employed a mix of methods to my work. Expert consultation and interviews with current and former irregular female migrants are the major source of information for this thesis to fill the large information gaps outlined above. In order to explore why Ukraine women choose Italy as their country of destination and how their life looks like in Italy, I conducted research in Ukraine as well as in Italy in the summer of 2009. During these trips I conducted interviews in Ukraine and in Italy with the following:

**a.** *experts* (‘E’)

**b.** *daily life interlocutors* (‘M’)

1) with former or present Ukrainian female labour migrants with experience as caregivers in Italy

2) people who got in touch with or were affected by the phenomenon of irregular female labour migration

In Ukraine I conducted interviews with representatives of the Caritas, the West-Ukrainian Centre, and ‘Women’s Perspectives’ in L’viv. In Kiev I talked to the International Women’s Rights Centre, ‘La Strada- Ukraine’, the International Organization for Migration (IOM), the International Labour Organization (ILO) and the Konrad Adenauer Foundation (KAS).

After my Ukrainian interviews, I travelled to Italy where I interviewed people from the Caritas, the International Organization for Migration (IOM) and the Association for Ukrainian caregivers in Italy, all located in Rome. Many organizations provided me with internal papers and statistics, which have not yet been or will not be published. The information I gathered is thus an important resource in my findings. Further, I have been in touch with scientists who have studied migration from Ukraine. Dr. Kerstin Zimmer from the University of Marburg and Frank Düvell from Oxford University gave me valuable advice on the handling of my subject.

The information I gained first-hand from Ukrainian female migrants gave me indispensable insight into the networks and complex webs of social relations involved in irregular women's lives in Italy. For the most part, I met women with experience as labour migrants to Italy or other EU states, on trains in Ukraine. It was much easier to find interviewees willing to discuss their own migration in Ukraine, as opposed to those currently in Italy, who live in fear of being detected. Overall, however, it was very difficult to find interviewees who were prepared to give detailed reports about their individual experiences, and even those who did give interviews should be analysed with caution.

The interviews with daily life interlocutors are not presumed to generalize the lives of all female labour migrants from Ukraine to Italy because their opinions reflect their own subjective and individual experiences. In some cases unpleasant situations might not be mentioned and certain elements of an individual's life might remain untold. Irregular migration is a very sensitive area for the women concerned, since it accompanies negative associations, fear, and distrust or shame, especially toward strangers. Through the deployment of qualitative interviews, I left the decision to the interviewees, themselves, to reveal how much they felt was necessary of their irregular migration experience. I modified the interviews during the conversation, according to the individual migrant. If the situation permitted it, I specifically asked for migration motives, circumstances, problems and consequences of irregular labour migration to Italy and in their work as caregivers. To show my respect and to make the women more willing to share their knowledge with me and feel uncomfortable doing so, I transcribed my own notes on all conversations, but did not record them. Most of my expert interviews, however, I have recorded on phonograms.

In addition to my qualitative interviews, I used several sample surveys and polls for the analysis of irregular Ukrainian female labour migration to Italy. After the national independence of Ukraine, regular surveys were conducted on labour migration by scientific institutions, supported by international organizations such as the International Organization for Migration (IOM) and the International Labour Organization (ILO). The investigations were also statements about the reasons and characteristics of Ukrainian labour migration. Most research, from then and now, does not account for gender aspects

of Ukrainian labour migration flows. A comprehensive systematic study on irregular female labour migration to Italy and women's employment as caregivers is not yet available. Only a few studies are relevant to this topic, and they are usually not performed by the same criteria, so that they only provide information for a specific situation at a particular time, without general statements. Some studies have been conducted unprofessionally leading to incorrect assumptions. A comprehensive study would be highly desirable, and it would also be an important improvement for Ukrainian women in Italy. It might also create greater rationale for better Italian migration policies. Overall, there are only very few meaningful studies on Ukrainian labour migration, and through my multi-perspective approach, I will try to set the best foundations possible for this work, despite the difficult circumstances caused by the lack of information and the inaccurate data situation.

### **3. Migration Theories**

In the current 'age of migration',<sup>6</sup> divergent opinions and theories among different disciplines try to explain the complex phenomenon of labour migration. In order to provide the analytical frame of this dissertation, I will give an introductory overview of relevant migration theories with an economic focus and point out the increasing importance of social factors, which should be considered within the context of transnationalism. In the first part of my dissertation I want to find out the reasons for predominantly female migration flows from Ukraine to Italy. Which factors cause women to leave Ukraine? Why do women almost exclusively choose Italy as their destination country? As economic motives are crucial for labour migration processes from Ukraine to Italy, economic approaches, such as the neoclassical theory of wage disparities and the push-pull model are suitable concepts to examine.

The second part of my thesis will deal with women's situations and experiences in Italy, taking into account the consequences for their families back home in Ukraine. For the rather anthropological approach in the second part of my dissertation, the dichotomy

---

<sup>6</sup> Brettell, Caroline B., Hollifield, James F., eds., Migration Theory: Talking across the disciplines, New York: Routledge, 2000, p.2

of the push-pull model and other economically centred theories, which view migration as a result of economic disparities, will be replaced by ‘transnationalism’, which considers social processes. With its constant reference to Ukraine in migrants’ transnational everyday life social practices and relations, this new paradigm also considers the relevance of migrants’ lives and the complex connections and interrelationships of Ukrainian women in Italy. Additionally, social networks play an important role in respect to transnationalism. In order to grasp the contribution of social networks to migrants’ survival strategies, I will evaluate migration networks, paying special attention to the concept of social capital as a theoretical foundation for networks.

### **3.1 Economic approaches to the question why do Ukrainian women migrate to Italy**

From 1885 to 1889, Ernst G. Ravenstein created a foundation for migration theories, emphasizing the importance of economically motivated mobility. In ‘The Laws of Migration’, he stated that the imbalance of supply and demand on the labour market causes migration. His theory further assumes that movements entail a new wage equilibrium after some time. Income symmetry can only take place under ideal conditions, such as unlimited mobility, though and it is not empirically approved.

Ravenstein was also the first to mention the influence of distance on migration decisions, arguing that migrations to places of shorter distance are more frequent than long- distance migrations. His theory of gravitation refers to these distances: The bigger the distance between two regions, the smaller the migration turnover between the regions. On the other hand, short distances facilitate migration, as travel expenses and dangers increase on long distance movements.<sup>7</sup>

Migration theories from neoclassical economics on the macro level look at larger structures like political, economic, and legal conditions and explain labour migration according to differences in wage levels. According to this top-down approach, market forces make people move from low wage countries to high wage countries, assuming that

---

<sup>7</sup> Dietz, Barbara, ‘Europäische Integration von unten? Mittel – und Osteuropäische Migranten in Deutschland und die Rolle transnationaler Netzwerke im EU- Erweiterungsprozess’, Forost Arbeitspapier Nr. 34, München, November 2005, p. 16. (repeated reference: Dietz, Europäische).

migrants make rational decisions. Rational individuals migrate because their calculation of costs and benefits leads them to expect a positive net return on their human capital. But this view is too simple to conceptualize the complex web of dependencies between labour migrants and the family, the environment, position in the home country, and overall hope for a better life. Economic theories appear only partially applicable for the examination of migration processes because they assume that workers base their decisions solely upon the functioning of the labour market. Migrants do not make calculations in isolation from other factors such as family or friends, and migration involves not only monetary costs but also personal factors like separation from family. To understand how larger forces shape the decisions and actions of individuals and families, classic macroeconomic theory should be expanded through a bottom-up, micro-level approach.

In 1972, Everett S. Lee developed the 'push-pull paradigm', putting the individual micro-level into focus.<sup>8</sup> The approach assumes negative, repulsive economic forces (push factors) in the area of origin cause people to leave, while positive factors in the target areas (pull factors) attract people. According to this theory, migration then takes place if the income expected in the destination country (considering migration costs, such as: travel expenses, information, and psychological costs) is greater than in the country of origin. Individual migration decisions are also influenced by individual demographic characteristics (age, marital status, number of children) and the individual endowment of human capital (education, work experience, language skills).<sup>9</sup> Poverty stimulates labour migration and encourages informality as migration is transformed into a risk-averting strategy. Lee specifies two additional categories, which affect migration decisions: (1) intervening obstacles and (2) personal factors. The issue of intervening obstacles in Lee's theory is noteworthy, particularly when examining irregular labour migration. These obstacles may consist of strict visa requirements for Ukrainian migrant workers or the risk of irregular entry and irregular employment.

---

<sup>8</sup> Lee, Everett, 'Eine Theorie der Wanderung' in Széll, György, ed., Regionale Mobilität, Elf Ansätze, München: Nymphenburger 1972, p. 115-129.

<sup>9</sup> Kalter, Frank, 'Theorien der Migration' in ed. U. Mueller, Handbuch der Demographie 1, Modelle und Methoden, Berlin: Springer, 2000, pp. 444-445 (repeated reference: Kalter, Theorien)

The advancement of economic migration concepts is embodied by the so-called 'New Economics of migration'. In this concept, the family or household becomes the decision-making unit, substituting the neoclassical approach that focuses on the individual migrant. As a result, all migration decisions are made within a family context, and the family reacts to factors like insecurity, poverty, reduction of risks etc. The migration of an individual family member serves to improve the entire family's income. But to regard the family as one decision-making unit often overlooks the uneven distribution of power within families. Some researchers say that close family ties reduce the intention to migrate. Not only the family but also other social relationships at home have an influence on migration decisions. The availability of networks of family and friends to take care of women's children must also be considered when decisions are made to work abroad.<sup>10</sup>

Hoffmann-Nowotny (1970, 1981) mention the issue of status incongruities, which influence migration decisions. To this effect, societal position depends on income, prestige, ethnicity, and education level. People seek to have equilibrium among these, thus if someone has a high level of education they also expect a high income. If these expectations cannot be met, tensions arise between a person's aspirations and the lack of opportunities to fulfil them. The divergence of power, prestige, and income, encourages people to move to other countries to solve or compensate the notion of status incongruity through migration.

The economic aspect still prevails in current migration theories, but a number of migration theories with different perspectives have been developed. In the 1990s, research on migration theory, instead of emphasizing purely economical factors, increasingly drew attention to social criteria like social networks. Migration movements according to these theories are complex social processes, which originate from the actions of individuals on the micro-level as well as from larger structures on the macro level. This is best embodied by 'transnationalism', an approach that best illustrates Ukrainian women's migration to Italy. Transnationalism recognizes that migration is not a simple relocation, but a continuing and complex social reality for migrants, because

---

<sup>10</sup> Information Campaign against Trafficking in Women from Ukraine. Research Report July 1998. International Organization for migration, pp. 9- 20

their 'Lebenswelten' or life stories are influenced by social, economic, non-material, and psychological factors. Research on Transnationalism focuses on processes of cultural exchange and transfer, as well as the situation of individuals and social actors within transnational networks.

### **3.2 Ukrainian women's 'Lebenswelten' or life stories in Italy and Ukraine: The perspective of Transnationalism**

Migration has often been associated with permanency in a new place, as well as irrevocable detachment from the country of origin to which a migrant at most would maintain symbolic belonging. Georg Simmel first mentioned the possibility of time-limitations on the migrant experience in the country of destination, focusing on route rather than on roots, putting the migrant into the role of a potential wanderer. Mobility is an essential strategy developed by individual migrants to resist a decline in their social condition at home and to secure a better standard of life for themselves, as well as for their family members still living in their respective home countries. Instead of emigrating indefinitely, post-modern migrants tend to 'settle in mobility'. Mirjana Morokvasik notes, 'paradoxically their leaving home and going away becomes a strategy for staying at home'.<sup>11</sup>

At the end of the 1980s, the preceding concept of transnational communities was developed, and the everyday lives and practices of migrants outside their home country were conceptualized as an extension of their home country's community. Transnational communities are understood as transborder social fields. In the 1990s, the 'Transnational Turn' in migration theories developed out of discourse on globalization. Transnationalism differs from theories concerning globalization because, according to Smith:

Globalization discourse draws attention to social processes that are  
"largely de-centered from specific national territories", as in the case of

---

<sup>11</sup> Morokvasik, Mirjana, 'Crossing Borders and Shifting Boundaries of Belonging in Post-Wall Europe. A gender Lens', in eds., Berthoin Antal & Quack, Grenzüberschreitung – Grenzziehung, Implikationen für Innovation und Identität, Berlin: Sigma 2006, pp. 7-11 (repeated reference: Morokvasik, Crossing)

Manuel Castell's (1997) discussion of globalization(s) as taking place in a "space of flows", while research on transnational processes depicts transnational social relations as ,anchored in while also transcending one or more nation-states.<sup>12</sup>

The transnationalism perspective acknowledges that migration in times of globalization is not a unidirectional, single movement between the country of origin and the country of destination. Despite different opinions, researchers agree that transnationalism in a broader sense refers to feelings of belonging, cultural affinities, nets of communication, and coherence regarding daily life and work across national borders. In the narrower sense transnationalism indicates durable, structured, insitutionalized relations, which span across the borders of nations and states.

Historically, transnationalism is not a completely new phenomena and does not specify an unitary analytical concept, but rather a perspective on research that shies away from existing fixations on the 'local'. The focus of transnational perspectives is on the increasingly emerging phenomena of transnational social processes and everyday life practices, which are the consequence of international movements of people, goods, ideas, symbols, and information. Sallie Westwood and Annie Phizacklea (2000) explain that transnationalism 'draw[s] attention to the two processes which are simultaneously at work. On the one hand the continuing importance of the nation and the emotional attachments invested in it, and on the other hand those processes such as cross-border migration which are transnational in form'.<sup>13</sup> Actively maintained economic, religious, and political ties with the home country across national borders, characterize the realities of transmigrants. These ties are facilitated by modern communication and transport technologies. Transmigrants do not detach themselves from their place of origin but pursue their economic, cultural, and social activities transnationally. As such

---

<sup>12</sup> Smith, Michael Peter, Transnational Urbanism Locating Globalization, Malden/MA.: Blackwell Publishers, 2000, pp 3ff

<sup>13</sup> Pries, Ludger, Transnationalisierung der sozialen Welt, Frankfurt/Main: Suhrkamp. 2008, pp.7-8  
<[http://www.inccas.de/en/download/publ-2002\\_lp\\_transsozWelt.pdf](http://www.inccas.de/en/download/publ-2002_lp_transsozWelt.pdf) > [accessed 24.03.2010]

movements happen with a certain regularity, crossing spatial distances and borders,<sup>14</sup> their country of origin is linked with the country of settlement over space and time. Comparably, durable transnational configurations of social relations, everyday life practices, systems of symbols, and artefacts are spread among different places. These de-localized social spaces call for new definitions of space, apart from geographical dimensions. The concept of transnational social spaces tries to theoretically grasp this bondage of people and social phenomena to certain geographical spaces, which are in transition due to high mobility and transfers of culture against the background of a nation-state world order. A clear distinction of place of origin and arrival is replaced by plural transnational spaces, putting into focus empirical phenomena of invisible structures of state, legal, and cultural cross-links to which individuals adjust and are involved in as national states as a frame of reference are too limited.

Thomas Faist defines transnational spaces as the pluri-local ties of people, networks, communities and organizations, which exist across several states.<sup>15</sup> Transnational migratory spaces refer critically to the local, limited, and structured, while highlighting the mobile, fluid, and transnational. It should therefore be understood not so much as a geographical-topographical condition, but above all as a result of overlapping social and cultural practices and patterns of representation of social actors.<sup>16</sup>

Ludger Pries divides transnational spaces into several dimensions. One dimension refers to the 'political-legal frames' underlining migration policy and sets the political and legal conditions of transnational social spaces, noting that national states are increasingly interested in controlling and exploiting new transnational links. Further, Pries discusses the importance of the 'substantial infrastructure' of modern and fast communication and transport technologies like the internet, cheap flights, buses, and mobile phones, which permit the constant and quick exchange of communication and movement between the countries of destination and origin at irregular intervals, creating

---

<sup>14</sup> Freitag, Ulrike, 'Translokalisierung als ein Zugang zur Geschichte globaler Verflechtungen.', *H Soz U Kult*, Berlin: Zentrum Moderner Orient, 2005 < <http://hsozkult.geschichte.hu-berlin.de/forum/2005-06-10> > [accessed 20.12.2009].

<sup>15</sup> Faist, Thomas, ed., *Transstaatliche Räume. Politik, Wirtschaft und Kultur in und zwischen Deutschland und der Türkei*, Bielefeld: Transcript Verlag 2000, p.13

<sup>16</sup> Pries, Ludger, 'Transnationale Soziale Räume: Theoretisch-empirische Skizze am Beispiel der Arbeitswanderungen Mexiko – US', in ed.. Ulrich Beck, *Perspektiven der Weltgesellschaft*, Frankfurt a.M.: Suhrkamp 1998, pp. 55-86.

the phenomena of ‘mental presence’ among migrants in their families in the home country and the family’s life at home is shared with the migrant.

In respect to permanent settlement, keeping a connection to the home country is believed to have negative consequence on a migrant’s chance at integration into the receiving society. But the transnationalist perspective challenges this static perspective on migration and praises strong ties with the home country.<sup>17</sup> The base of interrelations and links is the net of social relationship patterns between the areas of origin and destination, sustained by the migrants who develop a system of transnational surviving strategies. The migrant’s ability to sustain mobility becomes the most important aspect of their social capital. The know-how of individuals promotes the formation of networks, which catalyze migration movements, including: legal and irregular.<sup>18</sup>

Transnationalization refers not only to voluntary legal migration but also to clandestine, illegal labour migration. Transmigrants might be able to gain certain benefits from their transnational lifestyles, but they might also encounter disadvantages. Transnational orientations result not only from emotional ties but also out of economic, political, and legal insecurities in the country of settlement.

My research on irregular Ukrainian female caregivers refers to processes of transnationalization ‘from below’, which develops out of everyday life relations and not to transnationalism ‘from above’, such as would be in the case of elites in possession of financial capital or businesses. While transnational lifestyles were once limited to members of elites from politics, science, sports, and culture, today transnationalism has developed into a mass phenomena. The transformational quality of the local should also be kept in mind because when actors return (because the local may be perceived differently after time), they come to changed places as changed persons.

In addition to transnational social spaces, another field of transnationalist research is the development of new, multiple identities due to the restructuring of the relationship to home country and country of settlement over time within the frame of transnationalism. I will not examine this aspect in more depth, because Ukrainian migrants’ identities and perceptions of symbolic and physical locations would open up a

---

<sup>17</sup> Morokvasik, *Crossing*, p. 8.

<sup>18</sup> Morokvasik, *Crossing*, pp.14-19.

large discussion on citizenship, which will not be the focus of this thesis dealing with the life situation of migrants.

Critics of the transnationalism perspective emphasize the danger that ‘new labels are being applied to old processes’.<sup>19</sup> Future transnational research should examine the role of nation states, because transnational processes contain new challenges for national states as they surpass the geographic borders of national states, but at the same time are anchored in national states and are influenced by them. States also profit from transnational migration, for example in the form of remittances, however they encounter dangers as well, such as split loyalties and the inability to control transmigrant activities.<sup>20</sup>

### 3.3 Networks

The concept of networks is closely connected to the theory of transnationalism because it bears in mind all relationships between migrants and ex-migrants in the origin and destination country. In times of globalization, modern communication and transport means increased human mobility and facilitates the creation and preservation of migration networks. Formal and informal channels of transport facilitate the circulation of people and goods, as well as border crossings. Networks are important in the organization and preservation of transnational social spaces because migration networks consist of personal or institutional relationships, which connect the sending country with the receiving country. Transnational networks are the link between macro and micro level and help to understand the relation between the behaviour of individuals and macro-structural conditions.

Exact definitions of social networks vary depending on the discipline and empirical routine. For my research on Ukrainian irregular female migrants in Italy, I propose Massey’s definition to be adequate because it bears in mind the connection of migrants to both worlds in the country of current settlement and ties to the country of

---

<sup>19</sup> Al-Ali, Nadejda/Koser, Khalid, eds., New Approaches to Migration? Transnational communities and the transformation of home, London/New York: Routledge 2002, pp.8 ff.

<sup>20</sup>Pries, Ludger, Transnationalisierung der sozialen Welt, Frankfurt/Main: Suhrkamp. 2008, pp.7-9 < [http://www.inccas.de/en/download/publ-2002\\_lp\\_transdsozwelt.pdf](http://www.inccas.de/en/download/publ-2002_lp_transdsozwelt.pdf) > [accessed 23.01.2010 ]

origin. Massey defines migration networks as 'sets of interpersonal ties that connect migrants, former migrants, and non-migrants in origin and destination areas through ties of kinship, friendship, and shared community origin'.<sup>21</sup> People of different groups are organized in networks of information and assistance across borders and function as gate openers for other potential migrants. Existing social networks facilitate movements between the two countries and allow the exchange of goods, money, remittances, information, and cultural symbols. The probability of successful migration increases with the level of social relationships of people abroad and depends to a high extent upon the quality of networks. With the concept of social capital, networks' influence on the behaviour of actors can be determined as it represents the missing link between individual decisions and emerging migration processes. The social capital perspective shifts the primary focus to the character of people's relationship patterns in networks and analyses social relationships according to their benefits on the meso-level, between the macro and micro-level.

The concept of social networks is theoretically founded in the social capital approach, which is not only a main pillar for social sciences but also popular in economics and political science. At the beginning of 1980, Bourdieu made the first step towards conceptualizing social capital when he theorized the different types of capital people possess, namely economic (property), cultural (education), symbolic (prestige) and social capital (relationships with relatives and friends). According to Bourdieu, a person's degree of capital decides their possibilities and the limits of their social mobility. Hence, the general idea of social capital signifies the embedding of a person into social relationships; it is a resource, which is formed out of personal relations. Additionally, belonging to a social network is a key element in migration to reduce risks, cope with crises, fulfil needs, and improve living conditions. The more social contacts a person has available, the higher the social capital will turn out to be, and if one has many close relationships abroad, it is all the more likely their migration decision will be positive. 22

But social capital is not a natural condition. For the creation and preservation of social capital the individual has to invest in it and devote time to networking. This view

---

<sup>21</sup> Massey, Douglas, 'An Evaluation of International Migration Theory: The North American Case', in Population and Development Review, no. 20, 1994, p.p. 699-751.

<sup>22</sup> Dietz, Europäische, pp. 61-64.

draws again on Bourdieu, who views the net of relations as the product of individual or collective strategies of investment, which are intentionally or unintentionally directed towards the establishment and maintenance of social relations, which sooner or later promise a direct benefit.

The social relationships of migrants with relatives and friends are often the only reliable and trustworthy support due to the migrant's lack of experience and language knowledge, which correlates with theories of migration networks and transnationalism. The risks and costs of migration for potential migrant workers are significantly reduced through relatives or friends providing information and psychological and material support for migration and adaptation to the receiving society. People who have only a limited endowment of human, financial, and material capital, as well as scarce institutional frames such as social security allowances or insufficient insurance, to a large extent dependent on informal social networks.

As a result of the strong and weak relationship patterns found to exist within networks, Woolcock argues that multi-dimensionality is a prominent feature of social capital. Networks can be divided between horizontal and vertical network structures depending on the form of bonding, bridging or linking social capital. The 'bonding' as well as the 'bridging' type of social capital are apparent on the horizontal level. Bonding social capital comprises the relationships of relatives, family, or emotional relations (ethnic, religious or friendship ties), which are shaped by daily interaction and are based on trust, reciprocity, and solidarity. Bridging social capital relationships are with people who have the same needs or goals and a reciprocal collaboration brings advantages for everybody, for example with colleagues at work or collectives. Connection lines proceed horizontally between people with similar demographic characteristics like social and economical status and position.

The involvement of people in formal institutional frames or persons in positions of power such as politicians or credit grantors, who could be useful for economical activities, are placed in the category of vertically structured social capital. This multidimensional approach shows that the individual outcome depends on the different combinations of the three types of social capital possible. People in possession of tight

bonding networks, for example, might only have little social capital because their contacts have limited capital.

Migration is a self-sustaining process. Due to the creation and containment of networks migration flows it can be maintained relatively independent of economic or political factors, such as visa restrictions. The term 'cumulative causation' (Massey 1990) refers to this coherence, which considers that the factors sustaining a migration flow might be different from those initiating it. Networks create a 'snowball effect' as they stabilize or even expand migration flows, even if the factors which started the migration process have already passed. Based on social networks and social capital, migration develops into chain migration, meaning 'migration causes migration'.<sup>23</sup> Thus, pioneer migrants cause other migrants to follow. As a consequence, transportation and communication structures are enlarged and migration industries and businesses are set up. Additionally, networks are often enlarged in the country of destination by new contacts. Chain migration brings a historical dimension to migration and requires the continuity of relationships and communication between expatriates and people remaining in the home country.

It should not be forgotten that networks can have positive, supporting effects, but they can also enhance negative consequences. Dagsputa reveals the ambivalence of social networks, arguing that 'social networks can be a help or a hindrance, it all depends on the uses to which networks are put'. Social relationship patterns might limit individuals or even be counter-productive for the realization of their goals and projects. As marginalized individuals are dependent upon services, but suffer from duties and compromises, they are in danger of dependency, exclusion, corruption, and exploitation. Solidarity is an essential requirement for the success of networks. But if networks are too strong or weak, they can have contradictory effects on migrants' financial situations. A lack of solidarity can lead to a loss in trust and initiate the breakdown of networks.

---

<sup>23</sup>Haug, Sonja und Pichler Edith, 'Soziale Netzwerke und Transnationalität: Neue Ansätze für die historische Migrationsforschung', in Motte, Ohliger, von Oswald, 50 Jahre Bundesrepublik - 50 Jahre Einwanderung: Nachkriegsgeschichte als Migrationsgeschichte, Frankfurt am Main, New York: Campus 1999 pp. 260- 264.

Membership in a social network can be a tightrope walk and entail strong economic and non-economic duties and dependencies, which lower individual success.<sup>24</sup>

To summarize my hypothesis deriving from the theoretical outlines above: I argue that economic needs in connection with strong networks facilitate migration to Italy, and are the main reason why women leave their home country. A high demand for irregular caregivers to the elderly and high (expected) wages are pull factors, which explain female migration flows to Italy. Further, I propose that aspects of transnationalism characterize women's daily lives in Italy as they stay constantly connected to their family's at home. My research on irregular labour migration from Ukraine to Italy must also consider gender. Feminist critique notes that due to specific difficulties female migrants encounter, men and women experience migration differently. In my thesis I will carefully consider gender specific divisions of labour and power.

#### **4. Definitions**

*Labour migration* is a movement to find paid work and represents the most important form of economically motivated migration. Characteristics, in contrast to migration out of alignment, include the free decision to migrate and the goal to improve the income and standard of life through an occupation abroad.<sup>25</sup>

#### *Irregularity / irregular migration*

In accordance with the recommendation of the International Labour Organization (ILO) I will to use the term '*Irregular*' migration/migrants in my dissertation in order not to imply the commitment of a serious crime, but simply the violation of legal provisions of stay, because the widespread term of 'illegal immigrants' is highly afflicted with political

---

<sup>24</sup> Hertlein, Stephanie, Soziale Netzwerke als Beitrag zur Überlebenssicherung, Magisterarbeit SS 2008 an der Universität Freiburg. <<http://www.freidok.uni-freiburg.de/volltexte/6798/>> [accessed 06.04.2010].

(repeated reference: Hertlein, Soziale)

<sup>25</sup> <[http://www.sanktgeorgen.de/nbi/pdf/vorlesung\\_weltwirtschaft/CGEth\\_WWethik\\_Vorl\\_WiSe05\\_06\\_1\\_6\\_bis\\_1\\_8.pdf](http://www.sanktgeorgen.de/nbi/pdf/vorlesung_weltwirtschaft/CGEth_WWethik_Vorl_WiSe05_06_1_6_bis_1_8.pdf)> [accessed 06.04.2010].

and ideological stigmatizations (Frank Düvell).<sup>26</sup> The correct label for labour migrants not working in accordance with the rules is controversial. In some languages the term ‘undocumented’ is commonly used (such as the Spanish term ‘sin papeles’).

Labour migration can be divided according to the length of time spent abroad. According to UN definitions, temporary labour migration refers to all short-term stays abroad not exceeding 3-12 months (seasonal employees for example). Permanent long-term labour migration is characterized by working and living abroad for more than a year.<sup>27</sup> As most stays of irregular migrants from the Ukraine are rather long in order to earn back the migration costs, they belong to the latter characterization.

#### *‘Badanti’*

The Italian word “*bandante*” means caregiver to the elderly and is commonly used in Italy in reference to female migrants pursuing this type of work.<sup>28</sup>

### **III) Empirical Research**

#### **5. The socio-economic background in Ukraine causing female labour migration**

##### **5.1 Economic push factors**

The socio-economic conditions in Ukraine worsened rapidly after the breakdown of the Soviet Union and Ukraine’s independence in 1991. To this day many people, especially women, suffer the consequences of the still ongoing transformation process from communism to capitalism, causing high unemployment rates, low salaries and big income

---

<sup>26</sup>Jünschke, Klaus, Zur Kriminalisierung der "Illegalen". Warum Fremdenfeindlichkeit und Rassismus geschürt werden. *Neue Rheinische Zeitung*, Beitrag des Online-Flyers Nr. 57, 15.08.2006, <[http://www.proasyl.de/fileadmin/proasyl/fm\\_redakteure/Newsletter\\_Anhaenge/115/kriminalisierung\\_illegalen.pdf](http://www.proasyl.de/fileadmin/proasyl/fm_redakteure/Newsletter_Anhaenge/115/kriminalisierung_illegalen.pdf)> [accessed 03.04.2010].

<sup>27</sup> World Migration Report 2008/Chapt. 8, <<http://www.iom.int/jahia/Jahia/pid/600>>. [accessed 11.05.2010]

<sup>28</sup>.*Studi Emigrazione* p. 562

gaps.<sup>29</sup> In 1992, the privatization process was started, however, many reforms were unsuccessful, and only a thin stratum of oligarchs obtained profit out of restructuring the economy.

Due to oligarchs' involvement in corruption and politics they were able to grab big parts of national property between 1991 and 1998. During the year of hyperinflation in 1993 prices rose by 4735% in comparison to the previous year and large parts of the population lost their savings and sank into poverty. Despite a slight recovery of the economy around the year 2000 with a constant grow of about 5-7% each year and a decline in unemployment figures; in 2006 the GDP only amounted to 40% of the GDP from 1990.<sup>30</sup> The economic crisis at the second half of 2008 hit Ukraine hard, and in 2009 the economy shrank by 15 percent and the Ukrainian currency 'Hryvnia' dropped almost 40 percent against the US Dollar. In contemporary Ukraine, corruption and political arbitrariness hinder economic development, resulting in low productivity and investment rates, power insufficiency and unfavorable market structures. The small circle of oligarchs controlling wide parts of the economy blocks the emergence of a free-enterprise system and therefore the creation of jobs and the formation of a middle class.

The economy's downfall and the shrinking of living standards sped up the demographic crisis in Ukraine. Excessive labour emigration, high mortality and suicide rates, and a drop in fertility rates have led to a severe decline in population. Life expectancy sank continuously from an average of 71 years in 1970 to 68 in 2008.<sup>31</sup> In 2000-2005, Ukraine had the third quickest decline in population in the world according to UNICEF<sup>32</sup> Over the last ten years Ukraine has lost around four million people, and each year the Ukrainian population diminishes by nearly 1 percent.<sup>33</sup>

In reference to the area it covers, Ukraine is Europe's biggest country after Russia, but

---

<sup>29</sup> Zimmer, Kerstin, 'Ein staendiges Kommen und Gehen. Die Rolle der Ukraine im europäisichen Migrationssystem', Geographische Rundschau 12/2007, Westermann (Braunschweig) p.40. (repeated reference: Zimmer, Ein ständiges)

<sup>30</sup> <Unicef, Ukraine At a Glance <[www.unicef.org/ukraine/about.html](http://www.unicef.org/ukraine/about.html) > [accessed 20.04.2010]

<sup>31</sup> < [http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/ukraine\\_statistics.html](http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/ukraine_statistics.html)>[accessed 20.04.2010]

<sup>32</sup> Unicef, Teltschik, A., a. others, Most-at-Risk-adolescents: the evidence base for strengthening the HIV response in Ukraine, < [http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/ukraine\\_statistics.html](http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/ukraine_statistics.html)>[accessed 6.05.2010]

<sup>33</sup> Unicef, Ukraine, Child Health and Development <[www.unicef.org/ukraine/activities\\_4941.html](http://www.unicef.org/ukraine/activities_4941.html)> [accessed 26.04.2010]

also the third poorest nation of the continent after Moldova and Albania.<sup>34</sup> Today almost 30 percent of 47 million Ukrainians live below the poverty line of 430 Hryvnia, about 90 Dollars, per person a month. According to the United Nations, almost one third of the Ukrainian population lived below the poverty line in 2008.<sup>35</sup>

### 5.1.1 Women in labour in Ukraine

In the following section I will present examples of women's income, labour and legal situation in order to explain why Ukrainian female migration from Ukraine is primarily economically motivated.<sup>36</sup> Additional noteworthy push factors comprise societal pressures from gender roles and individual living aspirations pointed out in the last sections of this chapter.

#### *Wages*

The economic and social background in Ukraine is to a large extent the cause for Ukrainian female labor migration movements. Income disparities between Ukraine and the countries of the European Union are the most crucial factor for people to migrate legally and irregularly. In comparison with EU-neighbors, income differences are huge: In Western European states like Italy the average income constitutes 2000 Euros.<sup>37</sup>

Ukraine's incoming remittances increased from \$33 million US dollars in 2000 to \$595 million US dollars in 2005 according to the World Bank, deriving from high migration activities.<sup>38</sup>

The minimal income in 2007 was about 400 UAH, about \$80 US Dollars per month.<sup>39</sup> According to 'PROUA', a press service of the State Statistical Committee of Ukraine, average salary was about 1421 UAH (200 Euros) in 2007. In many sectors people do not

---

<sup>34</sup> Flückiger, Paul, Payer, Margarete, `Ukraine`, *Die Zeit*, 02/2005 < <http://www.zeit.de/2005/02/Ukraine> > [ access 06.04.2010 ]

<sup>35</sup> Zimmer, *Ein ständiges* p. 40.

<sup>36</sup> < <http://www.cap-lmu.de/aktuell/meldungen/2007/mobilitaet-migration.php> < [access: 23.04.2009].

<sup>37</sup> <<http://www.frankfurt-main.ihk.de/international/auslandsmaerkte/laenderkontakte/g-k/italien/>> [access: 23.04.2009].

<sup>38</sup> Dietz, *Europäische*. p. 16.

<sup>39</sup> *Kiev guide*, How much does it cost? <<http://www.go2kiev.com/view/costs.html>> [accessed 28.04.2010]

even earn \$100 US Dollars per month although living costs are almost as high as in Western Europe. For example, in 2007, average salary in health and education sector varies around 600-800 UAH.<sup>40</sup> Especially on the countryside and in Western Ukraine salaries are low. Ukraine is classified as a 'Lower Middle Income' country, and a low wage country by the World Bank. Even when salaries seemed to rise, high rates of inflation (11.3 percent in 2007) shrank the real amount of income.<sup>41</sup> In particular, low-income figures apply to female workers.<sup>42</sup> The average salary of women constitutes only 50 percent to 70 percent of the salaries of men.<sup>43</sup> Even in jobs for low-skilled workers, Ukrainian women can earn more money in the EU than if working in a high position for their average salary in Ukraine.

### *Labor market situation*

Notwithstanding a low demand for work force on the labour market in the period of transformation, the cutback of work force was little in comparison to the decline of production. Ukrainian unemployment figures are similar to the average number of unemployed in the EU, which underlines the importance of income disparities to explain labour migration. The current economic crisis also has consequences on unemployment figures; while official statistics stated an unemployment rate of 3 percent in 2008, it was expected to reach 9 percent in 2009. Official statistics are unreliable, as they comprise only people registered as unemployed. The Ukrainian state does not pay any social benefits for people out of work; therefore many people have no reason to register as unemployed. The International labour organization assumes a real unemployment rate of 9.9 percent in 2009 compared to 6.8 percent in 2008.<sup>44</sup> High unemployment rates affect both genders, but female unemployment figures are almost twice as high as men (2008),

---

<sup>40</sup> Ukraine analysen, No.16 < [www.laender-analysen.de/ukraine/pdf/2006/UkraineAnalysen16.pdf](http://www.laender-analysen.de/ukraine/pdf/2006/UkraineAnalysen16.pdf) >, pp.2ff. (accessed 07.04.2010).

<sup>41</sup> AHK, Delegation der Deutschen Wirtschaft in der Ukraine <<http://ukraine.ahk.de/index.php?id=423>> [accessed 28.04.2010]

<sup>42</sup> International Organization for Migration (IOM). Labour Migration Assesment for the WNIS Region. IOM Publication, Februar 2006. p. 4.

<sup>43</sup> UN, Labour markets in transition countries, Gender aspects need more attention, Geneva: Press release 07.05.2002 <[www.un.org/womenwatch/osagi/pdf/pressopa08eH.PDF](http://www.un.org/womenwatch/osagi/pdf/pressopa08eH.PDF)> [ accessed 01.05.2010]

<sup>44</sup> Human Rights Watch, Women's Work August 26, <2003,<http://www.hrw.org/reports/2003/ukraine0803/>> [ accessed 06.05.2010]

even though women constitute about half of the work in Ukraine.<sup>45</sup> In all former Soviet countries female occupation used to be much higher in Soviet times, but when it fell apart and factories were closed, primarily women lost their jobs.<sup>46</sup> As a consequence, women were driven out of the labour market and repelled to the domestic sphere, especially in Ukraine. The independence and national revival in Ukraine coincided with the economic crisis and today withdrawing women en masse from the work force eases the unemployment crisis and bolsters patriarchy by rendering women dependent and subordinate to men.<sup>47</sup>

### *Decision making positions*

Although Ukrainian women have the same access to universities and schools as men and are often better educated than men they are not able to gain benefits out of their professional skills on the Ukrainian job market. Statistics show that women have worse career chances on the Ukrainian labour market and high positions in the state and the economy. The sexes are thus divided by work sphere and position. Women are mainly employed in low wage sectors, such as: care, education, retail, and catering, while men mainly find work in the transport and construction industry, or in finance, science and production.

In executive positions women are extremely underrepresented, even in sectors in which women constitute the major portion of employees. In comparison to other states in Europe, Ukraine has a very low representation of women in higher positions in the state and economics, which creates a gender imbalance in political decision-making processes. Ukrainian law does not comprehend any provisions to keep women from higher positions but more than 70 percent of all employees in public administration are women, but only 20 percent of women occupy leadership positions,<sup>48</sup> which makes it difficult for them to articulate and solve their problems in a male dominated society.

---

<sup>45</sup> <<http://www.ukrstat.gov.ua/>> and <<http://www.interfax.com.ua/eng/eco/8383/>> (accessed 07.04.2010).

<sup>46</sup> Human Rights Watch, Women's Work August 26, <2003,<http://www.hrw.org/reports/2003/ukraine0803/>> [accessed 06.05.2010]

<sup>47</sup> Füllsack, Manfred, Postsowjetische Gesellschaft. Desintegration, Marktwirtschaft, Nationalismus und die Stellung der Frau in Rußland. Turia + Kant, Vienna 1996. p. 114-115. (repeated reference: Füllsack, Postsowjetische)

<sup>48</sup> <<http://blog.kievukraine.info/2006/09/womens-groups-gather-in-kyiv-to-decry.html>> [accessed: 19.02.2009]

After the parliamentary elections in March 2006, only 39 out of 450 seats were held by women. The emphasis on women's duties at home is often used to exclude women from high positions. Even the 'glamorous' exception Yulia Tymoshenko, the Orange Revolution heroine and former prime minister, emphasized her 'motherhood qualities' during her election campaigns.

