

CHARLES UNIVERSITY PRAGUE

FACULTY OF SOCIAL SCIENCES

Institute of International Studies



Master thesis

2021

Shpresonë Grulaj

CHARLES UNIVERSITY PRAGUE

FACULTY OF SOCIAL SCIENCES

Institute of International Studies

BECES

Shpresonë Grulaj

**The work of Government and non-Government organizations in
refugee integration in the German labor market,
Sep. 2015-Jan. 2016.**

Master thesis

Prague, Autumn 2021

Author: BA Shpresonë Grulaj

Supervisor: Mgr. Ondřej Klípa, Ph.D.

Academic Year: 2020/21

Declaration

1. I hereby declare that I have compiled this thesis using the listed literature and resources only.
2. I hereby declare that my thesis has not been used to gain any other academic title.
3. I fully agree to my work being used for study and scientific purposes.

In Prague on
27.07.2021

Shpresonë Grulaj

Length of thesis: 92,903 characters

The work of Government and non-Government organizations in refugee integration in the German labor market, Sep. 2015-Jan. 2016.

Abstract

The new refugee surges in Germany have emphasized the importance of refugee integration in the host country. Current research highlights the role of government and nongovernment organisations in helping refugees overcome integration related challenges. This thesis highlights the challenges that are typically faced by refugees and assesses the importance of government and nongovernment institutions and organisations in helping refugees overcome those challenges. Applying a qualitative method and a comparative approach, the thesis employs data available from a set of reports and websites from respective organisations that work on refugee related issues, or that evaluate the work in different countries. The findings suggest that there is a set of challenges that are faced by refugees, with highlight in: host country language abilities, previous qualification recognition, skills recognition, emotional challenges, cultural differences in the workplaces. Moreover, the findings analyze the main industries where refugees are typically employed. Finally, comparing the areas of focus by both types of organisations, it is identified the presence of a noticeable division, not necessarily intentional, in responsibilities amongst government and nongovernment organisations, and that these responsibilities are in line with the needs of refugees considering the challenges they face. The areas of focus for government organisations involve language and integration courses, legal changes that allow for early skill screening and budget aimed for new programmes and policies implementation. Whereas the main areas of focus for nongovernment organisations are mental health and emotional counselling, legal advising in relation to employment and possible cooperation with government institutions in implementing language or integration courses.

Keywords: refugee, 2015, 2016, government organisations, nongovernment organisations, challenges, labor market integration.

Acknowledgment

Firstly, I would like to thank my supervisor, Mgr. Ondřej Klípa, Ph.D. for his continuous help and guidance throughout the steps of developing this thesis.

Additionally, I am thankful to doc. PhDr. Jiří Vykoukal, CSc. for his help during the Master Thesis Seminar, I & II.

I express my thanks also to doc. PhDr. Tomas Nigrin, Ph.D. who has helped me in the initial phases of preparing the project proposal for the master thesis.

I would like to undoubtedly thank the Faculty of Social Sciences, and the Institute of International Studies for granting me scholarship and financial relief during my studies, this has significantly helped my academic journey at Charles University.

I would like to thank my family, for their heartfelt support and continuous motivation from afar. Last but not least, I would like to thank my friends, colleagues and my close friend N. who has always been ready to help in any way necessary and answer my questions despite them being repetitive.

PROJECT OF M.A. THESIS
Name: Shpresoně Grulaj
Program: Balkan, Eurasian and Central European Studies.
E-mail: 11254300@fsv.cuni.cz
Term: Summer Term
Academic year: 2019/2020
Title: Conflict migrants' integration in the workplace in Germany: (Sep. 2015-Jan. 2016)
Submission date (term, academic year): Summer Term, 2020/2021
Seminar supervisor: doc. PhDr. Jiří Vykoukal, CSc. / doc. PhDr. Tomáš Nigrin, Ph.D.
Thesis supervisor: Mgr. Ondřej Klípa, Ph.D.
<p>Description of the topic: (10 lines): Our study explores the integration of conflict migrants in the German workplace. Conflict migrants have been chosen due to their specific need and search for safer places to settle in. In order to best understand how these migrants' integration process is going, representatives from NGO-s and also those from respective governmental institutions will be interviewed. Timeline during which the topic will be focused is from September 2015 to January 2016, due to this marking the initial phase of refugee and migrant acceptance during the latest waves in Europe. On focus will be asylum seekers and those that have already been granted the status.</p>
<p>Research question (10 lines): How well have migrants integrated in the workplace? What professional fields have been shown to have higher integration rates of migrants? What difficulties do migrants mainly face during the integration process? What work do institutions put in order to ease the obstacles faced by migrants ?</p>
<p>Aim of dissertation (10 lines): The aim of this dissertation is to understand how much do migrants coming from conflict areas integrate in the workplace in Germany. Additionally, we aim to explore patterns of integration. Another aim is to understand what professional fields have a higher scale of integration and its connection to the integration if there is any. Lastly, we aim to understand possible obstacles that the migrants, or employees face, and the work that is done towards helping both sides in a smoother process while facing and managing these obstacles.</p>
<p>Proposed methodology (10 lines): Qualitative and quantitative methods will be employed in order to answer our questions. Data is needed to be obtained from interviewing and also supportive arguments from previous literature. The main research method that will be used is Questionnaire survey. Questionnaires will be handed to</p>

representatives of the respective Ngo-s and Governmental institutions as a means of collection of primary data. Additionally, secondary literature will be employed.

Whereas, a comparative approach would be useful in comparing which areas migrants are more likely to integrate in and also in comparing the data obtained from Ngo-s and governmental institutions.

Proposed structure (10 lines):

The structure will follow the steps as described below: Abstract, followed by an Introduction (briefly explaining the research questions, the motivation and aims of the research, the methodology employed, the structure of the Thesis).. Literature Review and Critical reflection on the relation of the project with previous work. Methodology: Qualitative and Quantitative method will be employed, while applying the comparative approach to analyze the results. The Results chapter, where findings are explained and described. Suggestions. Limitations on the research. Conclusions. Appendix: data model. And lastly, Bibliography

Primary sources and secondary literature (selection):

Primary sources include NGOs and governmental institutions whose work has in focus the integration of migrants. preliminary examples include: "Federal Office for Migration and Refugees", "Caritas-Germany", "Pro Asyl", "International Organization for Migration(Germany) ".

However, these are subject to change depending on the willingness of organizations for cooperation and references in the future that will guide towards a source or another.

Secondary literature:

Codagnone, Cristiano, and Stefano Kluzer. "ICT For The Social And Economic Integration Of Migrants Into Europe". 2011, doi: 10.2791/53261.

Heckmann, Friedrich. *Education And The Integration Of Migrants: Challenges For European Education Systems Arising From Immigration And Strategies For The Successful Integration Of Migrant Children In European Schools And Societies*. European Forum For Migration Studies, Institute At The University Of Bamberg, Bamberg, 2008. Accessed 18 July 2020.

Jacobs, Dirk, and Jean Tillie. "Introduction: Social Capital And Political Integration Of Migrants". *Journal Of Ethnic And Migration Studies*, vol 30, no. 3, 2004, pp. 419-427. *Informa UK Limited*, doi: 10.1080/13691830410001682016.

McLaren, Lauren "Immigration And The New Politics Of Inclusion And Exclusion In The European Union: The Effect Of Elites And The EU On Individual-Level Opinions Regarding European And Non-European Immigrants". *European Journal Of Political Research*, vol 39, no. 1, 2001, pp. 81-108. *Wiley*, doi:10.1111/1475-6765.00571.

Münz, Rainer. "Migration, labor markets, and integration of migrants: An overview for Europe," HWWI Policy Papers 3-6, Hamburg Institute of International Economics (HWWI), 2007.

Penninx, Rinus. "'Integration Of Migrants. Economic, Social, Cultural And Political Dimensions.'" . 2005, <https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/Integration-of-migrants.-Economic%2C-social%2C-cultural-Penninx/ea3ad24a3262e64df044af6b191616ba1e85a9bb>.

Schneeweis, Nicole. "Educational Institutions And The Integration Of Migrants". *Journal Of Population Economics*, vol 24, no. 4, 2009, pp. 1281-1308. *Springer Science And Business Media LLC*, doi: 10.1007/s00148-009-0271-6.

Waldrauch, Harald, and Christoph Hofinger. "An Index To Measure The Legal Obstacles To The Integration Of Migrants". *Journal Of Ethnic And Migration Studies*, vol 23, no. 2, 1997, pp. 271-285. Informa UK Limited, doi:10.1080/1369183x.1997.9976590.

Wollegem, Pierre Georges Van. "A case of Soft-Europeanisation? The EU Policy for the Integration of Third Country Nationals." 2017

Signature: 

Date: 27/7/2020

Approved	Date	Signature
Thesis supervisor		
Seminar supervisor		
Program supervisor		

Table of Contents

Introduction.....	1
Literature Review.....	4
Aims.....	18
Methodology.....	19
Theory.....	23
Research Design.....	24
Data Analysis and Findings- Challenges and Government and Non-Government Actors.....	25
1. Government organisations and areas of focus in challenges management.....	26
2. Non-government organisations and challenges tackled by them.....	36
3. Government and non-government actors in refugee integration- Discussion.....	40
Employment rates amongst industries	42
Conclusion.....	43
Bibliography.....	46

Introduction

Refugee surges in Europe are not a recent development. Throughout the last decades, people escaping from conflict or unstable states have brought a new flow of migrants in Europe. As they escape unfavorable conditions, they search for new welcoming countries, and countries in which those refugees' future seems promising. Amongst many European countries, Germany has been the target for refugees and asylum seekers, with the 2015 bringing more than a million refugees in the Western European country. On 21st of August 2015, the German borders opened for asylum seekers following the suspending of the European Union's regulation that refugees are to remain in the country of entry, thus allowing refugees in Europe to enter Germany. This marked an influx of refugees above a million, thus resulting in high asylum-seeking applications. (Pearlman 2017)

