Joint Dissertation Review

Name of the student: Meline Margaryan
Title of the thesis: Football club supporters and the self-determination processes: the political behaviour of supporters of the major football clubs in Scotland and Catalonia
Reviewer: Martin Meijstrik

1. KNOWLEDGE AND CONNECTION TO THE FIELD
(relevance of the research question, research objective, literature review):

The research question and the whole framework is very original, and it fully complies with the requirements for the MA thesis. The literature review is also adequate. The author should more explain the case selection and the relationship between football in Scotland and Catalonia and how they influence local politics.

2. ANALYSIS
(methodology, argument, theoretical backing, appropriate work with sources):

The author based her methodology on the empirical research using qualitative questionnaires distributed through social media (Facebook). This is again very original approach but it didn’t allow the author to collect the right amount of data and thus limited her findings. The author should also describe more in detail how she worked with the methodology and how she operationalizes her variables. On the other hand, the author did good job in the analysis itself (with those limitations described above which were coming from the limited applicability of chosen methodology). The author also showed the capacity to maintain a clear structure with clearly identified research questions.

3. CONCLUSIONS
(persuasiveness, link between data and conclusions, achievement of research objectives):

The author presented her conclusions in a satisfactory way with several limitations. The results should be presented in more clear and coherent way and especially in a separate way from the general conclusion mentioned in the last part of the thesis. The author also did some assumptions which she couldn’t extrapolate from her research and thus overgeneralized her findings (which are again very original and also valuable). That problem is the most visible in the correlation between the political behaviour of club supporters and the attractivity of that club to gather them around. Nevertheless, the author achieved her research objectives in a satisfactory way.

4. FORMAL ASPECTS AND LANGUAGE
(appropriate language, adherence to academic standards, citation style, layout):

The author uses adequate language and her use of citations is also without major problems. The structure of the thesis is also all right, I would just suggest dividing the general conclusion from the results. In general, thesis adhere to a normal academic standard.

5. SUMMARY ASSESSMENT
(strong and weak point of the dissertation, other issues)

Meline Margaryan wrote an original MA thesis with limitations given to difficult reach for enough empirical data. She did it well and presented her finding in a satisfactory way, regardless the limited methodology. Overall, her thesis is above the average.

Grade (A-F): B
Date: 26. 6. 2019
Signature: