

Institut ekonomických studií

Fakulta sociálních věd, Universita Karlova Praha

Referee report on the Bachelor/Master Thesis submitted to State Exam

Student Name:	Jan Duben
Thesis Supervisor Name:	Vilém Semerák
Thesis Title:	Prophecy from crystal ball – Forecast of foreign labour immigration in Czech Republic with panel data

Overall Evaluation:

The thesis deals with a topical and important issue, with migration flows into the Czech Republic. The author presents an overview of main existing theories of migration, then continues with discussion of empirical evidence and concludes with estimating a migration model based on the gravity equation and using the model for predictions using three different scenarios.

The author opted for a model based on macroeconomic data instead of a (in theory) more relevant models based on micro-level data. However, this choice is very logical and caused by the problems with acquiring relevant individual data of migrants. As far as the methodology used for analysis and estimation of the model is concerned, the author apparently managed to do as much as was made possible by the quality of available data; the level of econometrics methodology is more than adequate for his level.

While the thesis could be described as more than adequate from the point of view of analysis and methodology, it would have been useful to provide a more detailed description and explanation of the results of the simulated scenarios and perhaps also to pay more attention to language (both typos and style) and the formal finish of the text (e.g. formatting of econometric results). The current state of the text makes a bit unpleasant impression that the author must have been in a real hurry in order to meet the deadline.

As far as the overall grade is concerned, the thesis deserves A, but further work on the text would be necessary for publication.

SUMMARY OF POINTS AWARDED (for the explanation of categories and scale, please, see below):

CATEGORY	POINTS
Quality of Research	28
Clarity and Readability	13
Content/Quality of Ideas	38
Organization & Development	8
Manuscript Form	3
TOTAL POINTS	90
LETTER GRADE	A-

Vilém Semerák

Evaluated on: August 15, 2008

Institut ekonomických studií

Fakulta sociálních věd, Universita Karlova Praha

Referee report on the Bachelor/Master Thesis submitted to State Exam

Student Name:	Jan Duben
Thesis Supervisor Name:	Vilém Semerák
Thesis Title:	Prophecy from crystal ball – Forecast of foreign labour immigration in Czech Republic with panel data

Explanation of categories and scale:

QUALITY OF RESEARCH: The thesis demonstrates the author's full understanding and command of current literature and he/she uses it competently. The topic of the thesis is well structured and methods used are proper and relevant to the research question being investigated. A full and accurate analysis of thesis statement, from both a theoretical and applied perspective, is provided.

Strong			Middle			Weak			
30	27	24	21	18	15	12	8	4	0

CONTENT/QUALITY OF IDEAS: A range and depth of exposition; an appropriate sense of complexity of the topic; appropriate analysis of the thesis statement; and an accurate understanding of theoretical concepts is demonstrated. A full discussion of applicable and relevant theories stylized data is included. Original, creative thought is provided and evident. Demonstrates critical thinking and analysis with application of theory and student's ability to draw conclusions based on their knowledge, skills and research.

Strong			Middle			Weak			
40	36	32	28	24	20	15	10	5	0

ORGANIZATION AND DEVELOPMENT: The paper demonstrates a logical and clear arrangement of ideas; an effective use of transitions; a unity and coherence of paragraphs; and a clear development of ideas through supporting detail and evidence. The reader is successfully oriented to the subject, purpose, methodology, and structure of the report; an overview of the whole is included; the reader's attention and interest is engaged. The thesis statement is clearly and definitively stated without ambiguity. The conclusion is strong and reflective of the work as a whole.

Strong			Middle			Weak		
15	13	12	10	8	6	4	2	0

CLARITY AND READIBILITY: Ease of readability; appropriate use of language and style for the rhetorical content; clarity of sentences (reader doesn't get lost; minimum need for slowing down or re-reading) is appropriately demonstrated. Professional level of English expression is evident (limited amount of non-native language to English translation is detectable).

Strong			Middle			Weak			
10	9	8	7	6	5	3	2	1	0

MANUSCRIPT FORM: The appropriate manuscript form and style for the rhetorical content; a professional image; an appropriate use of headings and sub-headings; an appropriate format for graphs and tables; an effective referencing of graphs and tables in the text; complete and accurate bibliography documented to support the applied research; and the overall impact of document design is considered.

Strong		Middle		Weak	
5	4	3	2	1	0