With Germany introducing its "Willkommen" culture, opening its borders for the incoming refugees, the need for urgent measures and steps has arisen. Although the initial stages include fairly measures and actions that include offering a shelter, food and necessities, for long-term thinking the country had to employ measures that go beyond the survival necessities. This long-term thinking focuses broadly on the integration outcomes of refugees in the host country society and life. One of the main fields where refugee integration is essential in order for refugees to build their new lives, and the country to have order and continuous development, is the labor market integration. Although Germany welcomes migrants and workers, not only refugees, the two cases of integrating refugee vs migrant foreign workers in the labor market differ considering that refugees are not much prepared for the host country and its life, whereas other migrants prepare beforehand for arrival and settling in the host country. According to a 2018 study by Kondle-Seidl

published by Europa.eu, historically refugees have faced more challenges when joining the labor market in comparison to other migrants. As such, the concept of refugee integration must take into account the challenges that refugees are expected to face and how those challenges can be managed. Moreover, it is necessary to understand and conceptualize how does the welcoming country prepare itself and its institutions for welcoming refugees and helping them integrate in their country. Considering that Germany has welcomed more than a million refugees since the 2015 refugee crisis took place, there is an increase in the need for focusing research on what has been done so far and how it has been done in order to manage and facilitate refugee integration in the German country. Such research is important firstly because it creates a better understanding on the situation and contributes to existing research as a way of having a detailed idea on how refugees can be helped with labor market integration. Secondly, it is important because it opens the possibilities for future recommendations and policy makers to have academic evidence on what is targeted as an area of concern, or what has been shown to successfully work for the refugee integration so far. Indeed, such research does not only limit itself to the German country, nor Europe but it goes far beyond in a global level, however considering the high number of refugees in Germany, research highlighting this area is particularly important as it covers a broader number of refugees, which is why this thesis focuses on a single study case, that of Germany. In order to have a deeper and clearer understanding of the integration situation, I have decided to focus this thesis on the challenges that refugees face and how do government and nongovernment actors help in overcoming those challenges and what their areas of focus are on ensuring for a better integration process of refugees in the German labor market. Considering that the main refugee inflow happened in between September 2015 to January 2016, I have specified this timeframe as the time within which the thesis focuses. The choice of government and nongovernment actors

along with each other comes due to an emphasize on the need for those two kinds of institutions to cooperate and help in refugee integration, as well as to understand how they complement each other or if their work is in line with the challenges experienced by the new coming refugees. The emphasizes on understanding the work that is done by different institutions has focus of research up to date. Jacobsen (2019), for example, highlights that while analysing the integration of refugees in the labor market, in order to best understand it, institutions in charde of determining the access to labor market need to be researched and analysed. In addition, Okyay (2017) highlights the importance of communication amongst different institutions, which is government and nongovernment organisations. The conclusions drawn from this thesis will contribute to current research gaps by bringing a comparison between government and nongovernment actors, and by identifying the work of each sector towards those challenges. For writing this thesis I follow a generally standard structure, by firstly covering the literature review in order to bring an introduction to the current state of research and what have the academic findings been so far. Moreover, by exploring the current academic position and research in the refugee labor market integration topic explains the importance of this topic whilst introducing key concepts and issues in refugee integration. Following the literature review, the aims, methodology and theory of choice and research design will be further elaborated giving a detailed explanation on the approaches that are employed in this thesis and why they are the best fit for this topic and research field. Continuing, the data analysis will be introduced where the main division in subchapters is designed upon the government vs nongovernment actors, while listing for each the challenges, such as language, qualification recognition, skills screening, that they have been focused on facilitating and developments that are attributed to respective actors. In addition, follows a discussion subchapter on the importance of government and nongovernment organisations and their

cooperation in refugee integration. Following the discussion of importance of government and nongovernment organisations, briefly the importance of research on employment rates amongst different industries will be covered. Thus, the final part of the chapter focuses on discussing the findings that have been drawn and the thesis is closed by a conclusive chapter. Having in mind the structure and the key concepts introduced here, the thesis main aims are briefly mentioned as the direction of research clearly is headed towards the refugee integration related challenges and the measures that have been taken by government and nongovernment actors.

Literature Review

With the new refugee surge in Europe, academic research has directed its focus towards analyzing refugee related issues. Research conducted by academics, thinktank reports, journalists and organizations has covered refugee integration related issues in Germany, Europe, South America, and more. In order to best fit the frame of the topic covered in this thesis, focus will be highlighted to research that covers Germany and further Europe itself, but more external examples are not to be left out. The research in the topic is recent and regardless of overall global patterns for integration of migrants, it has been limited to developed countries as these receive the highest number of migrants. For our research, this poses an advantage because there is more data available for high income countries, including Germany. Gürer (2019), argues that despite the high influx of refugees that Germany has receives, the government institutions, together with nongovernment institutions, have managed better than expected to receive this huge number of refugees. However, further research agrees on the importance of integration of those refugees in the host country's economy and society. Research emphasizes that it is important to understand the role of organizations, whether governmental or non-governmental, in refugee integration. Bimrose &

McNair (2011) as cited in Li (2020), emphasize that organisations in the host country have become significantly important for the refugee's integration considering the increase in refugee inflows. However, before exploring deeper the topic, it is crucial to highlight that why is refugee integration so important. Initially, Desiderio (2016) argues on the importance of refugees being integrate, stating that that for refugees who escaped from violence and conflict, it is crucial for their wellbeing to have economic activity upon arriving in the host country. And besides for refugee integration posing a positive outcome for refugees as they can have more stability in their life, this integration is also important for the host countries. Desiderio (2016), argues that host countries as they receive refugees and asylum seekers, need to direct their work and attention further beyond registration, care and accommodation. This work focuses on integrating refugees in the social and economic life of the host country. Moreover, Desiderio (2016) highlights that integrating refugees is important as it ensures that there is a sustainable distribution of welfare and last but not least, that the refugees and other protection seekers, make up for the aging population in the labor market. Nevertheless, parallely, research argues that considering that the refugee presence in Germany, although high in terms of receiving refugees, within the German overall population does not make a difference in terms of substituting the aging workforce. Brücker et al. (2020) in their study, analysing whether the refugee arrivals have been a crisis or a help for German economy argue that since refugees comprise only 1.5 percent of the total German population, thus they cannot significantly influence the economic deficiencies that come with the aging population of Germany. The aging population is further addressed by research as an increase in possibilities for refugees to join the labor market. According to Ateia et al. (2018), due to aging population there is a demand for workers and employers who are qualified. Having in mind the qualifications, it it hence continued to be said that the aging population and high vacancies in Germany do not necessarily

pose a facilitation for refugees considering that, as Knuth (2019) states, the German labor market is a high skilled which as later explored is not commonly the case with refugees and their qualifications. Amongst research that focuses on refugee integration, Glorius et al. (2020) focus on the refugee integration's importance and how the new refugee inflows have increased the need for refugee integration. Although their research is oriented in refugee integration in the society and their contact with residents, it is worthy on emphasizing the importance of having refugee integration in the host country. Further research, as cited by Hynie (2018) extends on research covering the position of political bodies (Bose, 2018; DeBono, 2018; Lukunka,2018; Schulz and Taylor, 2018), organizations (Atkinson, 2018; Lamping et al., 2018) and social institutions (Carvalho &Pinto, 2018, Hayes and Endale, 2018; Lenette, 2018), and how these separately influence the integration of refugees. This impact is noted because of policies implemented by organizations, political bodies and social institutions. It is considered that what influences the integration of refugees, besides their skills and work, is also the social environment in which they are situated. The social environment includes the public opinion and position towards refugees, and as such it is shaped by policies set by political, governmental and social bodies. Besides, current research has shown that migrants tend to participate in the labor market less than those born in the country. (OECD,2015) Additionally, patterns of integration depend on the background of migrants. (OECD, 2015) Articles and reports that focus on the Slovenian case of refugee integration have shown that regardless of the difficulties that refugees face, projects are implemented as a way of providing smoother integration process. A pilot project has included introduction of a dictionary (in Slovenian and in native language of the participant), which covers common words regarding the workplace. Moreover, trainings regarding job fields such as:

construction, marketing and metallurgy, as well as jobs in NGOs, restaurants and retail have been introduced for refugees. (Marin & Voncina, 2019)

Regardless of the focus of specific scholars and publications, research helps me to identify the main challenges that refugees face and what is expected from the respective government and non-government actors to ensure for a successful and smooth integration process for refugees. In an article published in 2020, Khan Gokkaya et al. focus on the healthcare professionals integration in Germany. While this thesis does not highlight only a specific set of professions, similar research is important as it contributes to identifying patterns of similar challenges and what proves to be helpful in dealing with those challenges. According to Khan Gokkaya et al. (2020) the main challenges that have been identified while interviewing refugees in Germany from the healthcare sector can be divided in two groups. First are the challenges that are likely to be present in other professions and this includes the followings: Qualification's recognition, language skills, work culture, discrimination, emotional challenges and exploitation team member related challenges; whereas the two last challenges: patient related challenges and differences in healthcare systems are specific to healthcare workers only. Whilst it is important to understand the challenges and problems that refugees face based on their perspective, further study sheds light into how the German institutions prepared the labor market and refugees and what steps were taken in order to decrease challenges faced by refugees.

Another study conducted by Rietig (2016) has given focus to data and policy changes in Germany in favor to a facilitated refugee integration process. Rietig (2016) concludes that there are five categories where the German country has developed changes and policies oriented towards refugee integration process facilitation. These five categories include: legal, language for employment purposes, early skills screening, qualification recognition and digital mentoring.

Besides Rietig, Desiderio (2016) has highlighted similarly five main areas of policy related measures that host countries experience when receiving refugees. These five main areas of challenges include: early skills assessment and training, qualification recognition, alternative pathways into activity, engaging employers and bridging offers. While it is not necessarily that these challenges and areas of focus are limited to a certain number such as five, there is a similar pattern of highlighted areas and challenges which is present in most of the studies. As already presented, and as will be explored in the rest of the literature review chapter, these challenges and areas of focus are mainly related to language, skills, and previous qualifications.