### **5.1.2 Women's economic motivation**

High female unemployment and low salaries result in an increasing 'feminization of poverty'. Especially women suffer from the cutbacks in health care and the social welfare system following the breakdown of the USSR.<sup>49</sup> However, poverty has proven to be an inadequate explanation for migration. In his book, *Birds of Passage: Migrant Labour and Industrial Societies*, Piore argues that sending countries are not typically those with the lowest income, which would provide the largest wage differentials.<sup>50</sup> The theory of social capital confirms this assumption on the micro-level, hence rather lower middle class members are active in migration, not Ukrainians living in extreme poverty because they have more ability to access social networks for support and financial means to cover travel expenses (cf. Chapter 3 on Migration Theories). The results of a recent IOM-survey among women reveal this coherence as middle class women in stable job conditions showed a surprisingly higher willingness to work temporarily abroad than other groups.<sup>51</sup> In the State Statistical Committee Study, 63.4 percent of the respondents with migration backgrounds considered their financial situation as average but only 13 percent as bad. However, in this coherence migrant households might have already benefited from remittances from their migrated family members at the time of the survey. Nevertheless, non-migrants live significantly more often in very poor conditions in Ukraine than families of people who migrated for labour.<sup>52</sup> George Gigauri (IOM Kiev)

---

<sup>49</sup> Füllsack,, *Postsowjetische* p. 105-106.

<sup>50</sup> Piore, Michael J., *Birds of Passage: Migrant Labor and Industrial Societies*, New York: Cambridge University Press 1979, p. 8.

<sup>51</sup> International Organization for Migration (IOM). *Labour Migration Assesment for the WNIS Region*. IOM Publication, Februar 2006 p.12.

<sup>52</sup> Dietz, Barbara, 'Migrationen in der Ukraine: Hintergründe und Trends. Ergebnisse einer Haushaltsbefragung', *Kurzanalysen und Informationen* Nr.29, 12/2007, Osteuropa- Institut Regensburg, p.7 (repeated reference: Dietz, *Migrationen* )

confirms the economic situation of households, which Ukrainian migrants come from is very difficult but not dramatic in contrast to really poor people in Ukraine. Also, labour migrants I interviewed came rather from middle class homes than from very poor social strata, as the biggest obstacle to relocation is to procure money for migration costs. Many people invest a tremendous sum into the migration project compared to Ukrainian salaries. Ukrainians with the high social capital of good social networks have the advantage of not incurring debts because family members and friends.<sup>53</sup>

The term 'cumulative causation' of migration by Douglas S. Massey (1990) assumes that factors keeping up migration might change over time and be different to those initiating it,<sup>54</sup> which transferred to Ukrainian migration goals proves this coherence: While in the 1990s migration had the function to secure family survival, migration today serves in particular for the 'well-being'.<sup>55</sup> This does not mean to buy luxury goods, but considers all expenses, which exceed a minimum of basic needs. With an average Ukrainian salary, it appears to be impossible to solve financial problems of any kind. Economic motives have shifted from the pure compensation of household expenses and pure financial hardships to financing the improvement of the standard of living, education for children, renovations, homes, and health care. The Ukrainian state does not provide basic social services or health care and no national health insurance system exists, therefore citizens have to solve economic and medical problems on their own.<sup>56</sup> Ukrainians coming to the EU do not pursue labour migration out of a state of utmost emergency, but in comparison to EU people, those in Ukraine are still very poor. Ukrainians also perceive themselves to be poor, almost 80% perception have identified themselves as living in poverty.<sup>57</sup> Therefore, poverty is connected to migration, but the level of poverty has

---

<sup>53</sup> Radioni, Adil, 'Le assistenti domiciliari ucraine in Italia e a Roma', Osservatorio Romano sulle migrazioni. Quinto rapporto. Caritas di Roma. Edizione IDOS. Roma 2009. pp.245-248. [repeated reference Radioni, Osservatorio]

<sup>54</sup> Massey, Douglas S., 'Social Structure, Household Strategies, and the Cumulative Causation of Migration' Population Index, Vol. 56, No. 1, Spring, 1990, pp. 3-26

<sup>55</sup> Ministry of Labour and Social Policy of Ukraine. International Labour Office (2005). P. 66.

<sup>56</sup> <[www.laenderanalysen.de/dlcounter/dlcounter.php?url=../ukraine/pdf/2008/UkraineAnalysen34.pdf](http://www.laenderanalysen.de/dlcounter/dlcounter.php?url=../ukraine/pdf/2008/UkraineAnalysen34.pdf)> [accessed 14.03.2010].

<sup>57</sup> <[www.laenderanalysen.de/dlcounter/dlcounter.php?url=../ukraine/pdf/2008/UkraineAnalysendf](http://www.laenderanalysen.de/dlcounter/dlcounter.php?url=../ukraine/pdf/2008/UkraineAnalysendf)> p.34 [accessed 14.03.2010].

decreased and economic aims have marginally increased from bare existence to the claim for basic living standards.

Usually no exactly planned migration project stands at the beginning Ukrainian women's labour migration project. Migration goals and consequently investments of migration money differ between the sexes: Ukrainian men invest their salaries into consumer goods while female migrants prefer to invest their money into the acquisition or renovation of a house or flat in Ukraine for themselves and their family or to finance their children's education. To improve standards of living through economic contributions in any possible way is the idea at the base of female labour migration motivation.<sup>58</sup> Ukrainian women's objective is to support their children and family indirectly, which implies women's motivation for labour migration as a mother role and vision, as will be outlined out in the following sections.

## **5.2 Non- economic push factors**

### **5.2.1 Legal situation**

Women are the 'majority who are discriminated against', not only on the labour market, but also by legal frameworks. Ukraine has signed several international treaties to abolish the 'de jure discrimination' of women in accordance with international human rights and Ukrainian legislation corresponds to democratic standards and guarantees gender equality. But some laws to protect women are juxtaposed to principles of gender equality and 'de-facto' discriminates against them and lowers their chances on the labour market. Social guarantees for women exceed the recommendations of the International Labor Organization (ILO) for women in labour, which in praxis hinder them to participate in the job market, as they make women expensive and unattractive for the job market. Employers' difficult financial situations and unofficial labour arrangements are often not able to afford the financing of long maternity leaves and social benefits for women, as salaries are sometimes not even paid on time. High benefits and labour rights for women by law are frequently useless as a functioning state mechanism to ensure the enforcement

---

<sup>58</sup> Radioni, *Osservatorio* pp. 252-253 246.

of gender equality in Ukraine is absent. Often women's protection laws are ignored or unknown by employees. In the application process, women are singled out due to employers preference for male workers, not only because they are thought to have more market suitable skills and are not burdened by domestic duties, but also they are not 'excessively burdened by social privileges'.<sup>59</sup> Some laws prohibit women certain work under 'too dangerous and hazardous' conditions and excludes them from some jobs and professions. The interpretation of laws is given to the employee and to define conditions of 'too dangerous for females health' often depends upon prevailing stereotypes about men and women. The concepts of protection of motherhood inherited from Soviet times have made women's labour less competitive under new market conditions. Job ads often directly address only men as they are considered to offer market suitable qualities, like aggressiveness, rationality, and independence. Additionally, many employers believe that women are not able to fulfil their work due to their duties in the family or because of the possibility that they might become pregnant. In a market economy based on competition, such stereotypes make women appear to be less efficient and reliable due to their 'natural' domestic and maternal responsibilities.<sup>60</sup> The post- soviet labour market has a 'male face'.<sup>61</sup> Female participation on the labour market has not led to a transformation of family structures, and contemporary attitudes towards women have severe effects on possible employment.

### **5.2.2 Female gender roles**

The breakdown of socialism and the turmoil of transition not only led to economic and social changes, but also ideological and cultural voids had to be filled with new contents. Genuine Ukrainian identity was considered through a revaluation of gender roles and a return to the social institution of the family. The collapse of socialism has created the conditions for idealizing traditional family models,<sup>62</sup> which are victimized under

---

<sup>59</sup> „Kyiv Post“ from 6. September 2007, p. 22.

<sup>60</sup> Füllsack, Postsowjetische p. 114-115.

<sup>61</sup> Marsh, Rosalind (Editor), Women in Russia and Ukraine, in Cambridge University Press. Cambridge, 1996, p. 255 (repeated reference: Mash, Women)

<sup>62</sup> Füllsack, Postsowjetische, p. 114-115.

contemporary economic and social circumstances in Ukraine.<sup>63</sup> The shift to a market economy is accompanied by societal discriminations against women. The so-called 'national revival' is also a 'revival of masculine culture'.<sup>64</sup> The denigration of the strong woman worker celebrated in the first decade of Soviet rule, gave rise to a 'massive re-masculinization' of Ukraine and power to the new male entrepreneur.

The transition from traditional to contemporary family in Ukraine is still ongoing, but in Ukraine the gender roles women and men take in private and in public are shaped by traditional views on femininity and masculinity, deeply embedded in society. In contemporary family models, the functions of men and women overlap, while in traditional family models men take the role as the breadwinner and head of the household and the woman fulfils the role of housewife and mother.<sup>65</sup> The traditional division of gender roles and the 'natural' domestic inequality in Ukrainian households<sup>66</sup> is in danger if women participate in public and political life.

Ukrainian family policy in contemporary Ukraine is a mixture of Soviet concepts and neo-liberal ideas. On the one hand, politics commit to gender equality and combat discrimination against women, but on the other hand they stress conservative ideology about women's natural predestination for maternity and the importance of family. Already the Soviet Union officially was committed to gender equality rooted in Marxist theory, but in fact the communist regime subordinated gender specific needs to male controlled political agendas and introduced reforms, which addressed gender patterns and the division of labour. During communism women were part of the workforce, but their participation in the labour market did not lead to a transformation of family structures.<sup>67</sup> These contradictions were kept until the present day.

---

<sup>63</sup> Bohachevsky-Chomiak, Marta: Feminists despite themselves. Women in Ukrainian Community Life 1884-1939. Canadian Institute of Ukrainian Studies. University of Alberta 1988, p. Xxii. (repeated reference: Bohachevsky, Feminists)

<sup>64</sup> Mash, Women, p.16.

<sup>65</sup> Koval, Vitalina: Women in contemporary Russia, Providence: Berghahn Books 1995, p. 77- 78. (repeated reference: Koval, Women)

<sup>66</sup> Koval, Women, p.78.

<sup>67</sup> Mash, Women, p. 322 ff.

Another contradictory element in political approaches in Ukraine is the protection of motherhood, especially by a legal framework, but at the same time a neo-liberal discourse on family autonomy. In independent Ukraine, the renovation of the traditionally strong Ukrainian family and images of ‘the allegedly, pure, maternal, self- sacrificial features of the traditional Ukrainian woman’ are incorporated into the nationalist discourse in the state, society and media and function as important elements of nation building. In Soviet times the Ukrainian family fulfilled the function as a preserver of cultural autonomy of the Ukrainian nation against the encroachment of the communist state.<sup>68</sup> ‘The Ukrainian state must save itself in the family’ was and is a propagated political slogan.<sup>69</sup>

The family is the place to survive for the individual in an economically difficult situation, but it is also the site for national collective survival. To be Ukrainian means to be the bearer of a special ‘family mentality’.<sup>70</sup> The commitment of Ukrainians to family lifestyle and values is the defining element of female identity in independent Ukraine referring to the concept of a God given, natural predisposition of women for motherhood. Motherhood as the highest expression of femininity expects women to care for their children and to support their husbands physically and emotionally in their role of the ‘loving wife’. Women identify themselves in traditional terms, which partly explains the absence of feminism in Ukraine.<sup>71</sup> Ukrainian women’s identity is constructed in opposition to Russian and Western women and feminism. Russian women are viewed to be and to have always been restricted by patriarchal norms, while women in Ukraine assume hidden leadership in families, which makes feminism appear superfluous.

In contrast to egoistic traits attributed to Western women, Ukrainian women are accredited with putting their focus on the wellbeing of their family, and not into gender equality.<sup>72</sup> The main motive for Ukrainian women’s social and political activities is

---

<sup>68</sup> Bohachevsky, Feminists, P. Xxii.

<sup>69</sup> Zhurzenko, Tatiana, Strong women, Weak State: Family Politics and Nation Building in Post Soviet Ukraine, in Kuehnast, Kathleen and Nechemias, Carol: Post- Soviet Women Encountering Transition. Nation Building, Economic Survival and Civic Activism. Woodrow Wilson Center Press, Washington D.C. 2004. p. 28-29 (repeated reference: Zhurzenko, Strong)

<sup>70</sup> Zhurzenko, Strong, p. 28 ff.

<sup>71</sup> Mash, Women, p. 320

<sup>72</sup> Zhurzenko, Strong, p. 29- 31

altruism, deriving from their mother role-vision. The woman, who places her family above own wellbeing, is socially accepted and any professional activity is reasonable if it contribute to the wellbeing of their children and the family.<sup>73</sup> The same logic applies to female migration activities. The traditional cult of motherhood and the predisposed 'natural' female self-sacrificing nature makes it a maternal obligation for women to go abroad and send money home to the family suffering from harsh conditions as they bear ultimate responsibility for the family's survival and stability. Even though the ideal family model requires women to stay at home and fulfil their domestic duties, the pressures of chaotic economic conditions force them to devote all her time and power to the wellbeing of their families by working abroad. The symbols of exalted motherhood are deeply internalized by Ukrainians, but it is illusory to see such glorified traditions as representations of today's reality. Economic realities in Ukraine, which are so distinct from romanticized national ideals, seem to give no alternative other than female labour migration.<sup>74</sup> The inversion of traditional gender roles through labour migration, making women become the 'breadwinner' has emancipatory effects. Women earning money abroad transfer financial power from the man to the woman in the family. Women gain self-confidence through a successful migration project and emancipate themselves from traditional Ukrainian family structures and gender roles. Also daily life and gender roles in their destination country influence Ukrainian women. Female labour migration creates new tension and conflicts in the relationship between the genders as the distribution of power and tasks in the households might be affected by the experience of migration after women's return. A 'silent emancipation' takes place. To explore the changes family patterns in Ukraine caused by the impacts of migration would go beyond the scope of this work, but will be mentioned in Chapter 9.4.

Besides the wish of women to fulfil their societal expected gender role, some women also view their labour migration project from the very beginning as an emancipatory endeavour for their own life. The decision to migrate in search of labour is accompanied by the hope to find Western husband. While men still view their migration project as part

---

<sup>73</sup> Mash, Women, p. 316-323.

<sup>74</sup> Mash, Women, P. 262-263.

of their traditional breadwinner role, Ukrainian women tend to migrate not only because of their problematic economical situation, like discrimination, domestic violence and sexual harassment. Between 50 percent and 70 percent of Ukrainian women have experienced domestic violence in their families and about 20 percent are constantly affected by it. Additionally, about half of all women have been victims of sexual harassment at their workplace.<sup>75</sup> Marta Chumalo, president of the West Ukrainian Centre, 'Women's Perspectives', in Lviv, which supports female Ukrainian labour migrants who return to reintegrate into Ukrainian society, explains that domestic violence is regarded as a 'family matter' in Ukrainian society. That the husband beating his wife is part of normal family life, and is reflected in the Ukrainian saying: 'if he beats her, he loves her'.

Besides excessive demands on women in Ukraine to shoulder the double burden of household and children in addition to a full-time occupation results in an escape from Ukrainian gender roles through migration. Many women are exhausted from their integration into the workforce while shoulder the domestic burden alone and view it as a luxury if the woman can stay at home and care for the children. Generally couples have to work to make a living, but women take the double burden of responsibility for the household and upbringing of children, while having an occupation. Women have to work, but are dependent upon their husbands due to the fact that their income is not sufficient to make a living.<sup>76</sup> Often women are in the position to finance the family on their own, as a 'masculinity crisis' has taken over Ukraine.<sup>77</sup> The former breadwinner of the family is often unemployed or poorly paid, demoralized and irresponsible in family matters. The 'husband demands that wife should work hard without expecting any of life's pleasures' expects his wife to put up with it all and to shoulder the domestic burden alone. Women bore ultimate responsibility not only for marital stability and children's education, but also for the entire gamut of male activity and sobriety.<sup>78</sup> Some women leave for Italy

---

<sup>75</sup> Human Rights Watch, On the Margin of Profit, Rights at Risk in the Global Economy, Vol. 20, No. 3(G), 02/2008 <<http://www.hrw.org/reports/2003/ukraine0803/3.htm>> .[accessed 11.04.2010].

<sup>76</sup> Unicef, Ukraine, Child Health and Development <[www.unicef.org/ukraine/activities\\_4941.html](http://www.unicef.org/ukraine/activities_4941.html)> [accessed 26.04.2010]

<sup>77</sup> Marsh, women p. 324ff.

<sup>78</sup> Mash, Women, p. 244- 246.

with marriage aspirations, hoping for a better, easier life with an Italian husband. The western lifestyle presented in the media, makes many Ukrainian women believe in the 'Western paradise', offering them relief from female obligations at the expense of pleasure and a way out of the 'masculinity crisis' in Ukraine, as 'Italians are crazy for (blonde) Ukrainian women'.<sup>79</sup> During all my stays, I met people in Ukraine who have overcastted imaginations about paradisiacal life in the EU and to fail in these countries is not accepted. Acceptance for irregular movements is very high in Ukrainian society. However, the seductions of the West should not be overestimated as for many women the expected higher income abroad is the main pull-factor.<sup>80</sup> The limited possibilities for women on the labour market demonstrates the connection between current constructions of female gender roles and its impact on women's lives and migration reasons.

As the latter explained societal 'migration pressures" influence migration decisions is also connected to the improve the social status through financial means, which is particularly evident in the poor Western part of Ukraine, where the residents are primarily as respectable, if they can call themselves a successful 'émigré'. Households aim to increase, not their absolute, but relative income to other households constituting their reference group in the place of origin. Accordingly:

The potential migrant sees how his neighbor with very limited financial means in former times, suddenly has his house completely renovated or a new, shiny car is standing on the driveway, because a family member has migrated abroad and now the whole family can afford such things. The potential migrant is trying to do the same. Stories about failed attempts to make money abroad, nobody likes to hear and nobody will tell.<sup>81</sup>

---

<sup>79</sup> Zappner, Jan, Das weiße Lächeln der Westukraine: Wie Arbeitsmigration das Leben verändert, Eurasisches Magazin, <<http://www.eurasischesmagazin.de/artikel/?artikelID=20041212>> [accessed 22.12.2009]

<sup>80</sup> International Organization for Migration (IOM). Labour Migration, Assesment for the WNIS Region. IOM Publication, Februar 2006 p. 9-11.

<sup>81</sup> E 1, Ihor Markov, Caritas

Social recognition through a successful migration project should therefore not be underestimated since people view labour migration as the chance to achieve a higher social stratum through financial advancement.

## **6. The specific demand for female migrant labor in the elderly care sector in Italy**

The high female migration flows to Italy are driven by the strong demand in Italy for Ukrainian female care givers. In order to provide background for this phenomenon, it is crucial to have a look at the complex interrelationship between family life, the labour-force participation, welfare, and migrant care-giving work to manage elderly care. Socio-demographic, cultural, and economic changes in Western societies altered the need for female immigrant workers to perform reproductive work. The problem of adequate care for elderly is much more severe in Italy than in other European states due to problematic demographic developments, changing family patterns, and a lack of institutionalized care. The crisis of elderly care in Italy is answered by immigrant female labour.

The quickly aging population in Italy is a result of a drop in fertility rates and an increase in life expectancy. Italy is among the nations with the oldest population in Europe. Italy is among the nations with the oldest population in Europe. The population of over 65 years reached 12 million of the 60 million inhabitants.<sup>82</sup> By 2030 Italians will reach an average age of nearly 49 years, resulting in an enlarged number of non-autonomous elderly people. Italy's workforce is shrinking rapidly and is expected to decline annually by over 1.5% between 2020 and 2030.<sup>83</sup>

Danish sociologist Gøsta Esping-Andersen set up a comprehensive welfare state sociology in his publication 'The Three Worlds of Welfare Capitalism (1990)', where he differentiates between liberal welfare states like Great Britain or the United States, conservative cooperative welfare states like Germany and socially democratic welfare states like Sweden or Finland. Italy was put into the range of "conservative cooperative"

---

<sup>82</sup> Radioni, *Osservatorio*, pp.245 ff.

<sup>83</sup> Italy's population structure. <<http://www.watsonwyatt.com/news/featured/wef/italy.pdf>> [access: 05.04.2010]

welfare models, but soon critics established a special category of ‘southern welfare regime’ for countries including Italy, Portugal, Spain and Greece. Some characteristics typical for a southern social welfare state in relation to elderly care are the persistence of the patriarchal family model rendering women responsible for household and caregiving work.<sup>84</sup> Italy can be assigned to the ‘family economic model’<sup>85</sup>, in which publicly funded elderly care remains subordinated, putting ‘(...)extensive reliance upon networks of kin for the delivery of welfare’. The extended family is the main pillar of the ‘essentially non- interventionist social policy’<sup>86</sup> by the Italian state, placing legal obligations for social security for elderly on the family (‘familiarism’). Italy does not subsidize domestic care work by families with tax reductions or financial transfers like nursing allowances. This shows a ‘lack of recognition of care work via public intervention’ and by public authorities. The family is forced to provide social security for the elderly and therefore becomes the institution for elderly care due to absent social measures by the state to create social public infrastructures, such as public nursing homes. More than 80% of people in Italy who are in need of long term care are attended to at the family home.<sup>87</sup> Only old people who do not have a family are provided with public care or financial support by the state.<sup>88</sup> In 2004 only 2.2% of everyone over 65 years old resided in institutions like retirement homes, most of them in the North of Italy. Mobile care services are used by only 1.1% of those over 65, while in Scandinavian countries like Finland it is approximately 24 % of same age group.<sup>89</sup> The low amounts of the gross domestic product (GDP) invested into allowances in kind and cash for families in Italy indicates the traditionally marginal engagement of the state into social services like elderly care. In 2000 the European Union was to use 2.09 % of the total EU countries’ GDP for families. Countries like Sweden spent approximately 3% of their

---

<sup>84</sup> Lageder, Miriam, ‘Gender, Welfare and Ethnicity im „südlichen“ Wohlfahrtsstaatsmodell’, Wien: SWS Rundschau 1/2006, pp. 88-89. <[http://www.sws-rundschau.at/archiv/SWS\\_2006\\_1\\_lageder.pdf](http://www.sws-rundschau.at/archiv/SWS_2006_1_lageder.pdf)> [access: 05.04. 2010.] (repeated reference: Laedger, Gender)

<sup>85</sup> Yeandle, Sue, ‘Women, Men and Non-standard Employment: Breadwinning and Caregiving in Germany, Italy and the UK’ in Rosemary Crompton, Restructuring Gender Relations and Employment. The Decline of the Male Breadwinner, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003, pp. 80- 104 (p.100). (repeated reference: Yeandle, Women)

<sup>86</sup> Yeandle, Women p. 97.

<sup>87</sup> Laedger, Gender pp.95-96, 98 [accessed 05.04. 2010]

<sup>88</sup> Lageder, Gender pp 92,96-98 [accessed 05.04. 2010]

<sup>89</sup> Lageder, Gender, p. 98 [accessed 05.04. 2010]

GDP on family needs, while Italy spent only 0.97% of their total GDP on this.<sup>90</sup> The Italian welfare state spends more than the EU average on pensions, but future generations will receive much lower pensions after the pension reforms that took place in the 1990s. Financing of ‘legal’ care through pensions and state allowances is already becoming more and more difficult<sup>91</sup> The Italian state disburses only two kinds of financial allowances to stimulate the family’s role as caretakers, which are often too low to cover the costs of care. The ‘indennità di accompagnamento’ is a financial allowance to aid people who are in need of full time care, which is not dependent on the income and is distributed directly to the individual in need of care (in 2005 this equated to 443,83 €per moth). The so-called ‘assegno per assistenza’ is an even smaller amount paid to the families who care for their elderly family members.<sup>92</sup> The total varies according to the family’s region and level of need but is distributed very restrictively. Considerable regional variations in Italy have contributed to making the wealthy North of Italy an attractive destination for Ukrainian female migrants. In the North, the erosion of traditional extended family’s support for elderly takes place quicker than in the South, resulting in a higher demand for caretakers.<sup>93</sup>

Dominant cultural traditions as well as attitudes in connection to gender roles has placed different obligations upon family members to provide care and support for elderly and plays a significant role in the demand for specifically *female* migrant labour in this sector. Gender arrangements in Italy stick to traditional conceptions of male and female obligations.<sup>94</sup> Italian men and women are ‘stuck in a 1950’s time-warp of paternalistic family values, strict cultural codes and high aspirations for children’.<sup>95</sup> The sexual division of labour puts men into the role of the breadwinner, while the woman is responsible for the domestic and care giving work. While this generally worked out in the past, ‘this traditional family self- sufficiency is becoming increasingly untenable with smaller family size, increased female labour-force participation and economic

---

<sup>90</sup> EUROSTAT-Data in Lageder, *Gender*, p. 96 [accessed 05.04. 2010].

<sup>91</sup> Lageder, *Gender*, pp 102 [accessed: 05.04. 2010].

<sup>92</sup> Lageder *Gender*, pp. 98,99 [ accessed 05.04. 2010]

<sup>93</sup> Yeandle, *Women* p. 82

<sup>94</sup> Yeandle, *Women*, pp. 81-83

<sup>95</sup> Yeandle, *Women*, p. 98

necessities'.<sup>96</sup> Since the 1980s a constant shortage of social benefits in the undeveloped and expensive public and private service sectors<sup>97</sup> has resulted in an intense use of family, primarily female, care taking. Italian women have become less resilient to take responsibility within the family due to tightened living and working conditions. Despite low divorce rates and the exalted position of the extended family compared to rest of Europe,<sup>98</sup> a trend has developed in Italy towards individual conceptions of family and partnerships. This has resulted in the model of the 'uncertain family' which contradicts the female role as caretakers and leads to families and women searching for alternative care solutions. This change of the female gender role leads to a growing presence of women in the labour market, universities, and in public life. Nowadays men and women pursue a job-centered life, which is limiting the woman's will and capacity to provide care-giving services for the elderly. Women's higher education levels and participation in the labour-force is improving their opportunities to secure their existence without a male breadwinner.<sup>99</sup> Leisure time is also becoming more appreciated. The erosion of social conditions for such a lifestyle, leaves only two solutions at disposal though: to either reduce all occupational activities, or to employ domestic workers to take care of the household. Ray Pahl points out: 'a professional woman needs a wife.'<sup>100</sup> The issue of poor elderly care due to limited social services and problematic financial situations as well as the process of 'defamilialization'<sup>101</sup> (the ability to provide care-giving without the help of family networks), can be resolved by outsourcing necessary care to cheap migrant labours. The demand for foreign caretakers, especially for long term 24-hour care<sup>102</sup> is a consequence of the struggle to find an affordable care for the increasing elderly population. Ukrainian women are among these migrants filling the gaps in elderly care. About 500,000 Ukrainian women stay in Italy to work in blue collar jobs,

---

<sup>96</sup> Yeandle, Women p. 84

<sup>97</sup> Lageder, Gender, pp. 95-9 [accessed 05.04. 2010]

<sup>98</sup> Births rates of unmarried couples for example: In Great Britain and France these figures rose from 7% in the 1960 to more than 40% in 2000, while in Italy in same time numbers only changed from 2% to 9%.

<sup>99</sup> Yeandle, Women, pp. 103 ff

<sup>100</sup> Siebel, Die Zukunft der europäischen Stadt,

>[http://www.saarbruecken.de/assets/2009\\_8/1249987539\\_siebel\\_-\\_die\\_zukunft\\_der\\_europaeischen\\_stadt-a.pdf](http://www.saarbruecken.de/assets/2009_8/1249987539_siebel_-_die_zukunft_der_europaeischen_stadt-a.pdf)> [accessed 05.04. 2010]

<sup>101</sup> Lageder, Gender p.92 [accessed 05.04. 2010]

<sup>102</sup> Lageder, Gender p.102 [accessed 05.04. 2010]

but only 150,000 Ukrainian women have legal permission to reside there.<sup>103</sup> A research study in the northern Italian city Modena revealed that at least 30% of families with family members in need of care employ migrants and about 50% of these employees provide 24 hour- care.<sup>104</sup> Older structures of the division of labor are recreated as women continue to guarantee care-taking of the elderly in Italy. Care-giving is transferred from Italian women employed in wage-earning jobs to female migrants like the Ukrainian women. Italian women still organize the care, but the work itself is carried out by the employed foreign women. Care-giving is therefore not only divided among gender lines,<sup>105</sup> but also among ethnicities.<sup>106</sup> According to OECD estimates, at least half a million migrants work for Italian families in ‘services to the households’, and of them 90% are female.<sup>107</sup>

#### *Immigration policy and informal labor market*

Italy has a rather short immigration history as Italy has only been traditionally a country of emigration, since the end of the 19<sup>th</sup> century until the 1970s.<sup>108</sup> With the oil crisis in 1973 and more restrictive immigration policies in other European countries, immigration figures started to exceed emigration numbers in Italy. Focused immigration policy exists only since the 1980s when immigration numbers rose significantly. Italian migration policy is based on a dualistic approach of a state controlled number of immigrations by a quota system and by tight boarder controls to fight irregular migration. Simultaneously legalization amnesties of irregular migrants already in the country are regularly performed. Once a migrant has entered Italy, one does not receive any help by the state, but is tolerated, while in countries like Germany an irregular migrant has a higher chance of being caught. However if the migrant receives legal status then the German state is

---

<sup>103</sup> IOM, Labour Migration Assesment for the WINIS Region. p.18.

<sup>104</sup> Lageder, Gender p.98 [accessed 05.04. 2010]

<sup>105</sup> (socio cultural construction —contrary to biological sex ) Lageder, Gender p.86 [accessed 05.04. 2010]

<sup>106</sup> (ethnicity = self-perception and perception by others of belonging to a national, cultural or linguistic group) Lageder, Gender p.102 [accessed 05.04. 2010]

<sup>107</sup>Lageder, Gender p. pp. 98, 101-102 [accessed 05.04. 2010]

<sup>108</sup> Migrations-Info, Migration und Bevölkerung, Newsletter, Ausgabe 7, 09/2001 Länderprofil: Italien, <[http://www.migration-info.de/mub\\_artikel.php?Id=030704](http://www.migration-info.de/mub_artikel.php?Id=030704)> (repeated reference: Migrations-Info.de ) [accessed: 04.04.2010]

more likely to pay social benefits.<sup>109</sup> In order to enter the EU, Ukrainians need to apply to a very complicated process to obtain a visa. As all countries of the Schengen area, which comprises all EU states except Romania, Cyprus, Bulgaria and to a certain extent Great Britain and Ireland, Italy follows a very restrictive visa policy for Ukrainians. Due to insufficient legal means for (temporary) immigration to Italy, many Ukrainians choose the option of an irregular stay, which increases the risk of falling victim to human trafficking, especially for women.<sup>110</sup> It is only possible to obtain work and residence permits ('permesso di soggiorno') through a very long procedure administered by the State Ministry of Interior. For most Ukrainian citizens the only option to receive a legal status in Italy is either by marriage or by Italy's legalization amnesties for irregular migrants staying in the country called 'sanatorie'. Irregular migrants have to report within a certain period of time to local authorities to make an application for a residence permit. Further, the irregular migrant as well as the employer have to reveal the illicit occupation and only then will both parties be exempted from punishment.<sup>111</sup> Italy conducted six legalization amnesties since the 1990s, the latest in September 2009. During the legalization campaigns in the 1990s (1990, 1995, 1998), about 645,000 irregular migrants received a 'permesso di soggiorno'. In the year 2002, which is also in the peak period of migration flows from Ukraine to Italy, about 650,000 people were legalized, of them 100 were Ukrainian.<sup>112</sup> The high number of Ukrainians who benefited from legalization campaigns demonstrates the importance of irregular migration from Ukraine to Italy and the large-scale dispersion of Ukrainians 'clandestini' among the country. According to statistics of the Italian Caritas more than 60% of the applications for the last couple of legalizations were made by Eastern European citizens.<sup>113</sup> After each legalization campaign, the number of legally employed migrants, especially in private households, rose massively.

---

<sup>109</sup> E5 Oleg Hospodarsky, Chairmen of the Association of elderly care workers in Ukraine

<sup>110</sup> Parkhomenko, Nataliya, Ukrainian Labour Migration in the enlarged Europe, Kiev: Center for Peace, Conversion and Foreign Policy of Ukraine 2005, p. 81 (repeated reference: Parkhomenko, Ukrainian).

<sup>111</sup> Migrations-Info.de, [accessed 04.04.2010]

<sup>112</sup> Dietz, Barbara, 'Die Ukraine im europäischen Migrationssystem', ApuZ. Aus Politik und Zeitgeschichte. Migration in Europa. Beilage zur Wochenzeitung das Parlament. 35- 36/2008. 25.August 2008. p.37

<sup>113</sup> Borkert, Maren, Integration von Zuwanderern in Italien, Wiesbaden: VS, Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften 2008, pp. 20-26.

The repetition and consolidation of 'sanatorie' to legalize irregular migrants is a controversial debate in the European Union. It states Italy uses legalization campaigns to decrease the high number of irregular migrants and to gain better control over the illicit labor market sector.<sup>114</sup> Supporters argue that economical and societal tensions caused by the population living and working under inhumane conditions due to their irregular status can be solved by such campaigns. The opposing northern and western European countries point out contradictory side effects of legalization campaigns including a connection with the informal labor market, legalizations sustaining illicit underpaid employments for irregular migrants, and migrants as well as employees have come to expect legalizations on a regular basis. The high probability of irregular migrants to find an illicit work and be legalized during a legalization campaign makes irregular migration attractive and stimulates further movements against the law.<sup>115</sup> Also the possibility to be legalized was a strong factor to migrate and stay irregularly in Italy.<sup>116</sup> The effects of amnesties for Ukrainian women on the micro level can be that some women settle and bring their family to Italy, but most commonly the legal status is used to travel to Ukraine and back regularly.<sup>117</sup>

Irregular migrants find occupations in the traditionally wide-spread and highly feminized informal labor market.<sup>118</sup> An estimated 27% of the Italian GDP was produced by illicit labor in 2001, outnumbering the EU average by about 16%, and is likely much higher, especially for women in occupations<sup>119</sup>. Women are more frequently requested for illicit labour jobs than men because occupations in the service sector like elderly care and domestic work, are feminized, badly paid, and informally organized working fields. Private households offer favorable conditions for informal care work as they are only rarely controlled by local authorities and irregular employments are easy to conceal.<sup>120</sup> According to statistics of the Italian Caritas, at least one third of all migrants in Italy

---

<sup>114</sup> SoZ - Sozialistische Zeitung No.12/2001.; Papiere jetzt! Der Pass ist das edelste Stück des Menschen. <<http://www.vsp-vernetzt.de/soz/011207.htm>>. [accessed 04.04.2010]

<sup>115</sup> Dietz, Die Ukraine p.37.

<sup>116</sup> Interview with E2

<sup>117</sup> Morokvasik, Crossing. p. 5

<sup>118</sup> Morokvasik, Crossing. p. 5

<sup>119</sup> Lageder, Gender p.95 [accessed 05.04. 2010]

<sup>120</sup> Lageder, Gender p 105 [access: 05.04. 2010]

work illicitly in comparison to Europe's irregular workers in private households (OECD 2001). Illicit work offers migrant women short, economical freedom, but lacks social entitlements for health insurance or pensions.

In the sphere of elderly care, only rarely sanctioned illicit labour markets in connection to the ambivalent immigration policy stimulates irregular occupations and therefore encourages irregular migrations to Italy. The state policy answers a growing demand for foreign labor with restrictive immigration laws but tries to handle the problem of irregular migrants repeatedly by legalization campaigns. In combination with the welfare policy of putting elderly care work into the private sphere, the insufficient legal abilities for migrants to engage in care work to cover the demand, is filled by irregular migrants. 'Clandestinity', working and living without correct papers, is not only caused by legal conditions, but also by the demand of Italian families for low wages'.<sup>121</sup> Underpaid, socially unsecured irregular migrants like Ukrainian women, fill the gaps in the Italian elderly care system.<sup>122</sup>

The shift of care to low paid, uninsured migrants meets the interests all participants. Italian families benefit from cheap care-taking by Ukrainian migrants and Italian women are able to engage into wage-earning jobs, and the elderly can stay at home in their familiar surroundings. Ukrainian women, who come with the intention to find short-term occupations can improve their financial situation and they often find it advantageous to live in a family to minimize their costs as board and lodging is provided. A disadvantage of these forms of employment is their inability to make contributions for their own pensions or social security due to their irregular status, which often turns out to be a problem after a prolonged stay. Also, the Italian welfare state profits, at least temporarily, from this solution as organizing care through the state would be extremely expensive. The Italian state therefore will continue to rely on families to care for the elderly, who will increasingly employ foreign women to solve the need for care taking. The problem of care by the state-funded structures remains unsolved. Already today irregular migrants

---

<sup>121</sup> Beretta, David, "Italy's alternative to nursing homes: Ukrainian Caregivers", Perugia: 03/2007, [www.4fate.org/italy.pdf](http://www.4fate.org/italy.pdf). [accessed 03.03.2009]

<sup>122</sup> Lageder, Gender p.107 [accessed 05.04. 2010]

are an irreplaceable provider of social services regardless of the unfavorable demographic and economical developments in Italy and the demand for cheap, irregular migrant labor in the care sector is only going to further increase in future.

## **7. Migration numbers and demographical characteristics of Ukrainian women in Italy**

### **7.1 The extent of irregular female migration from Ukraine to Italy**

Due to the difficult measurability of irregular movements estimations about the number of Ukrainian labour migrants strongly vary. Official statistics of the Ukrainian state administration estimate about 2 million Ukrainians abroad, one million in Russia and one million in the countries of the EU.<sup>123</sup> Experts believe the real migration from Ukraine is much higher than official data might assume.<sup>124</sup> Non- governmental organizations (NGO's) assume up to 5-7 million Ukrainian migrants being allocated across Russia and the EU which means that 4 to 15% of the whole population, or about 20% of the working population in Ukraine are directly involved into migration.<sup>125</sup> Ihor Markov, director of Caritas in Lviv, says that at least 70% of all Ukrainians stay irregularly in the EU.<sup>126</sup>

Also the statistics on gender distributions of irregular labour migrants from Ukraine show a discrepancies. IOM- data from 2006 state that about 70% of Ukrainian labor migrants are male and 30% female.<sup>127</sup> My own research and most other research studies picture a very more balanced participation of Ukrainian men and women in migration flows. Also the INTAS- survey from 2005/2006 conducted within the EU- project 'Patterns of Migration in the New European Borderlands' in different countries of the post- Soviet

---

<sup>123</sup> International Organization for Migration (IOM), Labour Migration Assesment for the WNIS Region. IOM Publication, Februar 2006. p.18.

<sup>124</sup> Labour migration from Ukraine: Лібанової Е.М. Зовнішні трудові міграції населення України. Національна академія наук України. Київ 2002 P. 171. (repeated reference: Лібанової, Зовнішні трудові міграції )

<sup>125</sup> Zimmer, Ein ständiges p. 40

<sup>126</sup> M1 Interview Ihor Markov, Caritas

<sup>127</sup> International Organization for Migration (IOM), Labour Migration Assesment for the WNIS Region, IOM Publication, Februar 2006.

region assumes that women constitute about half of all Ukrainian migrants in the EU. The study analyses legal and irregular forms of migration by interviewing 400 households in Ukraine in the region of Lviv and Charkiv about people's motivation to migrate.<sup>128</sup> Due to the fact that women constitute about half of the workforce in Ukraine<sup>129</sup>, but the unemployment figures for women are almost twice as high then for men (2008)<sup>130</sup>, it is very likely that women do participate as much as men in Ukrainian migration flows. A growing tendency for Ukrainian women to take part in migration movements is unquestionable according to studies of the State Statistical Committee of Ukraine.<sup>131</sup>

However, demographical structures and destinations differ between female and male labour migration from Ukraine. It is particularly noticeable that Southern European countries appeal to such high numbers of Ukrainian migrants because they have a high demand for cheap, irregular migrant labour. Countries such as Germany, Britain or France are only rarely the destination target of Ukrainian workers and act in many cases just as transit countries for irregular Ukrainian migrants. All studies I considered indicate that of irregular female Ukrainian migrants abroad mainly take up occupations in the service sector, while men work in the construction and agricultural sector. Accordingly studies show that the overriding amount of men is drawn into countries with a high

---

<sup>128</sup> INTAS household survey of the year 2005/2006 was funded by the EU- INTAS Project. This household survey within the project "Patterns of Migration in the New European Borderlands" in several countries of the region takes into account irregular forms of labor migration. In the study, current migration movements have been analyzed since 2004. To reduce the disadvantages of quantitative and qualitative survey methods for the study of migrant's motives, the project took advantage of a technique developed by Douglas Massey called "Ethno-Surveys," which combines the two methods with each other to increase information. The survey was conducted in the regions of Lviv and Kharkiv, which have relatively high migration rates in 200 randomly selected households. First, a quantitative household survey was implemented and then a detailed survey of selected, actually migrated household members (20 people) followed. In my analysis, however, only the results of the quantitative survey are included. (hereinafter referred to as "INTAS-household survey").

