

IMSIS Dissertation Feedback & Mark Sheet

| | |
|----------------------------------|---|
| Student Matriculation No. | Glasgow 2685767 DCU 233434 Charles 79448336 |
| Dissertation Title | Honor Behind Human Trafficking Absenteeism in Italian Mafias |

| | | |
|---|--|--|
| | | |
| <p>Word Count Penalty (1-15% over/under = 1gr point; 15-20% over/under = 2 gr points; 20-25% over/under = 3 gr points; more than 25% over/under = 0 fail)</p> <p>Word Count: 23685 Suggested Penalty: Select from drop down list</p> | | |

JOINT GRADING (subject to agreement of the external examiner and approval at Joint Exam Board)

Final Agreed Mark: A4 [19]

DISSERTATION FEEDBACK

| Assessment Criteria | Rating |
|--|-----------|
| A. Structure and Development of Answer | |
| This refers to your organisational skills and ability to construct an argument in a coherent and original manner | |
| • <i>Originality of topic</i> | Excellent |
| • <i>Coherent set of research questions and/or hypothesis identified</i> | Very Good |
| • <i>Appropriate methodology and evidence of effective organisation of work</i> | Good |
| • <i>Logically structured argument and flow of ideas reflecting research questions</i> | Very Good |
| • <i>Application of theory and/or concepts</i> | Very Good |
| B. Use of Source Material | |
| This refers to your skills to select and use relevant information and data in a correct manner | |
| • <i>Evidence of reading and review of published literature</i> | Very Good |
| • <i>Selection of relevant primary and/or secondary evidence to support argument</i> | Very Good |
| • <i>Critical analysis and evaluation of evidence</i> | Very Good |
| • <i>Accuracy of factual data</i> | Excellent |
| C. Academic Style | |
| This refers to your ability to write in a formal academic manner | |
| • <i>Appropriate formal and clear writing style</i> | Very Good |
| • <i>Accurate spelling, grammar and punctuation</i> | Very Good |
| • <i>Consistent and accurate referencing (including complete bibliography)</i> | Very Good |

IMSIS Dissertation Feedback & Mark Sheet

- | | |
|--|--------------|
| • <i>Is the dissertation free from plagiarism?</i> | Yes |
| • <i>Evidence of ethics approval included (if required based on methodology)</i> | Not required |
| • <i>Appropriate word count</i> | Yes |

ADDITIONAL WRITTEN COMMENTS

Reviewer 1

This is an original anthropological study. The author seeks to explain how honor affects different organized crime (or, as the author terms them, mafia) groups in their attitude to human trafficking. The puzzle is that while the lack of HT agenda in the case of (South) Italian mafia groups might indicate the importance of honor that makes certain honor-based criminal groups to refrain from using such dishonorable practices, Albanian and Nigerian OCGs, being also honor-centered, still engage in HT. The author thus goes a step farther to unbox what appears to be illogical. The author defines four seemingly binary aspects that, as she believes, help them explain the paradox. While the findings of the author are intricate and interesting, I have a feeling that the four aspects don't necessarily fit into the honor-centered paradigm. It would be interesting to see how the author defend their choice and convince the committee about the opposite. Apart from that, the thesis is logically structured, well-written, and presents a fascinating journey into the world of honor and OCGs that is definitely innovative, hard to understand and explore, and particularly hard to draw parallels and causal links about. The thesis doesn't use theories per se, which is rather understandable given its anthropological approach. I definitely consider this thesis, in spite of some fairly understandable shortcomings, a solid one that deserves credit.

Reviewer 2

This dissertation examines an original topic from an anthropological perspective: the effect of honor codes on organised crime's attitudes towards human trafficking. The student offers a comparative analysis of Italian, Albanian, and Nigerian mafias and suggests that deep-rooted honor codes can explain why the Italian mafia groups have been less involved in human trafficking compared to Nigerian and Albanian counterparts. The study is well written and well structured, and offers a fascinating discussion of organised crime and human trafficking in Italy and beyond. That said, I would have liked to see more engagement with the theory, particularly with Paolo Campana's and Federico Varese's sociological swork on Italian mafias.