Going back to Rietig (2016), the legal changes referred to by Rietig cover new legislation that enables asylum seekers to access the labor market in a shorter period of time upon their arrival, compared to prior laws. Language is one of the most important factors to look at considering that communication will be necessary and might even be crucial in several jobs. For this reason, the German country has focused highly in providing language courses for specific professional fields. Such courses are mainly driven towards enhancing the vocabulary of refugees and providing them with possibilities of practicing and using the language in real time. Nevertheless, a lack of language courses with specific language use has been reported. Language skills have proven to be important furthermore on a study conducted by Hirst et al. (2021). According to Mamgain & Collins (2003) as cited by Hirst et al. (2021), it has been concluded that refugee employment is attributed to language abilities in countries such as US, Netherlands, Sweden. Additionally, several studies have reinforced the language abilities as a challenge for refugees, and hence emphasize the need for government and nongovernment actors to pay attention and focus projects extensively in this regard. Besides the fact that refugee ace these challenges directly, surely these challenges are often related with the expectations or requirements that exist from the employer's side. Saal & Volkert

(2019) argue that language skills, soft skills, and qualification recognition are similarly challenges that employers face when wanting to employ refugees. Language abilities and qualifications are clearly important in deciding for an applicant to be suitable for a job position, as such these conditions employers to have a set of expectations, nevertheless at the same time as Saal & Volkert (2019) state, those employers are aware that it takes time especially for language skills to be developed. Such findings support strongly the importance of language skills and qualification recognition, or being able to prove the qualifications for refugees to successfully integrate. Supportively, Trines (2019) states that the main challenges that result in the lack of integration in labor market reinforce to be: language abilities, or lack of it thereof, skills and previous experience. Additionally, the same argues that indeed the process of labor market integration is a lengthy one and can be slow. This argument is presented after consulting reports that estimate the unemployment rate of refugees that arrived in Germany during 2016 and 2016. Whilst data presents only the situation of refugees of Syrian nationality, it shows that 72% of the refugee that have arrived at 2015/2016 time period remain unemployed in 2018. Moreover, according to the author, experts expect that about 50% of late refugees are expected to remain unemployed up to 5 years later upon their arrival in Germany. Moreover, Becker and Ferrara (2019) argue that refugees often did not prepare themselves for the life in the host country, as such their lack of language skills is commonly present.

Besides for providing language courses, Germany has introduced an improved process of recognition of prior qualifications. The recognition of prior qualifications although important is often difficult. The main difficulty is attributed to the circumstances under which the refugees left their countries. Although the overall recognition process is evaluated as complex and demanding in time and finances, Germany has designed an initiative in order to meet the needs of refugees

who cannot support by presence of documents their qualifications. This novel initiative enables refugees to prove their qualifications by the use of interviews and work samples. Nevertheless, this does not appear to always be the case. Martin et al. (2016) citing Correa-Velez et al. (2013) argue on lower employment rates for refugees in Australia upon their recognition of foreign skills and qualifications. The explanation behind such results argues on the refugees searching from jobs on their qualifications field which does not bring immediate employment, or on the presence of other obstacles regardless of qualifications recognition, such as insufficient language skills or not understanding host country labor market culture. In addition to qualifications recognition, skills screening provided early upon arrival has had a promising response after pilot project resulted with hundreds of refugees being linked to employment agencies. Those employment agencies later provided the refugees with support in the employment process and guiding them towards suitable positions accordingly to the refugees' skills. In addition, Risberg & Romani (2021) as cited by Hirst et al. (2021) have emphasized that refugees face the main challenge of having their previous qualifications recognized, and consequently work on roles that do not fit within their skill frame. Moreover, Martin et al. (2016) highlight the importance of early skill assessment on future successful integration. Arguments presented by Aldashev et al. (2010) as cited by Martin et al. (2016), show that in Germany the Aptitude Tests which include skills assessment and capability and labour-market opportunities for specific occupations, and Skill Provision which covers profession oriented working techniques have had a positive effect on employment. Schmidt & Müller (2021), argue that there is a decrease in demand for unskilled workers and currently there is a higher demand for professional skills. As such, it is emphasized the importance of skills screening as an important step to helping refugee orient themselves best accordingly with their skills and to fasten the job search process. Skills screening supportively is also argued by Pearlman

(2017), who states that it is likely for refugees to not be in a possession of some sort of qualification for a certain skill, not only upon arrival to Germany but even before they would have not possessed some document, mainly because those skills often include skills that existed within family or crafting that the refugee developed during their life. Many Syrian refugees, with whom the author had spoken to stated that they had been working at their home for years and decades, but without a formal training. Mainly, these jobs include, plumbers, hairdressers, car mechanics etc. Being at a disadvantage due to lack of a certificate or other official document proving their skills, often these refugees needed to start working in the “black market” or even abandoned their area of work. (Pearlman, 2017).

The fifth initiative that has been covered is the employment of technologies in facilitating the job search and labor market integration process for refugees. However according to Reitig (2016), the results and success of such initiative varies amongst cases considering that refugees use platform to connect with employers, or universities and other similar institutions provide help by enabling refugees to connect with students who would share advice or guide refugees throughout the employment process. Nevertheless, the gap of this study has been conducted immediately upon arrival of refugees, therefore the data provided focus on the success rate of initiatives provided by German institutions during 2016. According to the study “From Refugees to workers- Volume I” by Martin et al. (2016) the main focus areas for the Federal Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs and for the federal government have been: the language courses and the recognition of qualifications obtained elsewhere. The main intention is to provide access to refugees to such courses and recognition for their prior qualifications or facilitate these processes. Special highlight is drawn on the integration courses as the main ways how the labor market integration programmes are presented and employed. According to data available from the study these integration courses

consisted of language learning classes which equals to 600 hours of instruction, and politics and culture of Germany courses that make 60 hours of instruction. Additionally, high present are the ESF-BAMF-Kurse, which are German courses focused on profession related language instruction. Another study conducted by Okyay (2017) compares the refugee integration situation in two case studies, that of Turkey and of Germany. Drawing comparisons amongst how different countries deal with the refugee integration is important in order to identify challenges that go beyond a country as this reflects a challenge presented by refugees, hence serves as a preparatory measure for different cases. Okyay (2017), findings suggest that legal related issues are to be noticed and worked on as it is one of the most prioritized areas. Firstly, she suggests it is important to facilitate formalities and procedures when it comes to refugee employment in order to avoid delays.

Additionally, the author argues that it is important to motivate refugees for joining the workforce and employers for hiring them. Such motivation can be achieved by creating a feeling of security in terms of residence and its rights. Besides for the above-mentioned aspects, the author highlights the importance of language training and providing opportunities such as apprenticeships together with language teaching as these skills the participants in obtaining skill-oriented language abilities and professional experience. The blending between work and language is not a novel idea and has proven to be successful in several other countries. Reports by Lemaître, 2007; Carrera, 2006; Åslund and Johansson, 2011, Andersson Joonas and Nekby, 2012, as cited by Martin et al. highlight that integrating language teaching in apprenticeships is highly important. Additionally, Martin et al. (2016) draw examples of Finland and Norway as countries that employ the culture of language teaching and professional schooling integrated within single programs. However, it must be noted that existing literature does not feature studies on the successful effectiveness of professional language training in comparison to standard language courses. (Martin et al., 2016)

Moreover, Okyay (2017), argues on the importance of communication and synchronized actions amongst government and non-government actors and especially centralized and local institutions. This communication will bring a clear share of duties and resources amongst different institutions which will result in better access for refugees in the labor market. Supportively to the argument of communication between state and non-state institutions, Bergfeld (2017), highlights the engagement of IG Metall, which is a union for the metal workers in Germany, on informing and responding to refugee requests in terms of issues that might interest them, and the author names it as a “whole worker approach” considering that refugees receive advice and information accordingly with their requests. In addition, Galera et al. (2018) argue on the importance of non-government organisations, volunteers etc. on helping with providing language courses and professional training. Language continues to be extensively approached by studies and scholars. According to the second Volume of “From refugees to workers” by Martin et al. (2016) highlight is given to language qualifications as one of the most important challenges to be facilitated in order for refugees to have a successful integration and employment. Studies from other countries show a high difference amongst incoming refugees that speak the language of host country versus those who do not, by those who do having higher employment rates and successful integration experiences. Dustmann and Fabbri (2003P; Shields and Wheatley Price (2001; 2002) as cited by Martin et al. (2016) argue that fluency in English leads up to 30 percent higher employment rate. Whereas another study by Mivar Busto et al. (2012) as cited by Martin et al. (2016) have shown that high employment rates and permanent contracts in Spain were attributed to Spanish fluency. Schmidt& Müller (2021) agreeably argue that even the low skilled sectors have a requirement for German language skills, as such decreasing the possibility of employment in sectors for refugees who lack German language skills. Considering this importance that language skills have, host

countries gave attention and focused projects, thus finances, in creating suitable language programmes and courses (OECD, 2016). Besides for language, educational and professional qualifications are highly important in order to ensure that they focus on their skills and can further enhance them by proper training and education. This focus is drawn considering the report by OECD (2015) as cited in the study, which argues that the labor market poor situation of refugees is not present only because they lack qualifications, but rather the improper qualifications is only to be partly attributed for the overall poor performance. Additionally, explored challenges in Germany, UK and Ireland are identified as follows: Language (vocational and non), lack of previous work experience in the current country, insufficient access to employment related networks, lack of references in the current country, insufficient training, unrecognized qualifications, racism or stereotyping, uncertainty, misunderstanding of host country's labor market procedures and culture or general culture and etiquette. Moreover, the study suggests for employment to be more crucial than vocational schooling. This due to evidence presented by Lemaître (2007) as cited by Martin et al. (2016) regarding the Swedish case where when there is early employment, the integration is successful.