<sup>129</sup> <[www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/csw/factors.htm](http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/csw/factors.htm)>. [ accessed 01.03.2009]

<sup>130</sup> State Statistical Committee, < <http://www.ukrstat.gov.ua/>>.[ accessed 27.09.2009].

<sup>131</sup> An important source of information was the study "Living ways of the population of Ukraine" by the State Statistics Committee conducted in the year 2001/2002 offers important official data on labor migration from Ukraine. was designed. For the survey, more than 18,000 inhabitants aged 15-70 years have been interviewed in eight regions of Eastern and Western Ukraine. By statistics in combination with sociological surveys of international travelers while crossing the Ukrainian first impressions of the extent of labor migration have been determined. Main success of this study compared to previous studies was that it captured the number of labor migrants from some Ukrainian regions. (hereinafter referred to as 'study by the State Statistics Committee')

labour demand in construction and agriculture, like Spain and Portugal. Italy and Greece are countries attracting mainly women from Ukraine, but their number is much lower in Greece than in Italy.

With the transformation process to a market economy and the worsening in the social situation and galloping inflation following the breakdown of USSR, pioneer migrants from Ukraine came to Italy since the middle of the 1990's. At that time Italy began had a growing need for 'assistenti domicilare' domestic assistants, who would take care of households, children and elderly people.<sup>132</sup> The number of Ukrainian migrants in Italy has been constantly growing each year and from the beginning women constituted a big part of migration waves.<sup>133</sup> Migration from Ukraine enhanced further migrations, often resulting in a spatial concentration of Ukrainian migrants in a certain area of Italy. Chain migration puts a historical dimension to migration as it requires continuity of relationships and communication between expats and people remaining in the home country. Over time, Italy's small Ukrainian immigrant community of a few thousand has become the fourth-largest in Italy. Today 132.718 (2009, Istat) Ukrainians work regularly in Italy according to official statistics. NGOs believe that the number of irregular Ukrainians in Italy is much higher. Caritas Ukraine assumes at least half a million regular and irregular workers from Ukraine in Italy.

***Chart 1.***

**Ukrainian labour migrants in Italy**

*official estimation*

*unofficial estimations*

**ukr. Government**

**Caritas Ukraine<sup>134</sup>**

**IOM<sup>135</sup>**

**PAUCI<sup>136</sup>**

<sup>132</sup> Radioni, Osservatorio, p 245

<sup>133</sup> „Labour migration policy, legislation, and its implementation in the prevention of trafficking in women in Ukraine.” Technical cooperation Project „Employment, vocational training opportunities and migration policy measures to prevent and reduce trafficking in women in Albania, Moldova and Ukraine”. National Tripartite Seminar. Ministry of Labour and Social Policy of Ukraine. International Labour Office, Kyiv 2005 p. 61

<sup>134</sup> Press release of Caritas Ukraine from 9th April 2008. (Ihor Markov)

<sup>135</sup> IOM, Labour Migration Assesment for the WINIS Region, p.18.

<sup>136</sup> Parkhomenko, Ukrainian, p. 70

(2009)	(2009)	(2006)	(2005)
<b>133.000</b>	<b>500.000</b>	<b>200.000</b>	<b>350.000</b>
→ (all agree on 80-90% females)			

The peculiarity of labour migration from Ukraine to Italy is that the Ukrainian community in Italy has the highest gender disparity among all foreigners in Italy. At least 80% of Ukrainians working regularly and irregularly in Italy are females.<sup>137</sup> Gender specific demands for irregular migrant labour in the traditional female working fields of domestic work and elderly care in the large informal labour market are pull factors for exclusively female Ukrainian migration flows to Italy. Assumingly 600,000 to 1 million female caregivers work irregularly in Italy. Caregivers in Italy are to often from Moldova, Romania and Peru, but the main caregiver exporter to Italy is Ukraine.<sup>138</sup>

Functioning, stable networks connecting Italy and Ukraine provide the supporting frame and intermediary for ‘caregiving- migration’ in the face of obstacles and risks caused by irregularity. Besides, periodic legalization campaigns, which dangle a legal status and laxer controls, represent significant contributing factors for this phenomena.<sup>139</sup>

*‘Controls in Italy are more permeable and less tightly enforced. In countries like Germany the abundance to immigration and labour laws are more strictly put into effect by authorities and society.’*

Since the Eastern Enlargement of the EU, new mobility patterns of Ukrainian migrants take place. Women who once worked in Poland might irregularly migrate to Italy for higher salaries as the abolishment of border controls makes the entry into another EU state easier and less risky.<sup>140</sup>

<sup>137</sup> Radioni, *Osservatorio*, p.248

<sup>138</sup> Davide Berretta, Contributor to The Christian Science Monitor / March 15, 2007<  
<http://www.csmonitor.com/2007/0315/p01s03-woeu.html>> [accessed 19.04.2010]

<sup>139</sup> Лібанової, p.175- 176

<sup>139</sup> E 5 Interview with Oleg Hospodarsky

<sup>140</sup> Information Campaign against Trafficking in Women from Ukraine. *Research Report*, July 1998. International Organization for Migration. p. 14.

## **7.2 Demographical Structure Ukrainian female migrants in Italy**

The fact that women in Ukraine have less access to labor market structures and earn lower salaries increase push- factors in particular for women in Ukraine, makes them seek employments abroad as (irregular) migration seems to be the only solution to secure their own and their family's existence. The survey by the International Organization for Migration (IOM) from 1998 proved a direct correlation between an unsatisfying financial situation and the wish of women to migrate.<sup>141</sup> The economical necessity resulting from low wages in combination with income and demographical disparities between Ukraine and the near EU are the most important push- and pull- factors for both genders, although women suffer in addition to that from even higher levels of wage and income differences.<sup>142</sup> In an IOM- survey only 5% of the women answered they would not migrate because they have a satisfying income.<sup>143</sup>

### **7.2.1 Age**

Caritas expert Ihor Markov knows that in the overall migration flows from Ukraine no particular age prevails and IOM statistics show that they consist of people at the most employable age of 20 to 49 years.<sup>144</sup> In the INTAS household survey from 2004 the average labour migrant from Ukraine was 34 years old. Male labor migrants from Eastern Europe are mostly younger than male workers in Western Europe, which presumably is caused by the higher financial pressure to finance their families by working abroad.<sup>145</sup> Women tend to migrate at older age, which is also reflected in the age structure in Italy: The overwhelming percentage of women in Italy are 'badanti media', women at higher

---

<sup>141</sup> Information Campaign against Trafficking in Women from Ukraine. Research Report, July 1998. International Organization for Migration. P. 14.

<sup>142</sup> Kalter, Theorien, pp. 444-445.

<sup>143</sup> Information Campaign against Trafficking in Women from Ukraine. Research Report July 1998. International Organization for migration p.15.

<sup>144</sup> International Organization for Migration (IOM), Labour Migration Assesment for the WNIS Region. IOM Publication, Februar 2006. p.6.

<sup>145</sup> <<http://www.cap-lmu.de/aktuell/meldungen/2007/mobilitaet-migration.php>>[access: 30.04.2009].

medium age between 40-50 years old. Mothers at medium age are attracted to go to Italy, because their children are grown- up already which makes it easier for them to leave.<sup>146</sup>

### **7.2.2 Education**

Ukrainian migrants with medium and high education are among the most active in migration processes. According to the INTAS- household survey one fifth of all Ukrainian labor migrants in the EU were in possession of a university diploma. Most women from Ukraine working in Italy are highly educated as they received their free higher education during communist times. Many not only graduated from university but also had professions of high qualification till moment of their migration. But women are not able to use their qualifications on the Ukrainian nor on the Italian labour market. Ingenieurs, doctors, professors etc. come to Italy to work in jobs that do not require any qualification such as a college education. Women put up with the denigration of their professional status due to the upgrading of their income in Italy compared to their average Ukrainian salary. This circumstance highlights the major significance of income to Ukrainian women. Priority is not given to the kind of occupation, but the income as the key element for economical survival of Ukrainian women and their family stands in the center of the migration decision. Typically the irregular status denies access to better employments. Nevertheless even women in possession of a residence permit and Italian language knowledge have deprived chances on the Italian labor market due to their ethnicity and the non- recognition of their Ukrainian education documents in Italy.

### **7.2.3 Martial status**

Particularly divorced women are in high need of sufficient income as they have to take care of themselves and their family on their own and do not have to fear to jeopardize their marriage or relationship. Changing family structures are reflected in rising number of single mothers taking part in migration flows from Ukraine. In a study by the State Statistical Committee- of Ukraine mostly married people were involved into migration

---

<sup>146</sup> Radioni, *Osservatorio*, p. 257.

movements, while the results of a more recent study, the INTAS- household service from 2004 displays the average of female migrants to be frequently divorced and having few children. Caritas Italy states that in Italy many Ukrainian women are married with children because they cannot handle the growing living costs at home.<sup>147</sup>

#### **7.2.4 Regional characteristics**

The major part of Ukrainian labor migrants in the EU, men and women, originate from Western Ukraine. The region is often described as the “corridor” to the EU as it is located at the boarder of the enlarged European Union. At least 5% of Western Ukrainian population are alien employees.<sup>148</sup> Ukraine’s regional income is divided into a gap between industrially shaped Eastern Ukraine and agricultural Western Ukraine. Women from little villages and small cities tend to leave Ukraine for labour migration more often than inhabitants of big cities, which presumably results from the better job opportunities and infrastructures.<sup>149</sup> The economic heart of Ukraine located in the Eastern districts, although being hit heavily by the world economic crisis, offer better job chances and higher salaries than other parts of the country. Western Ukraine is shaped by agriculture, lacking any industries. In some regions along the Western Ukrainian border unemployment figures exceed 60 percent. In Ukraine’s poorest region Transcarpathia, the number of people living under the poverty line is higher than anywhere else in the country: almost half of the population lives in poverty.<sup>150</sup> The regional misbalance is reflected in high, genuinely ‘Western Ukrainian’ migration flows drawing a connection between poverty, unemployment and low salaries and (labour) migration. The fact that the Western Ukrainian regions are heavily affected by low income and high unemployment and high migration rates draws a connection between poverty and migration as women in Italy predominantly come from Western Ukrainian regions. The

---

<sup>147</sup> Radioni, *Osservatorio*, p.247.

<sup>148</sup> International Organization for Migration (IOM), *Labour Migration* Assesment for the WNIS Region. IOM Publication, Februar 2006. P.18.

<sup>149</sup> International Organization for Migration (IOM) *Labour Migration* Assesment for the WNIS Region. IOM Publication, Februar 2006. 6.

<sup>150</sup> Hasse, H. Rolf, Kunze, Cornelia, eds., *Illegale Arbeitsmigration nach Deutschland aus der Ukraine*, Transformation, Leipziger Beiträge zu Wirtschaft und Gesellschaft, Leipzig: Leipziger Universitätsverlag 2003, pp. 76 (repeated reference: Hasse, *Illegale* )

results of the INTAS- survey reflect the regional differences in migration willingness and destination countries: while almost one fifth (18%) of respondents from the region of Lviv in Western Ukraine had migration experience, in the Eastern Ukrainian province Charkiv only 5% of all respondents have worked abroad.<sup>151</sup> Another explanation for the high number of women from Western Ukraine is the region's proximity to the EU. Short distances facilitate (irregular) migration as travel expenses and complexity increase in case of long distant destinations. Among the most frequented destinations for Ukrainian migrants are only countries from the EU, which proofs the importance of short distances in connection to (irregular) migration. Long distances and complicated transportation impede irregular migration to high income countries like the United States or Canada. Ukraine's location as a neighboring country, and especially the Western regions of Ukraine which directly abut the external frontier of the Community provides favorable conditions for irregular migration as usually only that border has to be crossed since neighboring countries like Poland joined the Schengen treaty. Although to enter Poland became more complicated for Ukrainians since the country adopted the EU visa regime, the Schengen- area actually eases migration movements once the external frontier of the Community is crossed: (irregular) migrants can move relatively easy to the country of their choice within the Schengen- area of abolished border controls. Additional stimuli for Western Ukrainian women to migrate to Italy are historical linkages to countries of the European Union. Ukrainian- speaking people in Western Ukraine are oriented to the West and identify themselves with Europe due to the region's history of being part of the Austrian Hungarian Empire once.<sup>152</sup> Russian- speaking Eastern Ukraine shows high affinity to their neighbor country Russia, due to historical and cultural similarities, which is echoed in high male migration flows to Russia from these regions.<sup>153</sup>

### 7.3 Duration

---

<sup>151</sup> Diez , Migration, p.5.

<sup>152</sup> Hasse, Illegale p. 76.

<sup>153</sup> Nowicka, Wanda, Factors Affecting Women's Health in Eastern and Central Europe with particular emphasis on Infectious Diseases, Mental, Environmental and Reproductive Health, <[www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/csw/factors.htm](http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/csw/factors.htm)> [access: 19.02.2010].

Some researchers say that close family ties reduce the intention to migrate. In case of Ukrainian labour migration, economic necessities force women to leave even if they have close family ties. However, family ties do influence the duration of their stay abroad. The results of a sociological study conducted by the IOM in 1998 offer valuable clues about migration intentions of Ukrainian women that are still valid today. The study is based upon a nation wide survey of 1,189 potential female migrants from ten different regions in Ukraine. The results prove that most Ukrainians view their time abroad as an investment and do not wish to relocate permanently. Ukrainian women in Italy want to return home to Ukraine as soon as their financial goals have been achieved.<sup>154</sup> My interviewees confirmed that these conclusions are still valid today. Most Ukrainian women would prefer to stay in Ukraine if their income covered their and their family's financial needs.

*'I would not stay even five minutes in this country. If I had a good husband I would be in Ukraine now, take care of the household and stay at home.'*<sup>155</sup>

Against the background of the long-lasting hard work and separation from the family, it becomes comprehensible also for a Western socialized person that it is widely seen as a luxury in Ukraine if the woman can dedicate herself to the household.<sup>156</sup>

To summarize the demographic features, the analysis has shown the following: the educated, married, Western Ukrainian woman of higher-medium employable age and a mother of children, with the intention of temporarily migrating out of economic motives is the one most likely to migrate to Italy. Also, increasingly divorced mothers participate in migration flows.

## **8. Irregular female migration to Italy and the role of networks**

---

<sup>154</sup> IOM, Information Campaign against Trafficking in Women from Ukraine. Research Report July 1998. International Organization for Migration, pp.11, 9-14.

<sup>155</sup> M 3interview

<sup>156</sup> Hasse, Illegale p. 65.

According to Lee's push and pull model, the aspect of insufficient legal possibilities to take up work in the EU would be among the intervening obstacles for labour migration and lead to a considerable decline in migration flows. But even a high-tech monitoring system along the more than one-thousand-kilometre border between Ukraine and the states of the EU has not reduced migration from Ukraine to Italy. The streams of migration are basically simply redirected into illegal channels.<sup>157</sup> Poverty and economic needs encourage this informality, because financial survival outweighs the fulfilment of legal provisions of stay. Functioning social security and health care systems are insufficient or nonexistent in Ukraine. Tight visa regimes and labour market regulations cannot keep Ukrainians from migration, as low salaries and standards of life make them seek a better life in EU states. Most Ukrainian nationals choose informal ways of migration out of a lack of choices to work and organize their life abroad legally. To meet legal requirements to obtain regular documents for an employment in EU states is almost impossible for Ukrainian citizens, especially for the low qualified tasks which are often appointed to migrant women.<sup>158</sup> As a result, informal networks become an indispensable resource for migration for economic survival. As the theory of networks predicts, high social capital in the form of network contacts has a positive effect on the migration project as it reduces migration risks and costs and absorbs the dangers of irregularity. In fact irregularity is among the minor aspects to consider for Ukrainian individuals willing to migrate.<sup>159</sup> Irregular network structures allow flexible and quick reactions to rapid changes and crises, as problems can be solved within informal networks on an individual level and do not have to pass long bureaucratic procedures and registrations.

Ukrainian migration networks are built upon common experiences of those who work and live in the target country. They travel the same distances and engage into the same spaces and with the same intermediaries (travel agents, border officials etc.). In case of Ukrainian irregular labour migration, personal networks of relatives, friends and acquaintances are the major tool for irregular migration to Italy. Social networks provide information as well as psychological and material support, which have an essential

---

<sup>157</sup> Hasse, *Illegale* p. 64- 67.

<sup>158</sup> Di Nicola, Andrea, *Transcrime*, Trafficking in Immigrants: A European Perspective, Prag: University of Trento 1999 p.1-2.

<sup>159</sup> Hasse, *Illegale* p. 67.

influence on the individual decision to migrate.<sup>160</sup> Relatives and friends with migration experience help to organize the journey, find a job in Italy, provide useful contacts - in short, they are the first point of reference before and after arrival.

According to nation wide surveys, prospective migrants in Ukraine acquire information on their destination country and labour migration almost exclusively from relatives and friends (80%). Ukrainians trust relatives' and friends' migration experience and view them as the most reliable source of information.<sup>161</sup> Altogether Ukrainians are inadequately informed about living and working conditions abroad, which casts a damning light on the access to sources of information in Ukraine. The lack of knowledge and the mistrust of public and state institutions hinders the use of potential alternatives to irregular labour migration.

The organization of the migration project and the entry into Italy differ individually and depend upon personal preconditions and the form of visa obtained. 'Professional' semi-legal agencies are increasingly adopting a mediating role in migration processes to replace the effect of, friends and relatives (Krissman 2005, Castles 2007). Such agencies manage the whole process of irregular labour migration to Italy, from the acquisition of a tourist visa for Italy or other European states to employment and accommodation in Italy, with the advantage that the agency arranges everything for the migrant. Ukrainian female as well as male migrants prefer to trust their relatives and friends in migration issues, but cannot do without the help of these services for the success of their migration project as well as for their daily life in Italy. Nowadays, for the trip to Italy, almost all migrants without documents rely on the far-reaching transport structures of 'professional' agencies. To be smuggled into Italy without proper documents costs between 2000- 3000 US dollars because the US currency is the most common currency in circulation among people for any larger amounts in Ukraine, and prices are rising. In the case of labour migration from the Ukraine to the EU, 85% of all Ukrainian labour migrants come to EU

---

<sup>160</sup> Hasse, *Illegale* p. 51.

<sup>161</sup> Information Campaign against Trafficking in Women from Ukraine. Research Report July 1998, International Organization for Migration, p. 9.

countries with a tourist visa according to unofficial estimates of the ILO.<sup>162</sup> Sightseeing tours by bus of three to seven days presenting cultural Italian sights are a frequently used way of entry to Italy. On the route back to Ukraine only few passengers return home. Prices for the acquisition of the visa and the bus trip ‘for sightseeing’ range between 500-800 dollars. These travel agencies mediate between Italian or other EU embassies and Ukrainian candidates for a tourist visa in an obscure way, but the visa might be denied by the embassies.<sup>163</sup> Ukrainian labour migrants enter the country legally but with a different intention than originally stated on their tourist visa. After expiry of the visa, Ukrainians stay for work purposes. Migrants prolonging their stay without a legal basis are referred to as ‘overstayers’.<sup>164</sup>

Some Ukrainians cross the EU border without a valid visa in violation of the Schengen entry provisions.<sup>165</sup> Stories of dramatic attempts to enter the EU under avoidance of border controls circulate among Ukrainian migrants, for instance people who tried to swim through the river Oder, which runs along the German-Polish border and previously marked the outer border of the EU before Poland’s accession into the EU in 2004. At the time when Poland was part of the EU, but not yet a member of the Schengen-area, it was common practice among Ukrainian migrants to apply for tourist visas for Eastern European states, which were relatively easy to obtain as these countries had no restrictive Schengen-visa regulations in force at that time.