Further study conducted by Marin & Voncina concerns the Slovenian case and its refugee integration in the Slovenian labor market. Marin & Voncina (2019) referring to Endicott (2017) give significant insight in the theories of studying and understanding refugees and their relationship with labor market. These theories cover refugee related issues such as the structuration theory which presents how host country policies are related to the refugees and their job search process. In addition, the segmented assimilation theory by Portes and Zhou (1993) is referred as a theory employed in analyzing the refugees labor market access and state policy in regard to it. As per the findings, the study conducted by Marin & Voncina in 2019 analyzes the situation of

refugee integration in the Slovenian labor market. Findings show that refugees tend to have much higher unemployment than the citizens of Slovenia. Data from 2018 suggests that around two thirds of the refugee overall population in Slovenia has applied for unemployment benefits. The high unemployment rates are accordingly attributed to the challenges that refugees face in the host country. As several studies suggest, language is one of the main challenges faced by refugees. In accordance with the International Organization for Migration – IOM (2017) and the European Migration Network – EMN (2015) as cited in Marin&Voncina (2019) refugees agree on language limitations to be the main challenge faced when looking for employment. Unfortunately, such language limitations do not always improve upon host country (Slovenian) language courses attendance. In addition, as argued by other studies mentioned in this literature chapter, the lack of previous work experience, documentation of qualifications, cultural differences and discrimination follow on the list of challenges. However, studies from the same case study suggest also a presence of insufficient balance on the labor market and medical problems amid refugees. Besides for exploring the challenges faced by refugees, the authors provide information on main fields of employment amongst refugees which include the following professions: cleaners, manual workers in the food, wood, metal and construction industries. According to European Migration Network – EMN, 2015 as cited by Marin&Voncina (2019) there were registered instances of positions as informal interpreters for different nongovernmental organizations. Müller and Schmidt (2016) as cited by Bergeföld (2017) argue on the term of refugee corporatism which involves societal involvement of refugees, and hence labor market integration.

Marin&Voncina (2019) focus their study on the measures that have been employed so far in order to ensure for a successful refugee integration in the labor market. One of the measures that have been taken in Slovenia is the reestablishment of the GOSIM (Government Office for the Support

and Integration of Migrants) office in 2017. GOSIM takes care of the accommodation and support for migrants. Moreover GOSIM, 2018b as cited by Marin&Voncina (2019) is responsible for arranging synchronization amongst government, nongovernment and other bodies that focus in supporting migrants and their integration. Similarly, as suggested above in this chapter, the case study of Slovenia has also shown an employment of the method of training whilst learning also the language. In Slovenia, this was done by providing refugees a bilingual dictionary accordingly with their native language. Such dictionary focuses on words that are mainly encountered in certain jobs. As such, this method gives the opportunity for refugees to learn work related skills and the language as well. The main fields in which such refugees have been trained are: construction, restaurants, retail, marketing and metallurgy, as well as in NGOs. Klopčič (2017) as cited in Marin&Voncina (2019) argues that in Slovenia, the measures include refugees being offered an integration plan. Additionally, refugees are offered ESS counsellors who help refugees in finding jobs and in the same time work with the employers. The measures employed, and strategies introduce might not always follow up on the planned path. For example, according to the authors, “Acquisition of National Vocational Qualifications (NVQs)” has not had any participants so far upon it being introduced. As per the German case, Weber & Larsson-Olaison (2017) as cited in Hirst et al. (2021), argue that several companies in Germany have redirected their focus on refugee integration in the labor market by employing strategies that would bring benefits for both refugee and organizations themselves. Such companies include Daimler, Allians, Siemens and Telekom. This provides insight in cooperation between the government and private companies. Another program designed specifically for refugees is that employed by Deutsche Telekom (2019). However, it is emphasized that such strategies need to be synchronized and in partnership with governmental agencies, faith-based organizations or NPOs in order to avoid skepticism. In

addition, Szkudlarek (2019) as cited in Hirst et al. (2021) upon programme motivations and to result promising for the refugees and companies. Martin et al (2016) argue that a customized approach would be helpful in labor market integration. This approach would be based on several factors, such as age, education, family status and gender. It is crucial to emphasize that it is argued that refugee integration studies are still lacking exact data. Mainly due to the fact that once refugees receive asylum status, they are considered only on a frame of foreigners or nationals, thus leaving little to not space for data to be differentiated amongst foreigners based on their status. However, there are promising measures and introduced concepts which so far have been judged to match well with the needs of refugees. Additionally, Marin& Voncina (2019) argue on the importance of customized approach. By referring to the International Organization for Migration – IOM (2017) which has highlighted that amongst main challenges for refugees, is that they are not well familiarized with the process of being informed regarding labor market, the authors highlight the importance of information being provided clearly upon the need of refugees. Therefore, it is important that in future project, attention to be given for assisting refugees with employment of “tailor-made programmes”. Webb et al. (2016) while referring to a report by the Nordic Office (Djuve, 2016), argue on the importance of providing language learning for refugees, while also providing skill training or qualification recognition as ways of stimulating competitive labor market. Lack of focusing in those areas is followed by the risk of the flow of refugees providing low-skilled workers. And as such this is particularly important for countries with a decreasing work force due to age, it is beneficial for host countries to have skilled labors in industries. Arguably, Bergfeld (2017) states that Germany has a rather welcome culture towards refugees due to Germany’s labor shortage, demographic trends and their commitment to anti-racism. Therefore,

it is important for the German institutions to direct their focus towards successful refugee integration strategies.

Considering current literature, and the emphasis given on the challenges that refugees face in the host countries, this thesis aims to explore more about the refugee integration of refugee arrivals in the specified time (Sep.2015-Jan.2016) in Germany based on findings obtained by access to reports and publications from the respective institutions and to compare how have government and non-government institutions worked in this integration.

Aims

The thesis has in focus the main question of what has been done by government and nongovernment actors so far in order to help refugees integrate in the German labor market. In order for this question to be answered, it is important to highlight two main sub questions:

1. What challenges do refugees face in relation to their labor market integration in Germany?
2. What do government and nongovernment organizations do in order to help refugees overcome those challenges? The two questions are deeply connected to each other, considering that the actions taken by government and nongovernment actors in order to help refugees integrate in the workplace, have to be in line with the challenges that they face, otherwise it raises the question why those measures are taken and how much are they effective. Considering this, the thesis' main research problem to analyze and answer, which is what have government and non-government actors done for refugee integration in the German labor market, but this research problem has an almost equally important integrated question, that is, what challenges do refugees face in integrating in the German labor market. Accordingly, the thesis is built on the hypothesis that the

work of government and nongovernment actors has a strong correlation with the challenges that refugees face and both are directed in facilitating different sets of challenges.

Methodology

This chapter will cover the chosen method for the thesis, why this method fits best our topic and the questions it aims to answer. The employed method in this thesis is a qualitative methodology with a lightly integrated quantitative approach. Additionally, a comparative approach will be employed for the purpose of comparing the government vs nongovernment actors and their areas of focus on the work they do. The chosen methods will be used because of the nature of research and as the most suitable way of answering our research questions.

In order to understand what work government and non-government organizations have put in order to ensure a successful integration process for refugees in the German labor market we collect data from organizations and institutions that focus on refugees and their integration. Data will be obtained by the use of reports published by the “Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development”. In addition, this thesis will employ data as online accessed on the portals and websites of the following government and non-government organisations: “Federal Office for Migration and Refugees”, “Caritas-Germany”, “Pro Asyl”, “Refugee Council- Germany” The data that will be accessed is available in form of annual reports, general reports and sets of publication or general description on the work on organisations. As data will be collected on online sources of the above-mentioned organizations, we will narrow our search by employing use of keywords in the search process. The main keywords that will be employed when targeting the publications by government and nongovernment organizations in Germany, and globally, will be the following

ones: refugee, integration, labor market, 2015, 2016, refugee crisis, refugee language. However, keywords employed during the search process might differ based on results as we aim towards an optimized search on the websites of given organizations. All of the above-mentioned organizations have operations with focus on Germany only, regardless of whether they are internationally centralized or not.

As the main source of publications, data will highly also be collected from OECD (Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development), databases, as a source on numbers of refugees, years of arrival, and relevant statistics which concerns a broader focus without being limited to integration and Germany only. Data from OECD will be especially helpful in the Discussions chapter as a way of comparing statistics with other countries and drawing a comparison of policies.

Sources have been chosen on basis of their focus of research and work, and on basis of reliability. We consider the sources to be reliable as all the above-mentioned organization operate with focus on refugee and data regarding overall situation of refugees is presented, including here the refugee integration and what each of these organizations has done so far in this respect.

The integrated quantitative approach on the other hand, is referred to as such because data issued by the above-mentioned organizations, provides us with quantitative data, statistics and numbers.

Because the integration evaluation is done on a set of indicators set by Europa.eu which will be used as the most common indicators for evaluating refugee integration, our research and data analysis does not solely depend on statistics, but rather is highly aided by plain evaluation in concepts such as: successful integration/ not successful integration.

Besides the use of primary sources, arguments and findings will be supported, justified or critically assessed by employment of secondary sources. Of special importance are similar research

assessing refugee integration in other time periods and in different regions than Germany, extending outside of Europe. Research that compares Germany to other countries, and various countries between each other will be employed as well as an appropriate manner of ensuring better understanding to where does the issue of refugee integration and work implemented by government or non-government organizations stand.

In addition, the thesis is designed following a comparative approach, which corresponds with the case of having two main actors (government and nongovernment organisations) that work on the same issue (refugee integration in the German workplace). The main comparative framework employed in this thesis is directed towards pointing out to gaps and problems within the division of roles between government and nongovernment actors on refugee integration. On the choice of comparative framework, I have been inspired by Marc Bloch's use of comparative method in formulating problems for historical research as analyzed by Sewell (1967). It is feasible to employ the comparative approach for exploring the work of the government and nongovernment actors and how these two stands in comparison with each other and in comparison, to the actual needs of refugees based on the challenges that they face. Having in mind this relation between each other, it is important in designing the hypothesis as suggested by current state of art that there is a strong relation between the challenges that refugees face in integrating in the labor market, hence conceptualizing their needs, and the work that government and nongovernment actors do to facilitate these challenges.

The given methodology aims at answering the main question as to what work have government and non-government organizations put in order for refugee integration in the German labor to be successful. This question will firstly be addressed by deepening the analysis on the challenges that refugees face in the host country. Besides the use of the integration meter of the concepts provided

by Europa.eu, a literature review is equally important in developing a set of challenges that have been previously addressed by scholars and proven to exist within different countries regardless of the organizational level. Such challenges stem from the refugee concept and from their existence in a new country, in which they need to be integrated. In order for this thesis's research question to be answered, data regarding the following issues will be covered:

-language courses

-integration courses,

-professional qualification of the refugees,

-recognition of previous qualifications (academic preparation),

-mental health/ general counselling, which is especially important considering that refugees come from different backgrounds and secondly their paths to Europe, respectively Germany, have been dangerous.

Besides the above-mentioned key points, issues such as gender discrimination, racial discrimination, age-based discrimination, health related issues and the cultural differences, and their impact in refugee integration will be briefly covered. The brief coverage of last-mentioned issues does not entail that they are of less importance, but they are not limited to refugee status and experience only, therefore they can be assessed as additional factors/ obstacles in refugee integration but are not considered of crucial importance in order to answer our research question. Nevertheless, as we use assessment on basis of Europa.eu indicators of integration, our factors of interest are focused on all of the above-mentioned aspects, as Europa.eu integration indicators include: the share of employees who are overqualified for their jobs, self-employment, language skills, experiences of discrimination, trust in public institutions.

Additionally, by answering the question what work government and non-government organizations have put in order for refugee integration in the German labor to be successful, we will be able to draw a summary on the obstacles that refugees face in the integration process. However, due to the choice of sources for data collection, the identified obstacles will be presented based on the perspective of government and nongovernment organizations, unless stated otherwise in published reports and other accessible data. We aim to be able to identify how have these non-government and government organizations been able to facilitate the integration process by identifying the policies employed and the action that has been taken so far.

Theory

Grounded Theory will be employed as a theory that allows emergence of theories whilst collecting data, rather than have it defined beforehand. “Grounded theory has been defined as a theory that was derived from data, systematically gathered and analyzed through the research process.” (Bryman, 2012). Grounded theory is not a theory itself; it is rather an approach to emerging a theory out of data at hand. However, an implication is that theories are not always generated when employing the grounded theory approach, but rather concepts only. (Bryman, 2012)

Firstly, considering that I will use a qualitative approach, which when used according to Bryman (2012) concepts and theoretical elaboration emerge out of data collection, I abandon having a theory prior to the writing process of the thesis. Hence, we cannot define a specific theory in the research.

Secondly, migration, and refugee studies in this case are not richly treated in a theoretical framework in recent years, hence there is a lack of theories, although there is an existing number

of theories relevant to the study. Skeldon (2012) as cited by De Haas (2021) argues that few authors, namely: Carling 2002; Faist 2000; Hatton and Williamson 1998; Skeldon 1997, have been focused on the systematic theorization of migration processes over the past years. However, due to its nature, my research has a limitation in this aspect, because we do not aim refugees coming only from one country and their reasons of migration do not fit within one same reason. As the Refugee Convention (Article 1A) defines it, a refugee is someone who is out of their country due to fear of being persecuted for reasons of race, religion, nationality, membership of a particular social group or political opinion. As it is not feasible to distinguish each and every set of existing data about refugee integration on the basis of why they leave their country of origin, I cannot employ existing theories or else my research is heavily limited in terms of data collection. Therefore, having in mind all these points, it can be concluded that this thesis does not need and cannot employ a research theory, paradoxically it is listed as a grounded theory thesis, but rather will generate it throughout the research process itself.

Research Design

My study will follow a case study design, because the thesis has focus on the case of Germany only. Although case study design is limited as it is not intended to generalize, I do not abandon that the same policy recommendations and findings could be applicable in different settings dealing with the same issue. In order to identify challenges that are possible to correspond to other cases and have a better understanding about government and nongovernment actors in refugee integration, not only in Germany, but the case study method will also be employed. As argued by Yin (1984), case studies focus on few segments so that a deeper understanding is developed about a phenomenon. Moreover, in regard to the choice of sources, the purposive sampling method will

be employed. Although this method is commonly intended for people, hence interviews, Bryman (2012) argues that purposive sampling can be applied also to things, in our case documents and reports or similar publications. “Principles of purposive sampling can be applied to things like documents, in much the same way that probability sampling can be applied to different kinds of phenomena to generate a representative sample.” (Bryman, 2012)

Data Analysis and Findings- Government and Non-Government Actors

The following chapter analyses and employs a report conducted by Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development as a means of exploring the focus of institutions in Germany on establishment or reestablishment of measures, strategies and developments that highlight refugee integration and how these respond to challenges faced commonly by refugees. Additionally, it employs data by the Federal Ministry for Migrants and Refugees (BAMF), Federal Employment Agency (BA), websites of non-government organizations, such as Caritas, Proasyl and Refugee Council.

The chapter will have its content designed under a set of criteria. Firstly, the challenges and measures taken to overcome those challenges will serve as a criterion of structuring the chapter. Besides the challenges and measures taken, the chapter is designed based on the governmental or nongovernmental actor that it describes. The first part is focused in providing information about government actors whereas the second part on information related to nongovernment actor's services and work towards facilitating the labor market integration for refugees. In the final part the cooperation between government and nongovernment actors is analyzed based on the OECD report.

1. Government organisations and challenges tackled by them

As this thesis aims to answer the question of what do government and nongovernment organisations do to help refugees better integrate in the German labor market, it is essential to analyse the measures that those organisations have taken and how do those measures correspond with challenges faced by refugees. The following subchapter extensively explores the work that has been done by government organisations and compare the implemented measures and programmes with the challenges that refugees face. Firstly, the information presented by the 2017 OECD by Degler& Liebig report focuses on two main measures that have been employed in Germany, the first one includes legal framework whereas the second one focuses on financial measures and budgeting designed for integration enhancement. The 2017 report conducted by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development has analyzed the refugee integration in the labor market in Germany. One of the main shapers in refugee integration is the place where they are located. Considering that smaller, rural areas might have a limitation in multi-language vacancies. However, the land where refugees initially arrive and are granted refugee status for is very important. This because of the regulation that in order to be provided with the social assistance refugees must remain in the same land where they arrived. The report highly focuses on the law enforcement that asylum seekers are to stay in the same land where they arrived, limiting them on changing city/ region accordingly to their own preference. Such legislation comes in force with the intention of avoiding unequal share of wealth and job possibilities. The report gives answer to one of the main questions that comes in mind when analyzing such a law, which is the family situation of refugees and whether they or their relatives have to be limited in the place where they stay. Such case has been project to an exception, according to which refugees are entitled to an

exception from the law in force, should them or their family member find employment elsewhere in Germany, or if they are to start higher education or some other form of schooling (such as vocational school), in a different city or region from their original one within Germany. As such, opportunity of internal migration is a promising measure as this increases the chance for refugees to build suitable opportunities for themselves, while following the right education or joining their family members. Supportively, Bevelander (2020) highlights the importance of internal migration, arguing that migration within the host country especially for refugees has proven to be important in refugees getting employment. In addition to facilitated exception in cases of educational or employment reasons of refugees or their family members, OECD report highlights labor market related measures that are designed to facilitate the integration process altogether with employment. A comparison of legislative measures that were active prior to the high refugee arrivals in 2015, with legislative measures introduced after 2015, show a willingness and orientation of German governmental institutions, followed by non-governmental actors, towards facilitating refugee integration. Such comparison focusses on waiting times and labor market testing. While prior to 2015, during 2014 the German government decided on the legal time of asylum seekers to enter the job market to decrease from nine months to three months, during 2016 an extension to facilitating these processes has been introduced. This facilitating is reflected by the decision of German institutions to temporarily suspend the labour market testing procedure for those who were seeking asylum. However, in such measures, a priority division is important in order to avoid decrease on order and quality of procedures and decisions. As such, the respective institutions decided that these relaxation in rules do not apply to asylum seekers originating from countries considered safe, which brought a new list of countries considered safe and risky.

“The list now includes all Member States of the European Union, as well as Albania, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Ghana, Kosovo, the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, Montenegro, Senegal and Serbia (as of December 2016). Discussions whether to include Algeria, Morocco and Tunisia are on-going. Asylum seekers from safe origin are not allowed to work and are required to live in reception centers during the asylum procedure.” OECD (2017, pg 28) With the legal measures taking action, the focus has also been directed on decreasing other challenges commonly faced by refugees. The German government has acted quickly upon refugee arrivals with employment of new legislative measures oriented towards Integration. Amongst the most significant measures is what comes under the name of “Integration Act” which was enforced in August of 2016. It is crucial that the integration act highlights the importance of helping refugees navigate in terms of language but also provides relief in regard to their employment. This integration act focuses on refugees being able to continue with the job search and joining labor market regardless of their status.

“While their asylum claim is being processed, refugees are to be able to take up meaningful employment. The Federal Government will be launching a “Refugee Integration Measures” programme for 100,000 asylum seekers.” - The Federal Government, “Integration Act to support and challenge,” July 8, 2016,

The integration act focuses on accessibility to the Integration Course as a way of both giving refugees the opportunity of learning the language and cultural and other civic information. While such integration course has been available prior to August 2016, it was only so for asylum seekers that had high potential of continuing their stay in the country, whereas with the new measure of August 2016, it is mandatory for all asylum seekers and refugees to join this integration course. Considering the supportive arguments on the importance of language and cultural orientation as

presented in the literature review chapter, such measure adopted by the German government, can be assessed as a positive response towards ensuring a smooth integration process for refugees.

Along with the employment of the Integration Act, a novel programme designed specifically for refugees has been introduced. Designed under the German name: “Flüchtlingsintegrationsmaßnahmen” or “Integration Measures for Refugees”, this programme highlights the importance of establishing employment opportunities for refugees. As such, its aim was to create up to 100 000 new work openings for refugees, however these opportunities are mainly for bringing a perspective for refugees into what work life in Germany is like, rather than establishing formal employment. According to BAMF, the length of integration courses usually consists of a total of 700 lesson units. However, such standard length is subject to being lengthier, in cases of the orientation part requiring for more units, which could take the whole course up to 1000 lessons, or in the cases of participants who have a promising starting point, their length of courses could decrease to 430 lessons in total.