*‘We waited several days at the Polish- German border until the ‘right’ bribed customs officer was on duty, to pass the border unmolested through a side passage.’*

---

<sup>162</sup> Labour migration policy, legislation, and its implementation in the prevention of trafficking in women in Ukraine.” Technical cooperation Project „Employment, vocational training opportunities and migration policy measures to prevent and reduce trafficking in women in Albania, Moldova and Ukraine”. National Tripartite Seminar. Ministry of Labour and Social Policy of Ukraine. International Labour Office. Kyiv 2005, p. 39.

<sup>163</sup> Radoini, *Osservatorio*, p. 248.

<sup>164</sup> Dietz, *Europäische*, p. 32.

<sup>165</sup> Jünschke Zur Kriminalisierung der "Illegalen". Warum Fremdenfeindlichkeit und Rassismus geschürt werden, *Neue Rheinische Zeitung*, Beitrag des Online-Flyers Nr. 57, 15.08.2006, <[http://www.proasyl.de/fileadmin/proasyl/fm\\_redakteure/Newsletter\\_Anhaenge/115/kriminalisierung\\_illegalen.pdf](http://www.proasyl.de/fileadmin/proasyl/fm_redakteure/Newsletter_Anhaenge/115/kriminalisierung_illegalen.pdf)> [accessed 03.04.2010].

Ukrainian loan agencies provide regular and irregular Ukrainian migrants with money, and they are sometimes the only way out of a financial emergency situation. Also, special services for the acquisition of false documents exist in Ukraine as well as in Italy. In Italy, residence permits can be obtained for about 2000 Euros, presumably made possible with Italian intermediaries at the Questura of Milano (main aliens department), because the document itself is authentic, but the migrant himself is not registered in the computer system. Irregular migrants face a dilemma of improved job chances versus increased risk. False 'regular' documents facilitate the search for employment and the prospect of escape from financial hardships, but they exacerbate the possible consequences of their irregular activities: To immigrate irregularly to Italy is already dangerous as migrants might be deported back to their countries. But to be involved in document falsification could result in imprisonment if discovered by police. Presumably Ukrainian migrants are willing to take that risk though, because police are rarely equipped with the technical devices to check a migrant's electronic registration and tend to check only the papers.<sup>166</sup>

Recent studies have shown that social networks might also enhance negative consequences and limit individuals or even be contra-productive for the realisation of their migration goals. This ambivalence of social networks in the case of Ukrainian migration refers mainly to the organization of the irregular migration project against payment through 'professional' networks in contrast to private networks, which are based on solidarity, reciprocity and trust of the participating members. Migrants relying solely upon professional migration networks are in danger of getting into financial dependency or even criminal structures to pay off debts. Ukrainian labour migrants who possess social capital in the form of useful contacts to relatives and friends already in Italy at least partially make use of these professional networks. The existence of private and professional types of networks demonstrates the importance of stability of migration in the migration network system between the EU and Ukraine.

## **9. Living and working conditions of irregular Ukrainian female carer givers in Italy**

---

<sup>166</sup> M2 Migrant interview

### 9.1.1 'Badanti'

The Italian word for female carers for the elderly 'badante' originates from the verb 'badare', which simply means to supervise somebody. The research on migrant carers for the elderly often only views them from the angle of their function and utility, not taking into account the complex reality of migrant workers, which does not just involve the foreign worker, but also their micro-cosmos and the structures and internal mechanisms of the society they come from. The carer can either work within certain working hours or provide permanent care and live with the old person. The latter, employment as a 'badante fisso' (fixed) comprises continuing availability 24 hours a day and dedication to the person, always being on call.<sup>167</sup>

While the motivation of family members who care for an elderly person is connected to the emotional and affectionate relationship, a Ukrainian woman coming to Italy to find a job illegally is motivated by economic objectives, namely the expectation of a better income. Irregular Ukrainian female migrants choose a fixed type of occupation as a 'badante' because of financial and organizational advantages. Theoretically it is necessary to be in possession of a residence permit ('permesso di soggiorno') to find accommodation and work. In most cases these women have no exactly planned migration project. The chance to solve the problems of accommodation, lodging and employment from the first day of arrival, and to bypass living expenses so they can send the biggest amount of their salary to their families back home makes this kind of work particularly attractive for newly arrived irregular Ukrainian female migrants. Accommodation means more than a place to live to irregular migrants, as it is also a shelter from police. The danger of being detected in a private household is fairly low, as only few checks are conducted in the domestic sphere. Principally the conditions as a fixed 'badante' are also a good opportunity to acclimatize with the new language and culture and gain professional experience.<sup>168</sup>

---

<sup>167</sup> Studi Emigrazione, p. 562.

<sup>168</sup> Radioni, Osservatorio, p. 246-248

### 9.1.2 Italian employers and the hiring process of Ukrainian ‘badanti’

The compatibility between workers’ and clients’ needs regarding living arrangements makes this form of occupation attractive for irregular Ukrainian women as well as for Italian employers. The clandestine nature of living and working irregularly is not only caused by laws that hinder regular employment for Ukrainian women, but also by Italian families’ demand for low wages. Italian employers encourage informality, because they benefit financially from the live- in solution of the irregular ‘badante’. Undocumented Ukrainian carers almost always work cash-in-hand and employers save on taxes and social contributions. Ukrainian ‘badanti’ receive low salaries but are provided with board and lodging in return for low salaries, which makes 24-hour care feasible and affordable for Italian families. For 750 to 900 US dollars, depending on the employment in the South or in the wealthier North of Italy, Ukrainian live-in carers provide flexible, individually tailored care for the elderly person. To invite a Ukrainian worker officially for employment as a carer is a very long, torturous and expensive bureaucratic procedure which takes about one year. Employees and women without a residence permit find each other by word of mouth (‘passaparola’). Almost every family knows somebody who has a ‘badante’, who then could arrange contact with another woman searching for this type of work. Ukrainians have the reputation of being reliable, hard workers and undemanding, which might partly derive from the women’s high educational level and their will to work as much as possible to financially support their families and to return. An internal irregular Ukrainian job market has developed parallel to legal employment agencies in Italy. A simple way for Italian families to hire a badante is to go directly to the places where Ukrainian women gather and wait to find a job. Such places exist in every bigger Italian city, in the centre of Mantova as well as in Rome, namely in front of the main train station ‘Termini’, at the metro station ‘Piramide’ and ‘Ottavio’, and to a large extent at Rebibbia.<sup>169</sup> The Ukrainian women line up each day to offer themselves as a badante or domestic worker until they find a job. These meeting places are highly visible, but Italian police turn a blind eye. Only sometimes do police arrest a few women for deterrence.<sup>170</sup>

---

<sup>169</sup> Radoni, *Osservatorio*, p. 251.

<sup>170</sup> M1 Interview

It is also common among Ukrainian ‘badanti’ to ‘sell’ work places to other Ukrainian women. When they leave their work as a ‘badante’ to return to Ukraine, they sell their jobs to other Ukrainian women, who continue their work. This system is beneficial to the Ukrainian women leaving their work, as they receive additional money, as well as to the newly arrived Ukrainian women, who can quickly take up their new job, and the employer has a direct substitute for his former ‘badante’.<sup>171</sup>

A self managed rotation system set up by Ukrainian domestic and care workers in Italy enables legalized Ukrainian carers to leave their work place to return home at irregular intervals without losing their employment. In particular 24-hour carers might be needed as substitute carers if personal matters have to be solved. The Ukrainian network can cushion the danger of women being trapped in dependency on their employer, a problem especially familiar to irregular live-in maids.<sup>172</sup>

The permanent demand for low-wage migrant labour in the secondary labour market segment of Italy causes a permanent import of workers from abroad and wages do not increase even if some migrants quit their jobs. Since Romania joined the EU, Romanian female migrants increasingly compete for jobs Ukrainian women apply for and beat down prices for care work. For Romanian nationals it is easier to acquire visas to enter Italy, and Romanian women are willing to work for the same or even lower salaries than Ukrainian women. The fact that the Romanian language has a high affinity to Italian is an additional asset for Romanian carers as they quickly pick up Italian words.<sup>173</sup>

Ukrainian women need the help of the families they live in to be able to apply for legal documents during legalisation campaigns. Bridget Anderson mentions an interesting aspect of this form of employment: the friendly relationship of the Italian employer with the ‘badante’ might be used ‘(...) to confirm the employer’s kindness and workers childlike inferiority. Through kindness and charity the woman in power asserts her

---

<sup>171</sup> M 1 Interview

<sup>172</sup> Morokvasik, *Crossing* pp. 10- 12.

<sup>173</sup> E1 Interview with Ukrainian Caritas

feminine qualities of morality and pity over her helpless recipient'.<sup>174</sup> Ukrainian women working as a 'badante' make it possible for the female employer to take the role of moral and spiritual support to her family, freeing her from dirty work. Racial and gender divisions of labour are reproduced through these forms of occupation.

## **9.2 Transnational daily life of irregular Ukrainian female labour migrants**

Central to Ukrainian women working in Italy is the temporality of their migration project, as they wish to return to Ukraine as soon as their financial goals have been achieved. The native country also fulfils the function of insurance in times of crisis for irregular Ukrainian female migrants. Therefore Ukrainian migrants try to achieve transnational relationships by continuing circulation of people, goods and communication, which produces 'transmigratory spaces' as the migrant participates simultaneously in Italian and Ukrainian social spheres across national borders. An irregular status has a crucial effect on the ability of Ukrainian migrants to stay connected with their home country because it impedes free circulation and personal reunions with family members in Ukraine. Even regular Ukrainian women taking care of elderly people have difficulty in staying mobile, as their job often requires 24-hour presence. Irregularity makes multiple entry impossible and work as a 'badante' ties Ukrainian women to their place of residence. But women find niches and alternative ways to create presence in their working life in Italy and family life in Ukraine. Undocumented Ukrainian women in Italy maintain their family ties in Ukraine through modern communication technologies and transnational Ukrainian networks. Migrants sustaining contact with family members in their home places is not a new phenomenon, however, the quality of connection is enhanced through improved modern transportation and communication facilities, easing transnational lifestyles.

Ukrainian women stay in touch by e-mails, phone calls, letters and packages sent to Ukraine. Often women spend a large amount of their salaries on phone calls as only few

---

<sup>174</sup> Anderson, Bridget, Why madam has so many bathrobes: Demand for migrant domestic workers in EU, *Tijdschrift voor economische en sociale geografie*: Volume 92 Issue 1, 17 Dec 2002. pp. 18 - 26  
><http://www3.interscience.wiley.com/journal/119019635/abstract?CRETRY=1&SRETRY=0> > [access: 30.04.2010]

Ukrainian households have internet access and can use cost- saving internet services. However, mobile phones are widespread also in Ukraine, even in rural regions out of reach, making personal contact possible. In almost every Italian city, telephone shops have spread thanks to the various migrants using their communication services, and various special telephone cards for calls to Ukraine are available at Italian ‘tabacchiao’ (kiosks). Financial hardships limit the quantity of telephone calls. Well-connected network systems of services in conjunction with a variety public and private buses transporting not only people but also goods back and forth between Italy and Ukraine replace regular home visits and facilitate connections of Ukrainian migrants in Italy with their homeland.

Transportation networks provide important services to irregular Ukrainian migrants. Especially the extensive Ukrainian-run bus systems promote the circulation of letters and packets of money, as well as goods. In each bigger Italian city, Ukrainian buses leave for Ukraine almost every day. Bus tickets are available for about 80-100 euros from Ukraine to Italy with the advantage over flying that people can depart any time without having to book a seat in advance and that bus services can be completely managed by Ukrainians. However, the 24-36 hour bus journey is long and exhausting and the bus trips can be dangerous. Every week, some of the buses which leave from and for almost all Italian cities have accidents with dead or injured passengers.

Weekly bus services between Italy and several cities in Ukraine fulfil the function of a national mailing service. Buses transport goods from Ukraine, like Ukrainian newspapers or food, and personal packages from Ukraine to Italy and the other way around. The system works very efficiently: The family back in Ukraine, who wants to send for example a package with herbs and other products from their gardens come to the place of bus departure and talk directly to the bus driver. For a certain amount of money the bus driver takes the package to Italy and delivers the package to the Ukrainian migrant woman, who picks it up at arrival time at the previously arranged place of delivery,

usually the bus station. The tariffs for this mail service are very affordable and always fixed, in general not more than two euros per kilogram.<sup>175</sup>

Not only goods, but also migrant remittances are sent this way. Remittances reflect the permanent ties to the home place as they function as an “insurance policy” for the whole family. The money is directly transferred by bus at low cost to the receiving families in Ukraine within 1-2 days after bus departure without having to pass banks or agencies (like Western Union). Especially for families in small, out-of-reach Ukrainian villages, this system is very convenient. Migrants’ remittances are a striking symbol of the connection between migrants in Italy and their families in Ukraine.<sup>176</sup>

Ukrainian women surround themselves with their home country by meeting fellow Ukrainians, attending Ukrainian religious services, buying Ukrainian food and journals, celebrating Ukrainian holidays, and using Ukrainian medical and care services in Italy. Their involvement in Ukrainian networks and arrangements is boosted by their irregular status, as it hinders them in many ways to access Italian living and structures. Moments of social contact with their fellow Ukrainians give relief from the hard work as a ‘badante’.

An important moment of socializing and psychological and spiritual support for Ukrainian carers is provided by religious institutions. For example the Sunday Mass of the Greek Catholic church in Rome held in Ukrainian attracts hundreds of believers. A large religious community of Ukrainian Catholics comes from the oblast(district) of L’viv, a region in Western Ukraine, which is culturally influenced by the neighbouring country, Poland, as this province once belonged to Poland. Many Ukrainian women choose to invest their little free time, usually on Sundays, in religious services and social gatherings with their Ukrainian friends. After the religious service, some women meet in the church yard to have a picnic with typical products from Ukraine, while others settle their private matters. Paradoxically, the free time is not always viewed positively, as these breaks from work also mean a loss of earnings. Additionally live-in ‘badanti’

---

<sup>175</sup> M1 Caritas

<sup>176</sup> Radioni, Osservatorio, p. 250.

without alternative accommodation might have to leave the house in any weather, which can turn out to be a problem if they do not have anywhere else to go. In some cities some associations offer sheltered places dedicated to socialization.<sup>177</sup>

### **9.3 Psychological and social consequences of irregular labour migration for Ukrainian women in Italy and their families in Ukraine**

The work as a 'badante' does not only involve taking care of an old or sick person, but is a very delicate form of occupation because it situates the worker within a set of social relations and necessarily means that an affectionate relationship develops over time with the elderly. To work as a carer for the elderly is very demanding, exhausting work psychologically and physically. To live an independent life is almost impossible due to sharing the same living space with the person cared for. Inevitably an overlapping job and private life takes place. Living in makes it difficult to refuse any work because the women are on duty day and night. The elderly in need of round-the-clock care provide women with most money but also with most work and problems. The frequent poor physical or mental health of these patients complicates the round-the-clock assistance. The inability of the elderly person to communicate properly, for example in cases of Alzheimer, have devastating effects on the psychological state of irregular workers. For example the elderly person could forget that the Ukrainian woman is working for her and call the police.

A 'double or triple drama' can occur for the carer concerned when the employment ends with the death of the old person cared for. On the one hand there is the emotional grief of the bereavement of a person who was involved in their daily life. On the other hand there is the financial aspect - the loss of their job. A third problem is often the loss of board and lodging which comes along with the job loss.

In the long run, the working conditions in the irregular care sector do not offer the same guarantees provided for other dependent workers in legal employment. Social

---

<sup>177</sup> Radioni, *Osservatorio*, p. 252.

contributions for future pensions are not paid, and these women might have problems explaining their occupation to employers and will have an “empty spot” in their CV.

Work as a ‘badante’ is very hard work from the physical and psychological point of view, therefore most Ukrainian women decide to work in this area only in the first years of their arrival in Italy until another occupation is found, or switch to the occupation form of a ‘badante a ore’, a carer ‘at hours’. Women in that position have to deal with living expenses and the organization of accommodation by themselves, which can enhance many problems, given their irregular status. On the other hand, the fact that the place of work and place of living are divided allows a break from work and makes life more independent and less psychologically exhausting in comparison to fixed employment. Ukrainian women who work part time can ration their time according to their will, leaving time for own activities.

Not only the working and living conditions of an occupation as a carer, also labour migration itself and in particular irregular forms of migration have serious consequences for Ukrainian women. Despite the aspect of irregularity being considered the least important obstacle for migration by Ukrainians,<sup>178</sup> it enhances high physical efforts and psychological strains. Often Ukrainian women underestimate the difficulties deriving from their irregular status. Surveys show that almost all Ukrainian repatriates would like to return to their former country of destination but only if legal documents are provided as the stay is too psychologically troublesome.<sup>179</sup> The omnipresent fear of being stopped by the police and punished makes them accept low salaries and bad working conditions. Irregularity and round-the-clock occupation lock the ‘badanti’ into the places they live in and makes them become ‘prisoners’.<sup>180</sup> Undocumented workers have low access to life outside the home, and large Ukrainian networks make it possible to manage their life away from Italians, as irregular Ukrainians tend to mistrust public Italian structures and people.<sup>181</sup> Emotional stress also stems from the loss of social status in Italy in a foreign country with a culture and language alien to Ukrainian women, in particular in the fist

---

<sup>178</sup> Hasse, *Illegale* p. 67.

<sup>179</sup> Hasse, *Illegale* pp. 61-77.

<sup>180</sup> Interview E 1

<sup>181</sup> Zimmer, Kerstin, *Die Ukraine als ein Aus-Ein- und Rückwanderungsland*, Marburg: Phillips-Universität 2007 < [www.staff.uni-marburg.de/~zimmerk/reisebericht\\_2seitig.pdf](http://www.staff.uni-marburg.de/~zimmerk/reisebericht_2seitig.pdf) > [accessed 03.02.2010]

years of migration. Some women avoid telling their problems to their families, to not make them worry. The ‘migration pressure’ to appear as a successful migrant makes Ukrainian women as well as men make their migration experience sound better in public. Moneyless repatriates find themselves in a worse financial and personal condition than before migration. In particular Ukrainian women who return from work in Italy are often stigmatised as prostitutes in Ukrainian society. Regrettably only few researchers give attention to the situation of Ukrainian women after their return to Ukraine.

Surveys suggest that Ukrainian women seem to prepare their stay abroad more carefully and try to avoid conflicts with authorities and police in the country of destination, while men tend to be more willing to take risks.<sup>182</sup> My impressions from my interaction with Ukrainian women during my research exemplify this conclusion:

*Svetlana and Vladimir P., siblings, both irregularly in Italy*

*Vladimir P. actively participated in local activities, while Svetlana P. often did not even dare to go out shopping.<sup>183</sup>*

This behaviour possibly derives from culturally imposed gender manners and the fact that women are more in danger of becoming victims of criminal assaults. Irregular female migrants working as live-in carers are vulnerable to sexual harassment and psychological abuse by their Italian employees.<sup>184</sup> I will not further deal with the topic of sexual exploitation and human trafficking though, as it would exceed the frame of this dissertation by far.

#### **9.4 The consequences of irregularity in connection to the duration of stay**

---

<sup>182</sup> Hasse, *Illegale* 50 -51

<sup>183</sup> M 1 and M 2 Interview

<sup>184</sup> M 1 experienced this problem and quit the job within the day she started

The life as a 'badante' encourages total commitment to the Italian family - while the migrant's own family is far away. The dilemma of separation from family and friends left at home<sup>185</sup> and the knowledge of the low chances of family reunification for a long time until enough money is earned create harsh psychological pressures. Despite the intention of avoiding a long term settlement in Italy, the stay abroad turns into a long period of time. Often financial goals are more difficult to reach than calculated or new needs by the family or the women themselves appear.