As already extensively discussed in the literature review chapter, one of the main, if not the main, challenge proven to be faced by refugees upon arriving host countries is the language barrier. This challenge has proven to be common in several countries where studies were carried such as, Sweden, UK, Slovenia, Germany, Australia etc. Whilst refugees might already be qualified to perform in a specific industry in terms of skills, the lack of local language proves a challenge not only for employment purposes but integration in the society itself. Intentional migrants are not as likely on experiencing the same challenge since they already prepare themselves before reaching destination country, and there is a clear plan on employment requirements. However, with refugees the case is not the same considering that they are leaving in a much different situation from their countries of origin. Keeping in mind that such challenge is problematic for future and especially

long-term integration, host countries tend to focus on coming up with strategies that ensure language training access and opportunities for refugees. The OECD-DIHK-BMAS survey conducted with employers highlights the significance of language skills. The results of given survey have shown that for 80% of employers it is necessary for applicants to have very good language skills for highly skilled positions. On the other hand, for medium skilled jobs, 40 % of the participants have considered very good language to be necessary and 52 % considered good language skills as necessary for qualifying applicants for the positions. Nevertheless, the situation does not change much even for low skilled jobs, where almost half of the participants on the survey, had a requirement of at least good language skills to qualify applicants for the position. In addition to supporting the argument on the importance of language skills, findings from a 2014 OECD survey show that lack of language skills is amongst the most presented reasons (with 61%) for rejecting asylum seekers or refugee job applications. Besides unsuccessful employment, studies show that even in cases when refugees had been employed, employers share the experience of lack of language skills, or its insufficiency has been the challenge faced the most in the workplace. The German government has significantly focused on ensuring that the integration courses have their impact in refugee integration, not only by designing the course and bringing it into a legal framework, but also by following carefully and adding in work to notice and improve its implementation. Considering the high number of asylum seekers, the registration for integration course and further steps, can turn to be lengthy in time. For such reason, after noting the first stages of the integration course implementation, waiting times and approvals for the requests to join language courses, the efforts to increase accessibility and availability of the course has been made. Those efforts have been showing promising results, with the increase of integration courses in 2016 reaching almost double (20 500) the number of available integration courses in 2015 which

was 11 800. Increasing the language courses availability has not been easy. It takes a huge number of staff, an increase in budgeting and this requires adjustments of regulations too. For such reasons the BAMF during after September 2015 lowered requirements for teachers training and qualifications and increased the payments per hour, in order to motivate staff in teaching the German language. However, such regulations have been temporarily applied in order to ensure a successful implementation of the integration course, and do not reflect changes on the overall education system. As such, the year 2016 found 19 000 active teachers working as part of the integration courses with 11 000 being newly accredited. Equally important to general language learning is the vocational language learning in terms of employment and labor market integration. As thus, following the September refugee arrivals in 2015, the government decided to integrate vocational language learning as part of a new programme named “Berufsbezogene Deutschsprachförderung” or Vocational Language Training. This language training started its activity in July 2016.

Except for the in-person language courses established as part of the integration course, online courses funded by the Ministry of Education and Research have been presented for refugees. While in terms of content these online courses are in line with that of the Integration courses, they also are motivated to enhance vocational language learning as part of the language learning. Benton & Glennie (2016) argue that giving refugees the possibility of accessing online courses is important considering that there is often high demand for language courses, or in general making it easier for refugees to attend online courses. Nevertheless, online courses are suitable for developing and improving language skills but the downfall on them is the lack of certificate issuance upon completing the course, therefore it does not necessarily ensure to provide a successful mean of

integration considering that refugees will not be able to document their language skills by a recognized certificate.

Additionally, the VET (Vocational Education Training) is an advantage that Germany has in terms of what it can offer for the refugees to ensure a smooth integration process. The OECD evaluates the German VET system as a strong one and argues on the system's graduates resulting in high employability. As such, the VET system would help enhance the labor market positions of migrants by enabling them access to developing and improving their skills. In addition, this system results in satisfaction and productive outcomes for both refugees and the labor market itself. "Education and training to access skilled employment can serve to both unlock the potential of migrants and address significant skills shortages within the German labour market. Indeed, by helping migrants to develop social relations while developing skills of demonstrable demand within the labour market, VET offers an attractive means of facilitating the integration of migrants within German society and economy." – OECD (2019) Moreover, the OECD report highlights the importance of providing access to integration course for asylum seekers. Due to measures adopted in late 2015 by the German government, access to the course has been granted to people from countries that have high possibility of remaining in the country. The countries considered of high recognition rates have been redefined after the high refugee influx, thus moving Western Balkan countries, Senegal and Ghana and EU member states as safe countries, thus allowing for prioritizing nationals coming from countries such as: Iran, Syria, Somalia, Iraq and Eritrea. This change is highly important within the certainty frame since it allows refugees upon arrival to start taking action and creating an expectation of how their life will be in terms of where they will reside and the language, culture and other changes that they need to invest their time and attention. At the same time, such legislative change is highly important for the receiving country, Germany in

this case as the time passed while waiting for an approval of asylum application, is spent informing and developing skills of refugees that are likely to remain in the country and thus join the labor market.

Besides the integration courses, legal changes that stimulate motivation of refugees have been established. As such, according to the OECD report, permanent residence issuance has been conditioned upon successful integration (which includes having at least an A2 level on German language and being able to secure financial means for themselves) of refugees and only after five years of residing in the country. While, previously such measure did not condition refugees on integration, now it aims to build a more stable expectation and feelings of certainty. As has been covered in the literature review chapter, certainty, or lack of it thereof, is an important factor that stimulates refugees to focus more, considering that if they feel that they have a more secured position they focus on creating an integrated environment for themselves as this is the country where they will be long term.

Along with legal measures, OECD highlights financial measures which include extensive funding in order to ensure a successful implementation of integration measures and a successful refugee integration. Federal institutions have divided funding accordingly with focus on courses as designed by the Integration Act. and labor market policies. The funding directed towards integration courses has doubled (and beyond), in the year 2016 comparing to 2015. According to available data by the OECD reports, it is estimated that while in 2015 the amount of fund allocation budgeted for integration course was EUR 244 million, this amount increased to EUR 559 million in 2016, and further on to 610 million in 2017. Budget specifically designed for language courses accessibility has introduced a difference of EUR 231 million in increase between the years 2016 and 2017. While in 2016 179 million Euros have been budgeted for vocational language training,

this amount increased to 410 million in 2017. Such increases in the budget show promising focus of state actors in optimizing refugee integration, considering that implementation of new measures and the refugee integration process has judged to be not only lengthy but costly as well. Besides for the language barrier, it is considered crucial that refugees receive information on how the processes go and what they can expect or should do upon their arrival in Germany. The focus of BAMF highlights providing information correctly for refugees and asylum applicants. Except for advisory in specific cases and the integration course as a way of introducing asylum seekers to the culture and language, an introductory brochure is available in English, German and Russian, containing main information needed for newcomers. While the brochure cannot respond to the needs and questions of each refugee, it does contain information about main points of contact and addresses that would be helpful in further solving requests.

Beyond the above-mentioned programs, two new programs that have been introduced are important to reflect on the work of the German governmental bodies. Both of these programmes have been introduced by the Federal Employment Agency (BA in German), during 2016. The first programme has in focus women refugees. Designer under the name “Perspectives for Female Refugees” this programme provides vocational language training, childcare support, counselling and visit at different companies. Similarly, to this programme, is the programme “Strong in the Job”. This programme is funded by the Ministry of Family Affairs, Senior Citizens, Women and Youth and is open for all migrant women as well as other natives with migrant background, however its downfall is that it does not offer language training for the participants, hence does not necessarily create the best option for refugee women. In addition to “Perspectives for Female Refugees” the BA has designed another programme (KompAS), also during 2016, which in focus has labor market integration related issues. This programme provides skills assessment, job related

counselling, help in finding the jobs or internships in accordance with their qualifications, and surely language training. Such programmes that have in focus several aspects are important as a way of providing refugees with information and training in different spheres. The gender specific importance given to establishment of new programmes is important considering that research has shown women to be prone of more disadvantages upon creating their new life, especially in terms of learning the host country language. Bernhard & Bernahrd (2021), argue that women tend to be more disatvantaged when learning a secondary language, mainly due to them being on average with lower proficiency levels of English and German language upon their migration, having less formal education and often being married which results in a challenge when learning a second language. The focus on female refugees-oriented programmes is also important because according to Aldén and Hammarstedt (2014) and Ott (2013) as cited in Aiyar et al. (2021), the labor market integration is particularly more difficult for female migrants and refugees.

Moreover, skills screening is an equally important step for making sure to have a successful and fast integration process. Considering such importance, the German state has ensured to employ measures that help in identifying skills of new arrivals of refugees. Whilst the survey data presented by OECD consists of a timeframe from 2013 to 2016, which although starts at an earlier period, corresponds with the timeframe that this thesis focuses on. The IAB-BAMF-SOEP-Refugee Survey shows results concerning the qualifications of refugees, their cognitive skills (by employing a cognitive math test), their educational achievement and German language skills. According to Brücker, Rother and Schupp, (2017) as cited in OECD (2019), the employed cognitive math test is an appropriate meter of assessing and evaluating approximate skills of refugees. The results from this survey show that the math test results of refugees who have a 4 and above level of ISCED (The international standard classification of education) had higher results

on the math test in comparison to refugees with levels than 4 levels of ISCED. Despite screening skills of refugees, recognizing prior qualifications that they have obtained abroad is equally important. According to Bonfanti and Xenogani (2014) as cited in the OECD report, improper value on foreign qualifications affects refugee employment negatively as this is consequently followed by refugees being employed in jobs, they are overqualified for. Hence, OECD considers the recognition of foreign qualifications as a crucial issue for integrating refugees successfully.

2. Nongovernment organizations and challenges tackled by them

Along with for governmental actors, nongovernment actors and similar organizations play a huge role on helping refugees integrate and responding to their needs or helping them overcome the challenges they face in the host country. The specific analysis on nongovernment organisations includes three major organisations in Germany, Pro Asyl, Caritas and Refugee Council. It is crucial to analyse which areas of challenges faced by refugees are covered by these organisations in order to later draw a comparison with government organisations and identify gaps or successful approaches amongst the two.

An important organization in Germany that needs to be mentioned is certainly Pro Asyl. Due to the scope of their work and transparency with publications, Pro Asyl is one of the most active actors in refugee related concerns in the host country. While their focus of work is mainly on fighting for human rights, defending refugee rights and ensuring that they are protected and treated equally during the whole process, from applying for asylum to making sure that they are given just treatment and opportunities, there is unclear data regarding their specific focus in the labour market integration. However, considering their focus in legal matters and fight in human rights violation,

they are open to providing access to legal and humanitarian help to refugees depending on the cases of their needs. Their designed assistance model enables the organization to help individual cases of refugees when in need of legal and social questions and clarifications, therefore providing access to refugees who struggle with labor market integration concerns to turn to Pro Asyl for assistance. (Pro Asyl, 2021)

Another important non-government humanitarian organization in Germany is Caritas. Caritas offers a set of supportive strategies for refugees in the country. Typically, it is focused on providing information and orienting refugees in regards to the questions and requests they could have. But their work is not limited only on those aspects. A highly important aspect in which Caritas offers support for refugees is by its therapeutic center, which in focus has providing therapy and other forms of support for refugees and asylum seekers who have undergone trauma. Their significance in providing mental health assistance was notably increased in 2015, as a response to the refugee inflow, resulting in new psychiatric and social centers offering their services. Counselling offered for refugees and focus on mental health of the refugees is highly important in order to facilitate the integration process. The 2019 report by OECD mentions other challenges that refugees face, besides for language skills, recognition qualification, etc. and traumatic experiences are often documented as one of the main challenges. Considering that refugees arrive through different pathways in the host countries, and they are leaving from countries that due to difficult conditions have been assessed as countries of high recognition rate of protection status, it is expected that the refugees will not share comfortable experiences prior or during their arrival. The findings of the 2019 report prove that the surveys concerning the first survey wave in Germany give results of refugees going through difficult and dangerous transportation modes, to fraud and assault. The results are respectively as follows: “one-quarter of

respondents had survived shipwrecks; two-fifths had been victims of physical assault; one-fifth had been robbed; more than half had fallen victim to fraud; more than one quarter had been blackmailed; and 15% of female refugees reported having been sexually assaulted.” (OECD, 2019)

It is significantly important that while receiving opportunities to access language training and skills training or facilitation in qualifications recognition, refugees also receive opportunities for individual counselling in terms of emotional and mental needs and health because their emotional situation likely reflects in the workplace as such influencing the refugee integration in similar ways as other challenges that refugees face. As has been covered in the government organization chapter, this challenge faced by refugees has not been prioritized amongst other challenges that are directly focused to professional skills. Therefore, the focus of Caritas in this direction is particularly significant for the refugee integration in the labor market, as well as society. Equally important for Caritas is the access to education for minor refugees, and integration information for adults. Caritas is also behind the Youth Migration services which in focus have advisory services for young foreigners up to the age of 27, who have migrated in Germany. Moreover, Caritas is funder of the centers which provide migration advice for foreigners who migrated in Germany, including refugees and as such it offers its advisory services in 230 different locations within the country.

Alongside with the Federal Office for Refugees and Migration (BAMF), Ministry of Education, Federal Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs as state actors, and Caritas, Pro asyl, and job centers as state and nonstate actors, another important actor is the Refugee Council. The Refugee council is a nonstate actor as well, considering that they have no authorization in changing legislation but rather consist of activists, volunteers and NGOs whose work is focused in helping refugees in different ways. Moreover, the Refugee council is not subject to funding provided strictly by state actors, but rather receives it mainly through donations, and through projects established either by

state or non-state actors. The refugee council has a huge role on refugee's life in Germany since they provide assistance on a different set of fields. Alongside with this set of helps one of the crucial aims of Refugee council is to ensure that refugees have the right information in regards to the processes they have to go through. According to Hauswedell (2018), the Refugee Council does not provide courses such as the BAMF does, e.g., language courses, integration courses since they are not in charge of such services, but it is significant the help that they offer in informing refugees about where they can be directed to find all the information in relation to courses and more.

Such help provided to refugees is highly important considering that countries have different bureaucratic and legal processes to follow, and for a refugee this might pose a challenge in itself. The challenging part of having the right information and knowing what steps need to be taken has been covered by research. Pearlman (2017) argues that many of the asylum seekers (Syrians) have argued that they struggle with the bureaucracy. Moreover, accordingly the author states that the refugee's experience with bureaucracy has become amongst other essential challenges that they face such as work, housing and their legal status.

The main role that the Refugee council has besides for informing refugees on the opportunities, their rights and so, is that they serve as a voice in helping make decision. Such is achieved through employment of petitions, or awareness rising campaigns which result in the society being more informed about refugee related issues as well as in impacting the decision making of legislative actors, or as they are referred, they serve as a "political lobbying organization". Hauswedell (2018)

3. Government and non-government actors in integration- Discussion

As this thesis focuses on the work of government and non-government organizations in refugee integration in the German workplace, it is important to analyze why these roles are divided and the areas of focus for both kinds of organizations. In applying the comparative approach and analyzing the work of both types of organisations by each other, a distinction is drawn on areas that those organisations focus on, and how much it is important for reciprocal cooperation in between the two. OECD (2017) argues on the importance of both government and non-government actors in helping migrants and refugees with integrating on the society. Although the main responsibility is distributed amongst government, in order to make sure that institutions and projects are implemented accordingly with the needs and challenges that the refugees face, the role of “third sector” is almost equally important. The main concern with nongovernmental factors is usually the funding, considering that a lot of these organizations depend on donations and external means of being funded, whereas the programmes developed by the government are subject within other national distribution of budget and as such allowing for priority areas to be financed and accounted for. According to OECD, in Germany (and few other OECD countries such as France, Greece, Italy) the nongovernmental organizations, volunteers, etc. are usually more focused on providing services that serve refugees upon arrival such as receiving the refugees, accommodating them etc. While the non-government actors are not directly focused on integration services, their importance is significant in cases when programmes implemented by the governmental institutions do not successfully cover everything about refugee integration, by helping in those implementations or by pointing out what is missing in the refugee integration and raising the voice for increasing successful processes. (OECD, 2016) Such is the case of Refugee Council for example, who drive their orientation in making sure that the rights of refugees are met and

respected. As per the case of Germany, and in terms of the data that this thesis has employed, it can be summarized that both the government and nongovernment organizations have immediately and extensively focused their work and projects on ensuring that refugees integrate as successfully as possible. The aim to understand in which aspects do government and non-government organizations focus their work has received a summarized conclusion that the government organizations are more focused on providing projects and programs motivated to ensure a language and vocational training of refugees. These serve as the most suitable areas to invest in in order to ensure that they integrate on the labor market and are able to build their future lives in the new country. Additionally, a highly important work of the German government is attributed to adapting effective legislative changes that facilitate procedures for refugees, which is important considering the high influx of arrivals within the same period of time. On comparison, non-government organizations are more focused on providing services and taking measures that ensure correct information for refugees, providing guidance and counselling for them as a means of directing the refugee to suitable institutions and programmes that fit their individual needs and cases. Moreover, a highly important role that nongovernment organizations have shown to play in Germany, is offering mental counselling for refugees. Whilst such measure in first look is not directly related to labor market integration considering that it does not help with language or professional skills, it is in fact important and responsive for any area that refugees want to integrate in, to be firstly in a good emotional situation. Nevertheless, as highlighted by OECD (2016) it is important that both government and nongovernment organizations and actors cooperate with each other, and looped feedback can result in improvements of measures. At the same time, while complementing each other, government by providing direction and sometimes funding for nongovernmental projects, and nongovernmental by pointing what is lacking or volunteering in cases of absences from the

government, both actors can help in creating a smoother integration process and have a more synchronized order of actions nationwide. Nevertheless, while analyzing the data and information available and by use of comparative approach, the main question that sparks interest is whether funding is a problem in enabling actors to act upon taking measures for facilitating refugee integration. Indeed, the findings suggest a strong correlation between government and nongovernment actors and the challenges that the refugees face in relation to labor market integration. Both actors guide themselves towards helping in different challenges that refugees face, and their work is based on challenges that have a history of being faced by refugees when integrating in the labor market in the host country. However, budgeting has shown to take an important part of implementation of new measures, especially in government actors, while nongovernment actors often depend on donations. Considering such question, there is an increased need for further research employed on budgeting finances towards nongovernment organizations in correspondence with the challenges faced by refugees and work orientation of the NGOs. As argued, the nongovernment organizations might participate in government funded projects, but this is not the norm. While it does not necessarily reflect on the work that those actors put in helping refugees integrate, it is important to understand if with higher budget allowances the areas of focus for adapting new programs and actions that facilitates refugee integration, will change, especially in the case of non-government actors.

Employment rates amongst different industries

When analysing the refugee integration and the work of government and nongovernment organisations, it is significant to explore what fields do refugees typically get employed on. This exploration is worthy because it provides an insight on the importance of prior qualifications recognition and importance on avoiding overqualification or having refugees employed in low

skilled jobs. However, identifying the fields in which refugees are mainly employed is not easily achievable. The lack of data makes it difficult to identify professional fields with high refugee concentration, although according to arguments presented in the literature review chapter, both low skilled job sectors and high skilled professions have a share of refugee employees upon right qualification and skills recognition. Considering that there is no exact data on industries and sectors in which refugees in Germany are employed, a study covering the migrant situation in Berlin estimates that the main fields where workers with migrant background are employed includes the following respectively: “32.6% : Wholesale and retail trade; repair of motor vehicles and motorcycles, Transportation and storage, Accommodation and food service activities; 23.1%: Information and communication, Financial and insurance activities, Real estate activities, Professional, scientific and technical activities, Administrative and support service activities.” (OECD, 2018) However, such data can only provide an estimate and not an exact conclusion on the sectors in which refugees are employed, moreover considering that as mentioned above, there is a lack of exact data on fields of refugee employment since once they join the labor market, the category of refugee blends into foreign workers. The findings of this analyses highlight the important issue of having data for refugees only because only then a more detailed understanding on refugee integration and correct qualification evaluation is possible.