*'First I came to work in Italy to support my son and my parents because I divorced from my husband and my financial situation worsened dramatically. Then my son started school and needed books and clothes. Now my mum has heart problems and needs expensive medical care.'*<sup>186</sup>

In most cases Ukrainian women's motivation to apply for residence permits, the 'permesso di soggiorno', is not for permanent settlement but for travel facilitation and an improved working situation. Until the moment of legalization, the ability to return to the Ukrainian homeland becomes a luxury, which only regular Ukrainians can obtain. But often legalized Ukrainian women do not make use of it anymore. A lot of Ukrainian migrants report how life in Ukraine and they themselves have changed during the years. When Ukrainian female migrants finally decide to return because they have earned enough money or are homesick, they often do not find their way in Ukraine any more and return to the previous country in the EU. In many cases the rapprochement to the culture of the host country entails an alienation from Ukraine. This is reflected in surveys, in which the percentage of women who wanted to remain abroad increased proportionally to their duration of stay. 'Culmulative causation' is ascribed to the phenomenon that factors that prolong migration might change over time and be different from those initiating it. The term 'cumulative causation' in this context brings to light a factor for

---

<sup>185</sup> For an example of a poetic song talking about the distance to mother land and separation from family created by an irregular Ukrainian migrant see appendices A 1

<sup>186</sup> Interview M 3

remigration.<sup>187</sup> While push factors like economic necessities cause Ukrainian women to leave the country, the alienation from their home country and family members after long periods of time are reasons why many migrants return to Italy. The transformational quality of the local is a prominent factor: migrants return to changed places as a changed person. Ukrainian women in Italy adapt to their new environment and work, and the former home might be perceived as past and strange after many years of staying in Italy. Many Ukrainian labour migrants develop into ‘commuters between two worlds’, but do not really belong and feel at home in either of them.<sup>188</sup>

Many Ukrainian women work hard and live in self-sacrificing austerity for the sake of their children to achieve the greatest financial support possible. The economic benefits and improved living standards of labour migration from the individual point of view stand against negative social consequences connected to migration. Regardless of the constant contact with their family at home, the long periods abroad do not only leave the women in Italy but also their families and social relationships in Ukraine unaffected.

In Ukraine, but particularly in Western Ukraine, about 10,000 to 30,000 ‘migration orphans’ grow up without one or both of their parents. In many cases grandparents take up the mother role in the family. A lot of Ukrainian women feel guilty to have left their children and try to replace the lack of support for family and children in emotional matters with sending money and presents. A kind of ‘transnational motherhood’ is set up, which cannot however substitute personal presence. During women’s long absences their family manages life without them leading to emotional estrangement of children to their mother and husbands to their wives.<sup>189</sup>

*‘It hurts when you come home after years of hard working abroad and your own children don’t recognize you as their mother anymore.’<sup>190</sup>*

---

<sup>187</sup> Radoni, *Osservatorio*, p. 248

<sup>188</sup> Interview M 1

<sup>189</sup> La Strada: *Problems of children of labour migrants: an analysis of the situation*. International Women’s rights center “La Strada- Ukraine”. Ukrainian Institute for Social Research after Olexnder Yaremenko. Kirovograd Law Institute of Kharkiv National University of Internal Affairs. Tov Agenstvo Ukraina. Kiev 2006. p.10.

<sup>190</sup> Interview M 3

Husbands taking care of children can often not handle the situation and their new role as housemen. Men loose status in Ukrainian society because reproduction work is not very valued and as a consequence men start heavy drinking or give the children to relatives. Women becoming the economic pillar of the family provokes tensions and transformations in the relations between the sexes and generations. Long separations of families due to labour migration often end in divorce and splits of women from their partners. Sometimes the relationship or marriage is already broken at the point of leaving.

If Ukrainian women finally manage to receive an official status, social relations have eroded over time and women often decide to prolong their stay in Italy or to apply for family reunion in Italy despite the initial intention to return as soon as possible to Ukraine. In fact the impossibility of obtaining visas for Italy has in many cases the opposite effect than intended by European visa policies: The impossibility of returning at regular intervals to Ukraine and of keeping up their relationships at home causes Ukrainian migrants to settle in Italy. A regular status would allow Ukrainian migrants to improve their working and living conditions in Italy and to obtain their social relationships for resettlement in Ukraine.<sup>191</sup>

#### **IV) Conclusion**

As the macro-economic, neoclassical theory explains, migration movements are driven by wage disparities, causing people from low- income countries to migrate to countries with high income levels. In fact, irregular female labour migration from Ukraine to Italy is to the largest extent economically motivated. Ukrainian irregular female labour migration to Italy is a consequence of the combination of push and pull factors like the major factor of low income and standards of living levels in Ukraine in combination with the higher income and the demand for cheap female labour in Italy, generated by the geographical proximity and existing networks. Women's daily life in Italy is

---

<sup>191</sup> Studi Emigrazione, p. 520.

transnationally focused and organized, but their irregular status and the subsequent long separation from Ukraine has severe effects on transnational lifestyles.

Irregular migration is employed as a strategy to financially secure their families and children in Ukraine and raise standards of living, which are particularly female migration goals. However, these push factors alone do not explain Italy as the country of destination of female migration flows from Ukraine. Comparatively high income and demand for female migrant labour in the largely informal service sector due to changing demographic developments and family patterns in Italy make migrants respond to this. The aging population, the withdrawal of state support and the feminization of the Italian labour force over the past twenty years set the foundations for the effective demand for unregulated care labour.

Next to economic factors for migration, also gender role related motivations and values, traditions or societal pressures are of concern for women since they seek to escape from a double burden. The increasing number of women migrating for work to Italy reflects the state of transition of family structures in Ukraine and the involvement of Ukraine in post-industrial movements, which are characterized by the increase of female migrants in the sphere of domestic and care services.<sup>192</sup>

Transnational informal networks are the link between current and prospective migrants, between the migration intentions and actual migration success, and give a wide range of Ukrainians the opportunity to use labour migration as an alternative source of income despite visa restrictions. The lack of legal security in case of irregular migration from Ukraine is compensated by migration networks. Ukrainian women's ability to sustain transnational lifestyles with the help of networks within the limits of irregularity becomes the most important form of social capital for their stay Italy. The know-how of individuals promotes the formation of networks, which catalyse migration movements from Ukraine to Italy, no matter if legal or irregular. Ukrainian private and 'professional' networks create opportunities for action and the ability to influence living and working

---

<sup>192</sup> Studi Emigrazione, p. 528

conditions outside of official or public structures in Italy. In Italy a Ukrainian ‘micro-cosmos’ is sustained through Ukrainian networks providing all kinds of services for particular needs of Ukrainian carers and transnational interconnection with Ukraine for Ukrainian female migrants available despite the obstacles of irregularity. The inability to cover travel and communication expenses and a lack of private networks are significant obstacles to positive migration decisions but not to irregularity. The push factors and pull factors are so strong and the function of the networks so useful, that irregularity has little inhibitory effect on the migration willingness of Ukrainian women. On the decision to migrate to Italy itself, irregularity has no influence, but for the lives of Ukrainian women in Italy their irregular status has far-reaching consequences. Irregularity limits Ukrainian women’s ability to pursue transnational lifestyles. Despite big efforts to sustain transnational connections between Ukraine and Italy and the intention of temporary limitation of their migration project, the factor of duration should not be underestimated. Women with children have to deal with financial support versus emotional care. Women’s labour migration makes higher living standards possible, but the separation from their families in Ukraine creates extensive consequences for the woman herself and her relationships to her family back in Ukraine. Working as a caregiver in Italy reinforces gender boundaries and division of labour, but challenges gender roles in Ukraine. Although women take up a breadwinner role for their family, the hard work and psychological hardship as a ‘badante’ and their continuation of traditional female reproductive work makes it questionable if women can emancipate themselves from patriarchal structures in Ukraine.

As long as wage disparities, a lack of perspectives on the Ukrainian labour market, and the high demand in EU countries for cheap labour in combination with insufficient legal possibilities for Ukrainians continue, it is unlikely that the situation is going to change for women or men. According to the EU commission, today in EU states the number of deaths outnumbers birth rates. The demographic changes of aging populations will increase the demand in the EU for migrant labour within a globalized economy even further. The improvement of communication and transport means, contribute to the

constant rise of Ukrainian migrants in the EU.<sup>193</sup> Additional gender specific pressures, as pointed out in this section, leave few alternatives to Ukrainian women than to migrate.

European as well as Ukrainian politics should open their eyes to irregular female migrants from Ukraine, who already fulfil indispensable functions in elderly care and other sectors in the Italian and other EU- labour markets. Migrant's rights and in particular women's issues, should be protected through better legal conditions and supporting structures for them in the destination country. Because the economic situation is not going to change quickly, it is important to improve information for women on the consequences and dangers of migration and possible alternatives in Ukraine. Today, mainly NGO's deal with migration issues in Ukraine, but government in Ukraine should be more engaged.

---

<sup>193</sup> Ministry of Labour and Social Policy of Ukraine. International Labour Office 2005. P. 62.

## Bibliography

### Primary Sources

### Interviewees

#### 1. a) Experts ('E')

- Ihor Markov, Director of Caritas Lviv and author of a book about labour migration from Ukraine<sup>194</sup>
- George Gigauri, Project Director of the International Organization for Migration (IOM), Kiev<sup>195</sup>
- Luba Maksymovych, Western Ukrainain Center Women`s Perspectives, Lviv
- Sofia Lytvyn, Project coordination of the International Labour Office / Kiev, department of International Labour Organization (ILO).<sup>196</sup>
- Mariana Harasmus, team- assistent in the Ukraine- office of the Konrad-Adenauer- Foundation (KAS), Kiev
- Oleg Hospodarsky, Chairmen of the Association of Ukrainian care givers in Italy, Rome<sup>197</sup>

#### 2. Daily life interlocutors ('M')

##### 1) former and current labour migrants

1. Svetlana and Vladimir P, 26 and 24 years old
2. Lena 32 years old

##### 2) *being in contact with labour migrants*

- Ludmilla Sergeijenko, Lviv, pensioner. Her neighbours go for work to EU. She had heard many bad stories about the danger of labour migration.

---

<sup>194</sup> Expert interviews possible to hear on audio

<sup>195</sup> Expert interviews possible to hear on audio

<sup>196</sup> Expert interviews possible to hear on audio

<sup>197</sup> Expert interviews possible to hear on audio

## Secondary Sources

### I. Books

Al-Ali, Nadjé/Koser, Khalid, eds., New Approaches to Migration? Transnational communities and the transformation of home, London/New York: Routledge 2002

Boeckh, Karin/Völkl, Ekkehard: Ukraine, Von der Roten zur Orangen Revolution, Regensburg: Verlag Friedrich Pustet/Südosteuropa-Gesellschaft 2007

Bohachevsky- Chomiak, Marta: Women in Ukrainian, Feminists despite themselves. Community Life 1884-1939, Alberta :Canadian Institute of Ukrainian Studies, University of Alberta 1988

---

Bohle, D., `The EU and Eastern Europe: 'Failing the test as a better world power`, in L. Panitch, C. Leys eds., Merlin Press, London, 2005

Bohn, Thomas,M., Neutatz, Dietmar ed. Studienhandbuch Östliches Europa, Volume 2, Geschichte des Russischen Reiches und der Sowjetunion, Köln: Böhlau Verlag, 2002

Di Nicola, Andrea, Transcrime, Trafficking in Immigrants: A European Perspective, Prag: University of Trento 1999

Brettell, Caroline B., Hollifield, James F., eds. , Migration Theory: Talking across the disciplines, New York: Routledge, 2000

Dasgupta, Partha, Overview – Chapter in Economic Progress and the Idea of Social Capital, Social capital : a multifaceted perspective / eds., Partha Dasgupta, Ismail Serageldin Washington, D.C. : World Bank 1999

Faist, Thomas, ed., Transstaatliche Räume. Politik, Wirtschaft und Kultur in und zwischen Deutschland und der Türkei, Bielfeld: Transcript Verlag 2000,

Füllsack, Manfred, Postsowjetische Gesellschaft. Desintegration, Marktwirtschaft, Nationalismus und die Stellung der Frau in Russland, Vienna: Turia + Kant, 1996

---

Hoffmann-Nowotny, H.-J. ed., Soziale Indikatoren VIII. Sozialbilanzierung. Konzepte und Forschungsansätze, Frankfurt: Campus 1981

Hasse, H. Rolf/ Kunze, Cornelia (Hrsg.): Illegale Arbeitsmigration nach Deutschland aus der Ukraine. Transformation. Leipziger Beiträge zu Wirtschaft und Gesellschaft. Leipziger Universitätsverlag 2003

Haug, Sonja und Pichler Edith, `Soziale Netzwerke und Transnationalität: Neue Ansätze für die historische Migrationsforschung`, in Motte, Ohliger, von Oswald, 50 Jahre Bundesrepublik - 50 Jahre Einwanderung: Nachkriegsgeschichte als Migrationsgeschichte, Frankfurt am Main, New York: Campus 1999

Isajiv, Wsevolod W.: Society in Transition. Social change in Ukraine in Western perspectives. Canadian Scholars' Press Inc. Toronto 2003

---

Kalter, Frank in U.Mueller, Hrsg. Handbuch der Demographie 1, Modelle und Methoden, Berlin/Heidelbg. 2000

Koval, Vitalina: Women in contemporary Russia. Berghahn Books, Providence, 1995

Kuehnast, Kathleen and Nechemias, Carol: Post- Soviet Women Encountering Transition. Nation Building, Economic Survival and Civic Activism, Washington D.C: Woodrow Wilson Center Press,. 2004

---

Lee, Everett, `Eine theorie der Wanderung` in Széll, György, ed., Regionale Mobilität, Elf Ansätze, München: Nymphenburger 1972

Marsh, Rosalind (Editor), Women in Russia and Ukraine, Cambridge: University Press. Cambridge, 1996

Markov, Ihor, ed., Ukrainian Labour Migration in Europe/ Findings of the Complex Research of Ukrainian Labour Immigration Processes, Lviv, International Charitable Foundation „Caritas Ukraine“, 2009

Morokvasik, Mirjana, `Crossing Borders and Shifting Boundaries of Belonging in Post-Wall Europe. A gender Lens`, in eds., Berthoin Antal & Quack, Grenzüberschreitung – Grenzziehung, Implikationen für Innovation und Identität, Berlin: Sigma 2006

Nanni, Maria Pola / Pittau, Franco, ed., Le condizioni di vita e di lavoro degli immigrati nell'area romana, Roma: Centro Studi e Ricerche IDOS in collaborazione con Commissione de Indagine sull'Esclusione Sociale, Caritas Italiana, Caritas diocesana de Roma, luglio 2008

Parkhomenko, Nataliya. Ukrainian Labour Migration in the enlarged Europe, Kiew: Center for Peace, Conversion and Foreign Policy of Ukraine 2005

Pries, Ludger, `Transnationale Soziale Räume: Theoretisch-empirische Skizze am Beispiel der Arbeitswanderungen Mexiko – US`, in Perspektiven der Weltgesellschaft, ed.. Ulrich Beck, Frankfurt a.M.: Suhrkamp 1998

Piore, Michael J., Birds of Passage: Migrant Labor and Industrial Societies, N Y: Cambridge University Press 1979

Ernst G. Ravenstein, The Laws of Migration, 1885

Simmel, G., 1917 Grundfragen der Soziologie (Individuum und Gesellschaft). Berlin/Leipzig: Goschen.

Smith, Michael Peter, Transnational Urbanism Locating Globalization, Malden/MA.: Blackwell Publishers, 2000

Westwood, Sally, Phizacklea, Annie, Trans-Nationalism and the Politics of Belonging, London: Routledge 2000

Yeandle, Sue, 'Women, Men and Non-standard Employment' in Rosemary Crompton, Restructuring Gender Relations and Employment. The Decline of the Male Breadwinner, New York: Oxford University Press, 1999)

Zhurzenko, Tatiana: "Strong Women, Weak State: Family Politics and Nation Building in Post Soviet Ukraine." in Kuehnast, Kathleen and Nechemias, Carol: Post- Soviet Women Encountering Transition. Nation Building, Economic Survival and Civic Activism, Washington D.C.: Woodrow Wilson Center Press 2004.

## II. Journals

Anderson, Bridget, Why madam has so many bathrobes: Demand for migrant domestic workers in EU, Tijdschrift voor economische en sociale geografie: Volume 92 Issue 1, 17 Dec 2002

Borchers, Kevin, Breustedt, Wiebke, eds., Die Datenlage im Bereich internationaler Migration, Working Paper 18 der Forschungsgruppe des bamf, 2008

Borkert, Maren, Integration von Zuwanderern in Italien, Wiesbaden: VS, Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften 2008, pp. 20-26.

Bourdieu, Ökonomisches Kapital, kulturelles Kapital, in ed. Kreckel, R., Soziales Kapital in Soziale Ungleichheiten, Soziale Welt, SHeft 2, Chap.4, Goettingen: Schartz&Co. 1983

Caritas, Curatori dei capitoli, `Immigrazione`, Dossier Statistico 2008, XVIII Rapporto

Dietz, Barbara, `Migrationen in der Ukraine: Hintergründe und Trends. Ergebnisse einer Haushaltsbefragung`, Kurzanalysen und Informationen Nr.29, 12/2007, Osteuropa- Institut Regensburg

Dietz, Barbara, Europaeische Integration von unten? Mittel – und Osteuropaeische Migranten in Deutschland und die Rolle transnationaler Netzwerke im EU- Erweiterungsprozess`, Forost Arbeitspapier, Nr. 34, 11/2005, Munich

Dietz, Barbara, Die Ukraine im europäischen Migrationssystem. ApuZ. Aus Politik und Zeitgeschichte. Migration in Europa. Beilage zur Wochenzeitung das Parlament. 35-36/2008

Hertlein, Stephanie, Soziale Netzwerke als Beitrag zur Überlebenssicherung, Magisterarbeit SS 2008 an der Universität Freiburg

Hasse, H. Rolf, Kunze, Cornelia, eds., Illegale Arbeitsmigration nach Deutschland aus der Ukraine, Transformation, Leipziger Beiträge zu Wirtschaft und Gesellschaft, Leipzig: Leipziger Universitätsverlag 2003

International Organization for Migration (IOM), ed., Labour Migration Assessment for the WNIS Region, IOM Publication, February 2006

Lebhart, Gustav, Internationale Migration - Hypothesen, Perspektiven und Theorien, Demographie aktuell, Vorträge-Aufsätze-Forschungsberichte, Nr. 19, 2002, Institut für Sozialwissenschaften der Humboldt Universität zu Berlin

Massey, Douglas S., Social Structure, Household Strategies, and the Cumulative Causation of Migration, Population Index, Vol. 56, No. 1, Spring, 1990,

Portes & Sensenbrenner, Embeddedness and immigration: notes on the social determinants of economic action, American Journal of Sociology [AJS]

Studi Emigrazione, International Journal of Migration Studies, 8/2005, Volume XLII, No. 159. Centro Studi Emigrazione, Rome

Лібанової Е.М. Зовнішні трудові міграції населення України. Національна академія наук України. Київ 2002.

Zimmer, Kerstin, Ein ständiges Kommen und Gehen. Die Rolle der Ukraine im europäischen Migrationssystem, Geographische Rundschau 12/2007, Westermann (Braunschweig)

Ministry of Labour and Social Policy of Ukraine, International Labour Office 2005 IOM (1998): Information Campaign against Trafficking in Women from Ukraine, Research Report July 1998. International Organization for migration.