Conclusion

The refugee inflows in Europe and Germany in particular, have increased several points of importance for discussion in relation their new life in the host country or countries. Germany is

one of the most significant case studies when studying refugee related issues due to the high number of refugees in the country in the last decade. Amongst the most important areas for discussion in relation to refugee's new life in the host country, their future employment is highly significant in refugees giving a direction to their life and having economic stability and a standard of life. For these particular reasons, research has been highly focused in understanding how refugees best integrate in the new societies and labor market in particular. I have directed this thesis towards labor market of refugees and the help that they receive in having an easier integration process. This help usually is offered by two main actors, either government or nongovernment organisations, or both parallelly. Such help comes in the form of changes in the policies, which at the same time enables for doors to be opened for refugees and to be welcomed in the new country, to measures taken that have in focus particular cases concerning refugees. This thesis's findings show that the main challenges faced by refugees have proven to be: lack of German language, recognition of previous qualifications, skills screening, mental health and emotional challenges and background differences in work culture. The findings suggest that the German government has been highly oriented in providing refugees with opportunities of facilitating the integration process in the German labor market. Starting from the changes that have been made in the law and similar measures, which in general do not only focus on employment related issues but overall situation of refugees upon their arrival, to the adapted measures and developed programs that have in focus providing language courses and training for refugees, the government has been highly active in helping refugees integrate in the workplace. The main government organisations that have been actively engaged in refugee integration related programmes and measures are: Federal Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs, Federal Office for Migration and Refugees and Federal Ministry of Education and Research. Equally important, have

proven to be the nongovernment organisations such as Pro Asyl, Caritas, Refugee Council, and smaller units such as IG Metall union etc. These organisations belong to the nongovernment sectors, and their role has proven to be helpful in facilitating refugee integration in the German labor market. This facilitation is particularly achieved by helping refugees with professional legal advice, orienting them better within institutions, offering mental support and at times cooperating with government developed programmes that have in focus refugee integration. While comparing the roles that both organisations have, it is found that with the correct cooperation between both groups of institutions each have their way of helping refugees integrate and there is a slight division in areas of focus that they engage in. However, it would be efficient to have data that has in focus refugee integration only, considering those available up to date, once refugees are employed, they get in the general group of “foreign workers” which makes it unfeasible to identify the numbers of refugee workers that have been integrated for academic researchers. Such data is important in order to have a deeper understanding of whether measures taken are sufficiently working, or gaps that they are lacking in. In order for academic research to be more effective, it is recommended that future academic research divides the available data and creates a set of data that corresponds refugees only. Such division makes it possible to assess whether refugees are integrating, in contrast of having them as part of the “foreign workers” category which makes it less likely to identify whether challenges are receiving efficient measures considering that foreign workers include migrants prepared beforehand for the labor market.

Bibliography

1. Aiyar, Shekhar, Bergljot B Barkbu, Nicoletta Batini, Helge Berger, Enrica Detragiache, Allan Dizioli, Christian H Ebeke, Huidan Huidan Lin, Linda Kaltani, Sebastian Sosa, Antonio Spilimbergo, Petia Topalova, and Poul M. Thomsen. "The Refugee Surge in Europe", *Staff Discussion Notes* 2016, 002 (2016), A001, accessed Jul 27, 2021, <https://doi.org/10.5089/9781513552590.006.A001>
2. Ateia, Jasmin, Philip Bona, and Stephan Schmieglitz. "Labour Market Access and Labour Opportunities for Refugees. Examples from Freiburg." In *Refugees and Migrants in Law and Policy*, pp. 367-377. Springer, Cham, 2018.
3. Becker, Sascha O., and Andreas Ferrara. "Consequences of forced migration: A survey of recent findings." *Labour Economics* 59 (2019): 1-16.
4. Benton, Meghan, and Alex Glennie. "Digital Humanitarianism: Howtech entrepreneurs are supporting refugee integration." (2016).
5. Bergfeld, Mark. "Germany's willkommenskultur: trade unions, refugees and labour market integration." *Global Labour Journal* 8, no. 1 (2017).
6. Bernhard, Sarah, and Stefan Bernhard. "Gender differences in second language proficiency—Evidence from recent humanitarian migrants in Germany." *Journal of Refugee Studies* (2021).
7. Bevelander, Pieter. "Integrating refugees into labor markets." *IZA World of Labor* (2020).
8. Brücker, Herbert, Yuliya Kosyakova, and Ehsan Vallizadeh. "Has there been a" refugee crisis "? New insights on the recent refugee arrivals in Germany and their integration prospects." *SozW Soziale Welt* 71, no. 1-2 (2020): 24-53.

9. Bryman, A. "edition 4." *Social research methods*. New York. Oxford University Press Inc (2012).
10. De Haas, Hein. "A theory of migration: the aspirations-capabilities framework." *Comparative Migration Studies* 9, no. 1 (2021): 1-35.
11. Degler, Eva, and Thomas Liebig. "Finding their way. Labour market integration of refugees in Germany." *OECD*. <http://www.oecd.org/migration>. Accessed 17 (2017): 11-28.
12. Desiderio, Maria Vincenza. "Integrating refugees into host country labor markets: Challenges and policy options." *Washington DC: Migration Policy Institute* (2016).
13. Galera, Giulia, Leila Giannetto, and Antonella Noya. "The role of non-state actors in the integration of refugees and asylum seekers." (2018).
14. Glorius, Birgit, Stefan Kordel, Tobias Weidinger, Miriam Bürer, Hanne Schneider, and David Spenger. "Is social contact with the resident population a prerequisite of well-being and place attachment? The case of refugees in rural regions of Germany." *Frontiers in Sociology* 5 (2020): 114.
15. Gurer, Cuneyt. "Refugee perspectives on integration in Germany." *American Journal of Qualitative Research* 3, no. 2 (2019): 52-70.
16. Hauswedell, C. (2018). What's the German Refugee Council and how can it help me?. Retrieved from <https://www.infomigrants.net/en/post/8459/what-s-the-german-refugee-council-and-how-can-it-help-me>
17. Hirst, Giles, Sally Curtis, Ingrid Nielsen, Russell Smyth, Alexander Newman, and Ning Xiao. "Refugee recruitment and workplace integration: An opportunity for human resource management scholarship and impact." *Human Resource Management Journal* (2021).

18. Hynie, Michaela. "Refugee integration: Research and policy." *Peace and Conflict: Journal of Peace Psychology* 24, no. 3 (2018): 265.
19. Jacobsen, Jannes. "An investment in the future: institutional aspects of credential recognition of refugees in Germany." *Journal of Refugee Studies* (2019).
20. Khan-Gökkaya, Sidra, and Mike Mösko. "Labour market integration of refugee health professionals in Germany: challenges and strategies." *International Migration* (2020).
21. Knuth, Matthias. "Integrating Refugees in the German Labor Market." *International Labor Brief* 17, no. 2 (2019): 53-66.
22. Konle Seidl, Regina "Integration of Refugees in Austria, Germany and Sweden: Comparative Analysis STUDY." (2018).
23. Li, Sharon. "A Psychological Needs Framework for Refugee Integration in the Workplace." PhD diss., Purdue University Graduate School, 2020.
24. Martin, Iván, Albert Arcarons, Jutta Aumüller, Pieter Bevelander, Henrik Emilsson, Sona Kalantaryan, Alastair Maciver et al. "From refugees to workers: Mapping labour market integration support measures for asylum-seekers and refugees in EU member states. Volume I: Comparative Analysis and Policy Findings." (2016)
25. Martin, Iván, Albert Arcarons, Jutta Aumüller, Pieter Bevelander, Henrik Emilsson, Sona Kalantaryan, Alastair Maciver et al. "From refugees to workers: Mapping labour market integration support measures for asylum-seekers and refugees in EU member states. Volume II: Literature review and country case studies." (2016).
26. OECD (2016), Making Integration Work: Refugees and others in need of protection, Making Integration Work, OECD Publishing, Paris,
<https://doi.org/10.1787/9789264251236-en>.

27. OECD Working Together for Local Integration of Migrants and Refugees in Berlin, OECD Publishing, Paris, <https://doi.org/10.1787/9789264305236-en>. (2018)
28. OECD Working Together for Local Integration of Migrants and Refugees, OECD Publishing, Paris,(2018) <https://doi.org/10.1787/9789264085350-en>.
29. OECD Ready to Help? Improving Resilience of Integration Systems for Refugees and other Vulnerable Migrants, OECD Publishing, Paris, (2019) <https://doi.org/10.1787/9789264311312-en>.
30. Okayay, Aslı Selin. "Labour market integration of Syrian refugees in Germany and Turkey: Challenges and prospects." *Global Turkey in Europe Working Paper* 18 (2017).
31. Pearlman, Wendy. "Culture or bureaucracy? Challenges in Syrian refugees' initial settlement in Germany." *Middle East Law and Governance* 9, no. 3 (2017): 313-327.
32. Proasyl, What we do. (2021). Retrieved 2021, from <https://www.proasyl.de/en/what-we-do/>
33. Rietig, Victoria. *Moving beyond crisis: Germany's new approaches to integrating refugees into the labor market*. Washington, DC: Migration Policy Institute, 2016.
34. Saal, Marlene, and Juergen Volkert. "Labor market integration of refugees in Germany: Employer's experiences and consequences 1. *Ekonomski vjesnik* 32, no. 2 (2019): 425-438.
35. Sewell, William H. "Marc Bloch and the logic of comparative history." *History and theory* 6, no. 2 (1967): 208- 218.
36. Schmidt, Werner, and Andrea Müller. "Workplace universalism and the integration of migrant workers and refugees in Germany." *Industrial Relations Journal* 52, no. 2 (2021): 145-160.

37. Shinyoung, Jeon. *OECD Reviews of Vocational Education and Training Unlocking the Potential of Migrants Cross-country Analysis*. OECD Publishing, 2019.
38. The Federal Government, "Integration Act to support and challenge," https://www.bundestkanzlerin.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/07_en/2016-05-25-integrationsgesetz-beschlossen_en.html. (2016)
39. Trines, Stefan. "The state of refugee integration in Germany in 2019." *World Education News+ Reviews* (2019).
40. Vončina, Brigita, and Nina Marin. "What issues do refugees face in integrating into labour markets? Evidence from Slovenia." (2019): 101-112.
41. Webb, Sue, Steven Hodge, John Holford, Marcella Milana, and Richard Waller. "Refugee migration, lifelong education and forms of integration." (2016): 213-215.
42. Caritas Germany, What does Caritas do for refugees in Germany? (2021). Retrieved 2021, from <https://www.caritas-germany.org/focus/currentissues/what-does-caritas-do-for-refugees-in-germany>
43. Yin, Robert K. *Case study research: Design and methods*. 1984