### **III. Internet:**

<http://www.auswaertigesamt.de/diplo/de/Laenderinformationen/Ukraine/Wirtschaftsdatenblatt.html>  
<http://www.cap-lmu.de/aktuell/meldungen/2007/mobilitaet-migration.php>  
<http://www.eurasischesmagazin.de/artikel/?artikeIID=20041212>  
<http://diepresse.com/home/wirtschaft/eastconomist/324692/>  
<http://www.hrw.org/wr2k3/europe15.html>  
<http://www.junge-ukraine.de/html/hintergrund.htm>  
[http://www.iza.org/conference\\_files/bertinoro2007/lehmann\\_h257.pdf](http://www.iza.org/conference_files/bertinoro2007/lehmann_h257.pdf)

kennanInstituteUAmigration.pdf:  
<http://www.iom.int/jahia/page706.html>,  
<http://www.intas.be/surveyresults.html>  
<http://laborsta.ilo.org/cgi-bin/brokerv8.exe>  
<http://www.iom.int/jahia/Jahia/pid/600>  
[www.oecd.org/dataoecd/58/7/39208714](http://www.oecd.org/dataoecd/58/7/39208714).  
[www.4fate.org/italy.pdf](http://www.4fate.org/italy.pdf)  
[www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/csw/factors.htm](http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/csw/factors.htm).  
[www.un.org/womenwatch/osagi/pdf/pressopa08eH.PDF](http://www.un.org/womenwatch/osagi/pdf/pressopa08eH.PDF)  
<http://www.proua.com/news/2007/09/04/102529.html>  
<http://www.laender-analysen.de/ukraine/pdf/2007/UkraineAnalysen32.pdf>  
[http://www.proasyl.de/fileadmin/proasyl/fm\\_redakteure/Newsletter\\_Anhaenge/115/kriminalisierung\\_illegalen](http://www.proasyl.de/fileadmin/proasyl/fm_redakteure/Newsletter_Anhaenge/115/kriminalisierung_illegalen).  
[http://www.proasyl.de/fileadmin/proasyl/fm\\_redakteure/Newsletter\\_Anhaenge/115/kriminalisierung\\_illegalen](http://www.proasyl.de/fileadmin/proasyl/fm_redakteure/Newsletter_Anhaenge/115/kriminalisierung_illegalen).  
[http://www.migration-info.de/mub\\_artikel.php?Id=030704](http://www.migration-info.de/mub_artikel.php?Id=030704)  
[http://www.sanktgeorgen.de/nbi/pdf/vorlesung\\_weltwirtschaft/CGEth\\_WWethik\\_Vorl\\_WiSe05\\_06\\_16bis18.pdf](http://www.sanktgeorgen.de/nbi/pdf/vorlesung_weltwirtschaft/CGEth_WWethik_Vorl_WiSe05_06_16bis18.pdf)  
[http://www.saarbruecken.de/assets/2009\\_8/1249987539\\_siebel\\_-\\_die\\_zukunft\\_der\\_europaeischen\\_stadt-a.pdf](http://www.saarbruecken.de/assets/2009_8/1249987539_siebel_-_die_zukunft_der_europaeischen_stadt-a.pdf)  
<http://www.ukrstat.gov.ua/>  
[www.unicef.org/ukraine/children.html](http://www.unicef.org/ukraine/children.html).  
<http://ukraine.ahk.de/index.php?id=423>  
[www.unicef.org/ukraine/activities\\_4941.html](http://www.unicef.org/ukraine/activities_4941.html)  
[www.owep.de/2006\\_2\\_waskowycz.php](http://www.owep.de/2006_2_waskowycz.php)  
<http://www.zeit.de/2005/02/Ukraine>  
<http://auslandsjournal.zdf.de/ZDFde/inhalt/5/0,1872,7124453,00.html>  
[://www.hrw.org/reports/2003/ukraine0803/3.html](http://www.hrw.org/reports/2003/ukraine0803/3.html)  
[www.un.org/News/Press/docs/2002/WOM1341.doc.htm](http://www.un.org/News/Press/docs/2002/WOM1341.doc.htm)>  
<http://blog.kievukraine.info/2006/09/womens-groups-gather-in-kyiv-to-decry.html>  
<http://www.interfax.com.ua/eng/eco/8383/>  
[https://webdev.ilo.org/pls/apex/f?p=109:51:1064500066011476:::P51\\_CONTENT\\_ID:20167](https://webdev.ilo.org/pls/apex/f?p=109:51:1064500066011476:::P51_CONTENT_ID:20167)  
[http://www.sws-rundschau.at/archiv/SWS\\_2006\\_1\\_lageder.pdf](http://www.sws-rundschau.at/archiv/SWS_2006_1_lageder.pdf)  
[www.un.org/womenwatch/osagi/pdf/pressopa08eH.PDF](http://www.un.org/womenwatch/osagi/pdf/pressopa08eH.PDF)  
<http://www.go2kiev.com/view/costs.html>>  
<http://www.proua.com/news/2007/09/04/102529.html>>  
[www.laender-analysen.de/ukraine/pdf/2006/UkraineAnalysen16.pdf](http://www.laender-analysen.de/ukraine/pdf/2006/UkraineAnalysen16.pdf)  
<http://ukraine.ahk.de/index.php?id=423>  
[www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/csw/factors.htm](http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/csw/factors.htm)  
<http://www.zeit.de/2005/02/Ukraine>

## APPENDECES

### a) Experts

#### Expert interviews

#### M1 Caritas Lviv, Ihor Markov

Ukrainian Greek Catholic Church/ Comission for migrants, **Hryhoriy Seleschuk** and **Ihir Markov**

Question: What are your tasks here at this Caritas Center in Lviv?

*Ihor Markov: We offer Consultation services for legal and psychological problems to reunite families. We are reintegrating migrants who return from the EU into Ukraine. Many expectations of returning people are not real and they have relationship problems. They imagine from far away that Ukraine is differently and when they return they are shocked and they are facing the huge economic problems. They cannot except the reality in Ukraine. The people they know, became different. They left their children when they were babies and they are confronted with their grown up childrens all in a sudden. Abroad they forgot how social problems influence relationships. Bureaucracy and visa problems burden migrants emotionally and finacnially.*

Why are so many women migrating for labour to the European Union?

*Ukrainian women try to manage the reasons for going abroad: women migrate to buy things they need at home. If they would stay they could give support to their children and not money. We have the experience that even though women want to come back and when they come back, eintegration into Ukraine is difficult. It works out only in approximately 50% of the cases, while the other 50% will return to the country abroad.*

*Before the economical crisis we had a boom in construction because of the European Championships in soccer in 2012. But then the crisis came and in Ukraine and also in EU countries like Portugal constructions stopped and all these Ukraine migrants have no job now. But people who have worked there in construction sites do not dare to go back to Ukraine without money and without the possibility to return to Portugal. If more Ukrainians would have a regular status, more people would go back to Ukraine.*

*Anybody in Ukraine who looks for work migrates through networks. The system of social connections is much more progressed than legislation, which is based on old views on migration. In globalized world migrants want to connect with Ukraine by transport, money transfers, communication, but to do this within official frames it would be too expensive. Therefore Ukrainains have created their own structures and irregular ways of organization of these things in this environment. For example the huge system of*

*minibusses! Large networks span all over Europe and Ukraine and the drivers even have their own businesscards. Everywhere are special places from where these busses leave.*

*People who return to Ukraine sell their jobs in Italy. This can be a tricky thing, because it might be dangerous for those people to get caught, but it is working.*

What are the psychological and social consequences of labour migration? What happens to the female labour migrant herself and to her children and family left behind in Ukraine?

*Already so many teenagers became criminals in Ukraine because of labour migration of their mothers. The mother sends money to Ukraine for her family, but the children spent all money and don't do anything, because they get used to their mum's money. She sends her hard earned money for studies and school, but the children use it for the acquisition of a new mobile phone. There are no authorities, no role models for these children of labour migrants, their new role model is only money.*

*This will cause big problems in the future, because the youngsters are used to just get easy money without putting any effort into studying or working and then later on they have big difficulties to stand on their own feet.*

*Migration puts problems on the parents. Mothers feel guilty for leaving their children and try to buy them things or give money instead of love and a feeling of being at home. Children only feel the lack in their life, they are not able to realize the reason of their sad or bad feelings and finally they rebel without knowing against what or why, get out of control of adults and relatives taking care of them. Grandparents are too old to hold them, relatives or friends are emotionally too far away from understanding what is happening with these children fostered by somebody else than their parents. Most of the Ukrainian women abroad have their family at home, in general at least two children, because to care for their family is the woman's essential motivation to seek work abroad.*

*People, like teachers, who work with children and can tell two different categories of children. Those children of migrants and those „normal“ children with parents. The migrants' children are in a very special situation and they have specific needs. The regional state social service for example states that more than 50% of these cases, when parents drink etc., are children from families which have a migrant background.*

Do you know how many women have left their children in Ukraine?

*A huge number! At least four to six million Ukrainians work abroad, about half of them are female. At least 8 million kids are left without their parents in Ukraine. These children are not just a few cases, but they are a huge number of social orphans.*

Does labour migration have any other effects on Ukraine?

*The whole Ukrainian society is under the influence of migration! Remittances of Ukrainians working abroad comprises huge money flows each year. These huge sums of*

*migrant money goes into economy and that is what makes it working. In Western Ukraine small businesses are setup and 80-85% of them are established because of migrant money. We have the problem of the huge social problems because of labour migration versus the big importance of labour migration and migrant's money for Ukraine.*

Do you know how many Ukrainian women migrate to Italy?

*About 600.000 Ukrainian migrants are all over Italy. 195.000 have a regular status. Overall 99% of Ukrainians in Italy are women working in the domestic sphere like caregiving to the elderly, it depends a bit on the region. A big percentage of irregular migrants is in the South of Italy, while in the North more Ukrainians with a regular status live and they often take their families with them after they have been legalized. Especially in Sicily the problem with slavery is existent. The employees take the passports from the women and even after a couple of months of working they receive no money. They are in a very weak position, because they are illegally there and they are told, that their employers will go to the carabinieri [police].*

How does women's life look like in Italy? What problems do they encounter?

*First of all, because the Ukrainian labour migration is invisible, they don't make trouble in Italy. Their mentality is shy, they say don't touch me, just leave me alone. Ukrainians don't trust governmental officials and do not talk to Italian people because they fear to be recognized as irregular. But their mentality is close to European mentality and they want to be part of Europe. Ukrainians have a strong community in Italy with a very high level of self-organisation. They have their own churches and services. On the average Ukrainian women stay 5-6 years abroad and by time they have money but therefore they get mental and emotional problems.*

What is women's motivation to go to Italy?

*The main reason are material needs. Women in Italy are usually married and they go to provide money for their family. They want to renovate the house or buy an apartment for children or they want to pay the study of their children or for medical services for their family members because of serious health problems.*

*Further, the potential migrant sees how his neighbor with very limited financial means in former times, suddenly has his house completely renovated or a new, shiny car is standing on the driveway, because a family member has migrated abroad and now the whole family can afford such things. The potential migrant is trying to do the same. Stories about failed attempts to make money abroad, nobody likes to hear and nobody will tell'.*

*More than 70% of Ukrainian labour migrants in the EU desire to return to Ukraine. They see their future only in Ukraine. The goal why they went is to have the financial possibility of living in Ukraine after they earned some money. But only a few realize this desire. We assume that only 20-25% realize their migration goals within time and that was even before the economic crisis! Now even more migrants cannot realize their goals. Now because of the economic crisis people stay in EU because of the crisis and even more*

*Ukrainian people are willing to go to EU. Ukrainians run away from the economic crisis as in times of the crisis it appears to be easier to survive in the EU than in Ukraine.*

## **E 2**

### **Western Ukrainian Center 'Women`s Perspectives'**

non-profit-organisation

**Luba Maksymovych** / director

*In 2002 there was one of the biggest migration process from Ukraine to Italy. The Organisation handed out 1000 questionnaires to women working in Italy. 95% of the women who immigrated into Italy were going there by tourist visa (7-14 days) looked for work and stayed longer.*

*Adaptably their status was illegal and they were in a difficult human rights situation, where the individual being in there accepts everything and every bad or worse conditions.*

*Especially because of being victims in human trafficking. Against this the only prevention is: integration in the host country or reintegration in the home country.*

*Like in Spain (another Mediterranean country with many women from Ukraine working in households) a lot of elderly people in Italy are without care. Ukrainian women fill the gap and the Italian government did nothing against it.*

#### *Illegal migration*

*It's not possible to prohibit migration or to say these women shouldn't go, but the Western Ukrainian center for Women`s Perspectives advises all women who have the intention to migrate to not give away their passports and to always keep the address of the Ukrainian embassy in their pockets. Further measurements for protection against human trafficking is to ask the employer for a work contract, to learn the language and to be careful with people who invite them for work.*

*Usually they have no work visa but 52% have a short term travel visa for about 7-10 days, 35% have a 2-week visa and 10% of the women got a 1-month visa, only 2% reach a half a year legal stay in Italy.*

## **b) Daily life interlocutors**

### **Migrant Interviews**

#### **I did not completely journalize my conversations with migrants**

##### **M 1**

**Svetlana P.**, from *Kamianets-Podilskyi* (Ukrainian: Кам'янець-Подільський) in Western Ukraine, 26 years old.

- *she has been irregularly in Italy, then she returned to Ukraine and she is glad to have no longer the pressure of living without documents.*

- *Irregularly in Italy since 2005, works as a live-in, round the clock caregiver ('badante')*

*to an elderly Italian woman, earning 800 Euro per month, almost all send home for family and her fiancée to buy a house with her fiancé.*

- *she has an university degree in law studies and worked at the court until she migrated to Roverbella, Lombardia, to take care of an elderly woman to earn money*

- *'We waited several days at the Polish- German border until the 'right' bribed customs officer was in service to pass the border unmolested through a side passage.'*

##### **M 2**

**Vladimir P.**, from *Kamianets-Podilskyi*, Western Ukraine, 24 years old.

- Irregular migrant in Italy from 2004 – 2006, worked on a farm

*When Vladimir arrived in Italy, he lived on the streets of Milano for some days until he found a place to stay for some time at a flat with other Ukrainians. When he called home he did not tell his mother about his difficult situation to not make her worry. Without a "permesso di soggiorno" it was impossible to find a job and the financial situation was worsening rapidly. His only way out of this misery was to take another loan from Ukrainian migrant networks in Italy to buy a false residence permit from the issuing office in Milano. He says there must be collaborates at the Questura of Milano as the document itself is the original. The only difference is that his registration number cannot be found in the immigration computer system. Once he was controlled by police and he showed them his falsified documents. Police seemed to have suspicions but as the residence permit paper was an original they did not check any further. Vladimir found a*

*living and working place and from his first savings he paid 2000 Dollars to bring his sister 'Sveta' irregularly to Italy as well.*

*My interviewee Vladimir P. entered the EU regularly but continued his journey to Italy irregularly. Vladimir P. told he had a tourist visa for Poland, which was a part of the EU in 2005 when he made the trip to Italy, though it was not of the Schengen treaty yet. To cross the border to Germany he and about twelve other Ukrainians waited at the German-Polish border until the right contact man arrived. In little micro busses called Mercedes Sprinters, the group passed Germany and Austria. In each country the busses were equipped with native license plates to not attract attention. Random border controls were conducted that day at the Austrian-Italian border so the group was abandoned and told to use the train to continue their journey. On the train they were caught and they subsequently lost their money they had spent for the trip as well as all group members except Vladimir P. were deported back to Ukraine. Vladimir P. said he was the only one who arrived in Italy, because he had left the group shortly before the controls were conducted to hide in another carriage. An Austrian lady helped him convince the officers that he was an Austrian resident who had forgotten his passport. He also cited previous work experiences in Austria and had sufficient language skills which helped him successfully convince the border guards.*

### **M 3**

**Lena**, from a small village in the Carpathian Mountains in Western Ukraine, 31 years old,

- works in Italy since seven years and is mother of an eleven year old son in Ukraine, who grows up with his grandparents.

- *First I came to work in Italy to support my son and my parents because I divorced from my husband and my financial situation worsened dramatically. Then my son started school and needed books and clothes. Now my mum is heartsick and needs expensive medical care.'*

- *'I would not stay even five minutes in this country. If I would have a good husband I would be in Ukraine now, take care of the household and stay at home.'*

- *'It hurts when you come home after years of hard working abroad and your own children don't recognize you as their mother anymore.'*

## **b) Daily life interlocutors**

### **Migrant Interviews**

*I did not completely journalize my conversations with migrants as a sensitive approach to them was necessary*

#### **M 1**

**Svetlana P.**, from *Kamianets-Podilskyi* (Ukrainian: Кам'янець-Подільський) in Western Ukraine, 26 years old.

*- she has been irregularly in Italy, then she returned to Ukraine and she is glad to have no longer the pressure of living without documents.*

*- Irregularly in Italy since 2005, works as a live-in, round the clock caregiver ('badante')*

*to an elderly Italian woman, earning 800 Euro per month, almost all send home for family and her fiancée to buy a house with her fiancé.*

*- she has an university degree in law studies and worked at the court until she migrated to Roverbella, Lombardia, to take care of an elderly woman to earn money*

*- 'We waited several days at the Polish- German border until the 'right' bribed customs officer was in service to pass the border unmolested through a side passage.'*

#### **M 2**

**Vladimir P.**, from *Kamianets-Podilskyi*, Western Ukraine, 24 years old.

*- Irregular migrant in Italy from 2004 – 2006, worked on a farm*

*When Vladimir arrived in Italy, he lived on the streets of Milano for some days until he found a place to stay for some time at a flat with other Ukrainians. When he called home he did not tell his mother about his difficult situation to not make her worry. Without a "permesso di soggiorno" it was impossible to find a job and the financial situation was worsening rapidly. His only way out of this misery was to take another loan from Ukrainian migrant networks in Italy to buy a false residence permit from the issuing office in Milano. He says there must be collaborates at the Questura of Milano as the document itself is the original. The only difference is that his registration number cannot be found in the immigration computer system. Once he was controlled by police and he showed them his falsified documents. Police seemed to have suspicions but as the residence permit paper was an original they did not check any further. Vladimir found a*

*living and working place and from his first savings he paid 2000 Dollars to bring his sister 'Sveta' irregularly to Italy as well.*

*My interviewee Vladimir P. entered the EU regularly but continued his journey to Italy irregularly. Vladimir P. told he had a tourist visa for Poland, which was a part of the EU in 2005 when he made the trip to Italy, though it was not of the Schengen treaty yet. To cross the border to Germany he and about twelve other Ukrainians waited at the German-Polish border until the right contact man arrived. In little micro busses called Mercedes Sprinters, the group passed Germany and Austria. In each country the busses were equipped with native license plates to not attract attention. Random border controls were conducted that day at the Austrian-Italian border so the group was abandoned and told to use the train to continue their journey. On the train they were caught and they subsequently lost their money they had spent for the trip as well as all group members except Vladimir P. were deported back to Ukraine. Vladimir P. said he was the only one who arrived in Italy, because he had left the group shortly before the controls were conducted to hide in another carriage. An Austrian lady helped him convince the officers that he was an Austrian resident who had forgotten his passport. He also cited previous work experiences in Austria and had sufficient language skills which helped him successfully convince the border guards.*

### **M 3**

**Lena**, from a small village in the Carpathian Mountains in Western Ukraine, 31 years old,

*- works in Italy since seven years and is mother of an eleven year old son in Ukraine, who grows up with his grandparents.*

*- First I came to work in Italy to support my son and my parents because I divorced from my husband and my financial situation worsened dramatically. Then my son started school and needed books and clothes. Now my mum is heartsick and needs expensive medical care.'*

*- 'I would not stay even five minutes in this country. If I would have a good husband I would be in Ukraine now, take care of the household and stay at home.'*

*- 'It hurts when you come home after years of hard working abroad and your own children don't recognize you as their mother anymore.'*

**Chart 2.**

**Ukrainian labour migrants in the European Union**

Country	official	<i>unofficial estimations</i>		
	estimation ukr. government <sup>1</sup> (2006)	Caritas Ukraine <sup>1</sup> (2009)	IOM <sup>2</sup> (2006)	PAUCI <sup>3</sup> (2005)
<b>Italy</b>	<b>195.000</b>	<b>500.000</b>	<b>200.000</b>	<b>350.000</b>
<i>(80-90% females)</i>				
<i>Poland</i>	20.000	450.000	300.000	300.000
<i>Cz. Republic</i>	51.000	150.000	150.000	200.000
<i>Portugal</i>	45.000	75.000	150.000	150.000
<i>Spain</i>	53.000	250.000	100.000	100.000
<i>Greece</i>	20.000	75.000	-	50.000
-----				
Estimated total of all Ukrainian migrants in the EU				
	500.000 to 2 Mio.	4,5 Mio.	2,1 Mio.	2,1 Mio.

(other countries in the EU less frequented)

*In brackets: (year)*

<sup>1</sup> Press release of Caritas Ukraine from 9th April 2008. ( Igor Markov)

<sup>2</sup> IOM, Labour Migration Assesment for the WINIS Region, P.18.

<sup>3</sup> Polish- American- Ukrainian Cooperation Initiative. Parkhomenko 2005, P. 70.